

【4-9 メタアナリシス】

CQ		HER2陰性転移・再発乳癌に対する化学療法は単剤か併用かどちらが推奨されるか？																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																		
P	HER2陰性転移・再発乳癌	I	併用療法（化学療法）																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																	
C	単剤療法（化学療法）	O	Overall survival																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																	
研究デザイン	RCT	文献数	33	Cochrane 2009 (35) Albain KS 2008 Sparano JA 2010 Nielsen DL 2011																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																
モデル	Random Effect	方法	Inverse Variance (RevMan5.3)																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																	
効果指標	ハザード比	統合値	0.89 (0.84 - 0.94) P= <0.0001																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																	
Forest plot	<table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Study or Subgroup</th> <th>log(Hazard Ratio)</th> <th>SE</th> <th>Experimental Total</th> <th>Control Total</th> <th>Weight</th> <th>Hazard Ratio IV, Random, 95% CI</th> <th>Year</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr><td>Ahmann DL (Z) 1974</td><td>0.174</td><td>0.4509</td><td>20</td><td>20</td><td>0.4%</td><td>1.19 [0.49, 2.98]</td><td>1974</td></tr> <tr><td>Ahmann DL (T) 1974</td><td>-0.4155</td><td>0.38</td><td>21</td><td>22</td><td>0.6%</td><td>0.66 [0.31, 1.39]</td><td>1974</td></tr> <tr><td>Ahmann DL (O) 1974</td><td>-0.7133</td><td>0.384</td><td>28</td><td>20</td><td>0.6%</td><td>0.49 [0.23, 1.04]</td><td>1974</td></tr> <tr><td>Rubens RD 1975</td><td>-0.1278</td><td>0.2183</td><td>50</td><td>49</td><td>1.7%</td><td>0.88 [0.57, 1.35]</td><td>1975</td></tr> <tr><td>Canellos OP 1976</td><td>-0.4005</td><td>0.1888</td><td>93</td><td>91</td><td>2.2%</td><td>0.67 [0.46, 0.97]</td><td>1976</td></tr> <tr><td>Carmo-Pereira 1980</td><td>-0.844</td><td>0.1949</td><td>68</td><td>67</td><td>2.1%</td><td>0.43 [0.29, 0.63]</td><td>1980</td></tr> <tr><td>Ingle J 1985</td><td>0.0198</td><td>0.1616</td><td>79</td><td>79</td><td>2.8%</td><td>1.02 [0.74, 1.40]</td><td>1985</td></tr> <tr><td>Anderson M 1986</td><td>-0.0513</td><td>0.2390</td><td>44</td><td>45</td><td>1.5%</td><td>0.85 [0.59, 1.52]</td><td>1986</td></tr> <tr><td>Gundersen S 1986</td><td>-0.1863</td><td>0.2406</td><td>66</td><td>62</td><td>1.4%</td><td>0.82 [0.52, 1.32]</td><td>1986</td></tr> <tr><td>Vaughn CD 1988</td><td>-0.1905</td><td>0.19</td><td>59</td><td>63</td><td>2.2%</td><td>0.82 [0.57, 1.19]</td><td>1988</td></tr> <tr><td>Ingle J 1989</td><td>-0.0824</td><td>0.1564</td><td>92</td><td>95</td><td>3.0%</td><td>0.92 [0.68, 1.25]</td><td>1989</td></tr> <tr><td>Nielsen D 1989</td><td>-0.0943</td><td>0.2412</td><td>65</td><td>76</td><td>1.4%</td><td>0.81 [0.57, 1.16]</td><td>1989</td></tr> <tr><td>Falkson G 1990</td><td>0</td><td>0.2136</td><td>54</td><td>57</td><td>1.8%</td><td>1.00 [0.66, 1.52]</td><td>1990</td></tr> <tr><td>French Epi (B) 1991</td><td>-0.1625</td><td>0.1844</td><td>137</td><td>70</td><td>2.3%</td><td>0.85 [0.59, 1.22]</td><td>1991</td></tr> <tr><td>French Epi (A) 1991</td><td>-0.0819</td><td>0.1495</td><td>135</td><td>70</td><td>3.2%</td><td>0.94 [0.70, 1.26]</td><td>1991</td></tr> <tr><td>Fraser S 1992</td><td>-0.3957</td><td>0.2988</td><td>19</td><td>21</td><td>0.6%</td><td>0.69 [0.31, 1.48]</td><td>1992</td></tr> <tr><td>Tachiro H 1994</td><td>0.157</td><td>0.2708</td><td>30</td><td>30</td><td>0.6%</td><td>1.17 [0.57, 2.42]</td><td>1994</td></tr> <tr><td>Joensuu H 1998</td><td>-0.0513</td><td>0.1276</td><td>150</td><td>153</td><td>4.0%</td><td>0.95 [0.74, 1.22]</td><td>1998</td></tr> <tr><td>Bishop J 1999</td><td>-0.3425</td><td>0.1644</td><td>102</td><td>107</td><td>2.7%</td><td>0.71 [0.51, 0.98]</td><td>1999</td></tr> <tr><td>Nabholz JM 1999</td><td>-0.2205</td><td>0.1195</td><td>199</td><td>202</td><td>4.4%</td><td>0.72 [0.57, 0.91]</td><td>1999</td></tr> <tr><td>Gjestrøm J 1999</td><td>-0.0101</td><td>0.135</td><td>139</td><td>143</td><td>3.7%</td><td>0.99 [0.76, 1.29]</td><td>1999</td></tr> <tr><td>Norris B 2000</td><td>-0.0408</td><td>0.1468</td><td>151</td><td>149</td><td>3.3%</td><td>0.88 [0.72, 1.08]</td><td>2000</td></tr> <tr><td>Nielsen D 2000</td><td>-0.2357</td><td>0.2004</td><td>74</td><td>81</td><td>2.0%</td><td>0.79 [0.53, 1.17]</td><td>2000</td></tr> <tr><td>Takayama T (B) 2000</td><td>-0.1165</td><td>0.2629</td><td>27</td><td>55</td><td>1.2%</td><td>0.89 [0.53, 1.49]</td><td>2000</td></tr> <tr><td>Takayama T (A) 2000</td><td>-0.1393</td><td>0.2676</td><td>27</td><td>57</td><td>1.2%</td><td>0.87 [0.51, 1.47]</td><td>2000</td></tr> <tr><td>O'Shaughnessy J 2001</td><td>-0.0202</td><td>0.3718</td><td>33</td><td>62</td><td>0.6%</td><td>0.98 [0.47, 2.03]</td><td>2001</td></tr> <tr><td>Heidemann E 2002</td><td>-0.1744</td><td>0.1558</td><td>127</td><td>133</td><td>3.0%</td><td>0.84 [0.62, 1.14]</td><td>2002</td></tr> <tr><td>Bonneterre J 2002</td><td>0</td><td>0.168</td><td>90</td><td>88</td><td>2.6%</td><td>1.00 [0.72, 1.39]</td><td>2002</td></tr> <tr><td>O'Shaughnessy J 2002</td><td>-0.2614</td><td>0.0963</td><td>255</td><td>256</td><td>5.7%</td><td>0.77 [0.64, 0.93]</td><td>2002</td></tr> <tr><td>Sledge G (B) 2003</td><td>-0.0101</td><td>0.1271</td><td>115</td><td>224</td><td>4.0%</td><td>0.99 [0.77, 1.27]</td><td>2003</td></tr> <tr><td>Sledge G (A) 2003</td><td>-0.0513</td><td>0.1234</td><td>115</td><td>229</td><td>4.2%</td><td>0.95 [0.75, 1.21]</td><td>2003</td></tr> <tr><td>Heidemann E 2004</td><td>-0.0202</td><td>0.2130</td><td>89</td><td>87</td><td>1.6%</td><td>0.98 [0.64, 1.49]</td><td>2004</td></tr> <tr><td>Ejlertsen B 2004</td><td>0.1398</td><td>0.1322</td><td>193</td><td>194</td><td>3.8%</td><td>1.15 [0.89, 1.49]</td><td>2004</td></tr> <tr><td>ici F 2005</td><td>-0.1508</td><td>0.1571</td><td>100</td><td>101</td><td>2.9%</td><td>0.86 [0.63, 1.17]</td><td>2005</td></tr> <tr><td>Stockler M 2006</td><td>0.3853</td><td>0.1571</td><td>109</td><td>214</td><td>2.9%</td><td>1.47 [1.09, 2.00]</td><td>2006</td></tr> <tr><td>Albain KS 2008</td><td>-0.1895</td><td>0.1087</td><td>266</td><td>263</td><td>4.4%</td><td>0.82 [0.67, 1.00]</td><td>2008</td></tr> <tr><td>Sparano JA 2010</td><td>-0.1054</td><td>0.0888</td><td>609</td><td>612</td><td>7.8%</td><td>0.90 [0.79, 1.03]</td><td>2010</td></tr> <tr><td>Nielsen DL 2011</td><td>-0.0819</td><td>0.116</td><td>170</td><td>167</td><td>4.5%</td><td>0.94 [0.75, 1.18]</td><td>2011</td></tr> <tr><td>Total (95% CI)</td><td></td><td></td><td>4190</td><td>4515</td><td>100.0%</td><td>0.89 [0.84, 0.94]</td><td></td></tr> </tbody> </table> <p>Heterogeneity: Tau² = 0.01; Chi² = 47.84, df = 37 (P = 0.11), I² = 23% Test for overall effect: Z = 3.92 (P < 0.0001)</p>				Study or Subgroup	log(Hazard Ratio)	SE	Experimental Total	Control Total	Weight	Hazard Ratio IV, Random, 95% CI	Year	Ahmann DL (Z) 1974	0.174	0.4509	20	20	0.4%	1.19 [0.49, 2.98]	1974	Ahmann DL (T) 1974	-0.4155	0.38	21	22	0.6%	0.66 [0.31, 1.39]	1974	Ahmann DL (O) 1974	-0.7133	0.384	28	20	0.6%	0.49 [0.23, 1.04]	1974	Rubens RD 1975	-0.1278	0.2183	50	49	1.7%	0.88 [0.57, 1.35]	1975	Canellos OP 1976	-0.4005	0.1888	93	91	2.2%	0.67 [0.46, 0.97]	1976	Carmo-Pereira 1980	-0.844	0.1949	68	67	2.1%	0.43 [0.29, 0.63]	1980	Ingle J 1985	0.0198	0.1616	79	79	2.8%	1.02 [0.74, 1.40]	1985	Anderson M 1986	-0.0513	0.2390	44	45	1.5%	0.85 [0.59, 1.52]	1986	Gundersen S 1986	-0.1863	0.2406	66	62	1.4%	0.82 [0.52, 1.32]	1986	Vaughn CD 1988	-0.1905	0.19	59	63	2.2%	0.82 [0.57, 1.19]	1988	Ingle J 1989	-0.0824	0.1564	92	95	3.0%	0.92 [0.68, 1.25]	1989	Nielsen D 1989	-0.0943	0.2412	65	76	1.4%	0.81 [0.57, 1.16]	1989	Falkson G 1990	0	0.2136	54	57	1.8%	1.00 [0.66, 1.52]	1990	French Epi (B) 1991	-0.1625	0.1844	137	70	2.3%	0.85 [0.59, 1.22]	1991	French Epi (A) 1991	-0.0819	0.1495	135	70	3.2%	0.94 [0.70, 1.26]	1991	Fraser S 1992	-0.3957	0.2988	19	21	0.6%	0.69 [0.31, 1.48]	1992	Tachiro H 1994	0.157	0.2708	30	30	0.6%	1.17 [0.57, 2.42]	1994	Joensuu H 1998	-0.0513	0.1276	150	153	4.0%	0.95 [0.74, 1.22]	1998	Bishop J 1999	-0.3425	0.1644	102	107	2.7%	0.71 [0.51, 0.98]	1999	Nabholz JM 1999	-0.2205	0.1195	199	202	4.4%	0.72 [0.57, 0.91]	1999	Gjestrøm J 1999	-0.0101	0.135	139	143	3.7%	0.99 [0.76, 1.29]	1999	Norris B 2000	-0.0408	0.1468	151	149	3.3%	0.88 [0.72, 1.08]	2000	Nielsen D 2000	-0.2357	0.2004	74	81	2.0%	0.79 [0.53, 1.17]	2000	Takayama T (B) 2000	-0.1165	0.2629	27	55	1.2%	0.89 [0.53, 1.49]	2000	Takayama T (A) 2000	-0.1393	0.2676	27	57	1.2%	0.87 [0.51, 1.47]	2000	O'Shaughnessy J 2001	-0.0202	0.3718	33	62	0.6%	0.98 [0.47, 2.03]	2001	Heidemann E 2002	-0.1744	0.1558	127	133	3.0%	0.84 [0.62, 1.14]	2002	Bonneterre J 2002	0	0.168	90	88	2.6%	1.00 [0.72, 1.39]	2002	O'Shaughnessy J 2002	-0.2614	0.0963	255	256	5.7%	0.77 [0.64, 0.93]	2002	Sledge G (B) 2003	-0.0101	0.1271	115	224	4.0%	0.99 [0.77, 1.27]	2003	Sledge G (A) 2003	-0.0513	0.1234	115	229	4.2%	0.95 [0.75, 1.21]	2003	Heidemann E 2004	-0.0202	0.2130	89	87	1.6%	0.98 [0.64, 1.49]	2004	Ejlertsen B 2004	0.1398	0.1322	193	194	3.8%	1.15 [0.89, 1.49]	2004	ici F 2005	-0.1508	0.1571	100	101	2.9%	0.86 [0.63, 1.17]	2005	Stockler M 2006	0.3853	0.1571	109	214	2.9%	1.47 [1.09, 2.00]	2006	Albain KS 2008	-0.1895	0.1087	266	263	4.4%	0.82 [0.67, 1.00]	2008	Sparano JA 2010	-0.1054	0.0888	609	612	7.8%	0.90 [0.79, 1.03]	2010	Nielsen DL 2011	-0.0819	0.116	170	167	4.5%	0.94 [0.75, 1.18]	2011	Total (95% CI)			4190	4515	100.0%	0.89 [0.84, 0.94]	
Study or Subgroup	log(Hazard Ratio)	SE	Experimental Total	Control Total	Weight	Hazard Ratio IV, Random, 95% CI	Year																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																													
Ahmann DL (Z) 1974	0.174	0.4509	20	20	0.4%	1.19 [0.49, 2.98]	1974																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																													
Ahmann DL (T) 1974	-0.4155	0.38	21	22	0.6%	0.66 [0.31, 1.39]	1974																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																													
Ahmann DL (O) 1974	-0.7133	0.384	28	20	0.6%	0.49 [0.23, 1.04]	1974																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																													
Rubens RD 1975	-0.1278	0.2183	50	49	1.7%	0.88 [0.57, 1.35]	1975																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																													
Canellos OP 1976	-0.4005	0.1888	93	91	2.2%	0.67 [0.46, 0.97]	1976																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																													
Carmo-Pereira 1980	-0.844	0.1949	68	67	2.1%	0.43 [0.29, 0.63]	1980																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																													
Ingle J 1985	0.0198	0.1616	79	79	2.8%	1.02 [0.74, 1.40]	1985																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																													
Anderson M 1986	-0.0513	0.2390	44	45	1.5%	0.85 [0.59, 1.52]	1986																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																													
Gundersen S 1986	-0.1863	0.2406	66	62	1.4%	0.82 [0.52, 1.32]	1986																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																													
Vaughn CD 1988	-0.1905	0.19	59	63	2.2%	0.82 [0.57, 1.19]	1988																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																													
Ingle J 1989	-0.0824	0.1564	92	95	3.0%	0.92 [0.68, 1.25]	1989																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																													
Nielsen D 1989	-0.0943	0.2412	65	76	1.4%	0.81 [0.57, 1.16]	1989																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																													
Falkson G 1990	0	0.2136	54	57	1.8%	1.00 [0.66, 1.52]	1990																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																													
French Epi (B) 1991	-0.1625	0.1844	137	70	2.3%	0.85 [0.59, 1.22]	1991																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																													
French Epi (A) 1991	-0.0819	0.1495	135	70	3.2%	0.94 [0.70, 1.26]	1991																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																													
Fraser S 1992	-0.3957	0.2988	19	21	0.6%	0.69 [0.31, 1.48]	1992																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																													
Tachiro H 1994	0.157	0.2708	30	30	0.6%	1.17 [0.57, 2.42]	1994																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																													
Joensuu H 1998	-0.0513	0.1276	150	153	4.0%	0.95 [0.74, 1.22]	1998																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																													
Bishop J 1999	-0.3425	0.1644	102	107	2.7%	0.71 [0.51, 0.98]	1999																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																													
Nabholz JM 1999	-0.2205	0.1195	199	202	4.4%	0.72 [0.57, 0.91]	1999																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																													
Gjestrøm J 1999	-0.0101	0.135	139	143	3.7%	0.99 [0.76, 1.29]	1999																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																													
Norris B 2000	-0.0408	0.1468	151	149	3.3%	0.88 [0.72, 1.08]	2000																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																													
Nielsen D 2000	-0.2357	0.2004	74	81	2.0%	0.79 [0.53, 1.17]	2000																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																													
Takayama T (B) 2000	-0.1165	0.2629	27	55	1.2%	0.89 [0.53, 1.49]	2000																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																													
Takayama T (A) 2000	-0.1393	0.2676	27	57	1.2%	0.87 [0.51, 1.47]	2000																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																													
O'Shaughnessy J 2001	-0.0202	0.3718	33	62	0.6%	0.98 [0.47, 2.03]	2001																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																													
Heidemann E 2002	-0.1744	0.1558	127	133	3.0%	0.84 [0.62, 1.14]	2002																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																													
Bonneterre J 2002	0	0.168	90	88	2.6%	1.00 [0.72, 1.39]	2002																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																													
O'Shaughnessy J 2002	-0.2614	0.0963	255	256	5.7%	0.77 [0.64, 0.93]	2002																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																													
Sledge G (B) 2003	-0.0101	0.1271	115	224	4.0%	0.99 [0.77, 1.27]	2003																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																													
Sledge G (A) 2003	-0.0513	0.1234	115	229	4.2%	0.95 [0.75, 1.21]	2003																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																													
Heidemann E 2004	-0.0202	0.2130	89	87	1.6%	0.98 [0.64, 1.49]	2004																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																													
Ejlertsen B 2004	0.1398	0.1322	193	194	3.8%	1.15 [0.89, 1.49]	2004																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																													
ici F 2005	-0.1508	0.1571	100	101	2.9%	0.86 [0.63, 1.17]	2005																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																													
Stockler M 2006	0.3853	0.1571	109	214	2.9%	1.47 [1.09, 2.00]	2006																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																													
Albain KS 2008	-0.1895	0.1087	266	263	4.4%	0.82 [0.67, 1.00]	2008																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																													
Sparano JA 2010	-0.1054	0.0888	609	612	7.8%	0.90 [0.79, 1.03]	2010																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																													
Nielsen DL 2011	-0.0819	0.116	170	167	4.5%	0.94 [0.75, 1.18]	2011																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																													
Total (95% CI)			4190	4515	100.0%	0.89 [0.84, 0.94]																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																														
	コメント: 異質性はあまり認められず、併用療法が単剤療法に比べ死亡リスクを有意に11%低下するという推定結果であった。																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																			
Funnel plot																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																				
	コメント: 出版バイアスの評価については、明らかな非対称性は認められない																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																			
その他の解析	施行せず		コメント:																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																	
メタリグレッション																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																				
感度分析																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																				

【4-9 メタアナリシス】

CQ		HER2陰性転移・再発乳癌に対する化学療法は単剤か併用かどちらが推奨されるか？																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																											
P	HER2陰性転移・再発乳癌	I	併用療法（化学療法）																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																										
C	単剤療法（化学療法）	O	Progression free survival																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																										
研究デザイン	RCT	文献数	27	コード	Cochrane 2009 (26) Albain KS 2008 Sparano JA 2010 Nielsen DL 2011																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																								
モデル	Random Effect	方法	Inverse Variance (RevMan5.3)																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																										
効果指標	ハザード比	統合値	0.8 (0.74 - 0.86) P= <0.00001																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																										
Forest plot	<table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Study or Subgroup</th> <th>log(Hazard Ratio)</th> <th>SE</th> <th>Experimental Total</th> <th>Control Total</th> <th>Weight</th> <th>Hazard Ratio IV, Random, 95% CI</th> <th>Year</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr><td>Ingle J 1985</td><td>0.01</td><td>0.1366</td><td>79</td><td>79</td><td>3.6%</td><td>1.01 [0.77, 1.32]</td><td>1985</td></tr> <tr><td>Andersson M 1986</td><td>-0.5621</td><td>0.2443</td><td>44</td><td>45</td><td>1.9%</td><td>0.57 [0.35, 0.92]</td><td>1986</td></tr> <tr><td>Vaughn CB 1988</td><td>-0.4005</td><td>0.194</td><td>56</td><td>63</td><td>2.5%</td><td>0.67 [0.46, 0.99]</td><td>1988</td></tr> <tr><td>Ingle J 1989</td><td>-0.3857</td><td>0.1373</td><td>90</td><td>95</td><td>3.6%</td><td>0.68 [0.52, 0.89]</td><td>1989</td></tr> <tr><td>Nielsen D 1990</td><td>-0.0834</td><td>0.1523</td><td>67</td><td>76</td><td>3.3%</td><td>0.92 [0.68, 1.24]</td><td>1990</td></tr> <tr><td>French Eoi (B) 1991</td><td>-0.1863</td><td>0.1343</td><td>137</td><td>70</td><td>3.7%</td><td>0.83 [0.64, 1.09]</td><td>1991</td></tr> <tr><td>French Eoi (A) 1991</td><td>-0.0305</td><td>0.1294</td><td>135</td><td>70</td><td>3.8%</td><td>0.97 [0.75, 1.25]</td><td>1991</td></tr> <tr><td>Fraser S 1993</td><td>-0.6539</td><td>0.3437</td><td>19</td><td>21</td><td>1.1%</td><td>0.52 [0.27, 1.02]</td><td>1993</td></tr> <tr><td>Joensuu H 1998</td><td>-0.2744</td><td>0.1349</td><td>150</td><td>153</td><td>3.6%</td><td>0.76 [0.58, 0.99]</td><td>1998</td></tr> <tr><td>Sjostrom J 1999</td><td>-0.5447</td><td>0.1174</td><td>139</td><td>143</td><td>4.1%</td><td>0.58 [0.46, 0.73]</td><td>1999</td></tr> <tr><td>Bishop J 1999</td><td>0.1655</td><td>0.1392</td><td>102</td><td>107</td><td>3.6%</td><td>1.18 [0.90, 1.55]</td><td>1999</td></tr> <tr><td>Nabholtz JM 1999</td><td>-0.3857</td><td>0.1017</td><td>189</td><td>203</td><td>4.4%</td><td>0.68 [0.56, 0.83]</td><td>1999</td></tr> <tr><td>Nielsen D 2000</td><td>-0.1625</td><td>0.2128</td><td>74</td><td>81</td><td>2.3%</td><td>0.85 [0.56, 1.29]</td><td>2000</td></tr> <tr><td>Takayama T (B) 2000</td><td>-0.5978</td><td>0.2161</td><td>27</td><td>55</td><td>2.2%</td><td>0.55 [0.36, 0.84]</td><td>2000</td></tr> <tr><td>Takayama T (A) 2000</td><td>-0.1744</td><td>0.2149</td><td>27</td><td>57</td><td>2.2%</td><td>0.84 [0.55, 1.28]</td><td>2000</td></tr> <tr><td>O'Shaughnessy J 2001</td><td>0.2852</td><td>0.2183</td><td>33</td><td>62</td><td>2.2%</td><td>1.33 [0.87, 2.04]</td><td>2001</td></tr> <tr><td>O'Shaughnessy J 2002</td><td>-0.3857</td><td>0.0893</td><td>255</td><td>256</td><td>4.8%</td><td>0.68 [0.57, 0.81]</td><td>2002</td></tr> <tr><td>Berruti D 2002</td><td>-0.0513</td><td>0.1561</td><td>92</td><td>93</td><td>3.2%</td><td>0.95 [0.70, 1.29]</td><td>2002</td></tr> <tr><td>Bonnerre J 2002</td><td>0.1133</td><td>0.1491</td><td>90</td><td>88</td><td>3.3%</td><td>1.12 [0.84, 1.50]</td><td>2002</td></tr> <tr><td>Heidemann E 2002</td><td>0.0392</td><td>0.1369</td><td>127</td><td>133</td><td>3.6%</td><td>1.04 [0.80, 1.36]</td><td>2002</td></tr> <tr><td>Ejlertsen B 2004</td><td>-0.2614</td><td>0.1125</td><td>193</td><td>194</td><td>4.2%</td><td>0.77 [0.62, 0.96]</td><td>2004</td></tr> <tr><td>Heidemann E 2004</td><td>-0.2677</td><td>0.1813</td><td>89</td><td>87</td><td>2.7%</td><td>0.75 [0.53, 1.07]</td><td>2004</td></tr> <tr><td>Icli F 2005</td><td>-0.5276</td><td>0.1359</td><td>100</td><td>101</td><td>3.6%</td><td>0.59 [0.45, 0.77]</td><td>2005</td></tr> <tr><td>Stockler M 2006</td><td>0.157</td><td>0.1199</td><td>109</td><td>214</td><td>4.0%</td><td>1.17 [0.92, 1.48]</td><td>2006</td></tr> <tr><td>OEICAM 2007</td><td>-0.3285</td><td>0.1195</td><td>125</td><td>126</td><td>4.0%</td><td>0.72 [0.57, 0.91]</td><td>2007</td></tr> <tr><td>Thomas E 2008</td><td>-0.3567</td><td>0.0745</td><td>375</td><td>377</td><td>5.1%</td><td>0.70 [0.60, 0.81]</td><td>2008</td></tr> <tr><td>Albain KS 2008</td><td>-0.3567</td><td>0.0991</td><td>266</td><td>263</td><td>4.5%</td><td>0.70 [0.58, 0.85]</td><td>2008</td></tr> <tr><td>Sparano JA 2010</td><td>-0.2357</td><td>0.0665</td><td>609</td><td>612</td><td>5.3%</td><td>0.79 [0.69, 0.90]</td><td>2010</td></tr> <tr><td>Nielsen DL 2011</td><td>-0.2614</td><td>0.1384</td><td>170</td><td>167</td><td>3.6%</td><td>0.77 [0.59, 1.01]</td><td>2011</td></tr> <tr> <td>Total (95% CI)</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>3968</td> <td>4091</td> <td>100.0%</td> <td>0.80 [0.74, 0.86]</td> <td></td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>Heterogeneity: Tau² = 0.03; Chi² = 72.12, df = 28 (P < 0.00001); I² = 61% Test for overall effect: Z = 5.64 (P < 0.00001)</p>					Study or Subgroup	log(Hazard Ratio)	SE	Experimental Total	Control Total	Weight	Hazard Ratio IV, Random, 95% CI	Year	Ingle J 1985	0.01	0.1366	79	79	3.6%	1.01 [0.77, 1.32]	1985	Andersson M 1986	-0.5621	0.2443	44	45	1.9%	0.57 [0.35, 0.92]	1986	Vaughn CB 1988	-0.4005	0.194	56	63	2.5%	0.67 [0.46, 0.99]	1988	Ingle J 1989	-0.3857	0.1373	90	95	3.6%	0.68 [0.52, 0.89]	1989	Nielsen D 1990	-0.0834	0.1523	67	76	3.3%	0.92 [0.68, 1.24]	1990	French Eoi (B) 1991	-0.1863	0.1343	137	70	3.7%	0.83 [0.64, 1.09]	1991	French Eoi (A) 1991	-0.0305	0.1294	135	70	3.8%	0.97 [0.75, 1.25]	1991	Fraser S 1993	-0.6539	0.3437	19	21	1.1%	0.52 [0.27, 1.02]	1993	Joensuu H 1998	-0.2744	0.1349	150	153	3.6%	0.76 [0.58, 0.99]	1998	Sjostrom J 1999	-0.5447	0.1174	139	143	4.1%	0.58 [0.46, 0.73]	1999	Bishop J 1999	0.1655	0.1392	102	107	3.6%	1.18 [0.90, 1.55]	1999	Nabholtz JM 1999	-0.3857	0.1017	189	203	4.4%	0.68 [0.56, 0.83]	1999	Nielsen D 2000	-0.1625	0.2128	74	81	2.3%	0.85 [0.56, 1.29]	2000	Takayama T (B) 2000	-0.5978	0.2161	27	55	2.2%	0.55 [0.36, 0.84]	2000	Takayama T (A) 2000	-0.1744	0.2149	27	57	2.2%	0.84 [0.55, 1.28]	2000	O'Shaughnessy J 2001	0.2852	0.2183	33	62	2.2%	1.33 [0.87, 2.04]	2001	O'Shaughnessy J 2002	-0.3857	0.0893	255	256	4.8%	0.68 [0.57, 0.81]	2002	Berruti D 2002	-0.0513	0.1561	92	93	3.2%	0.95 [0.70, 1.29]	2002	Bonnerre J 2002	0.1133	0.1491	90	88	3.3%	1.12 [0.84, 1.50]	2002	Heidemann E 2002	0.0392	0.1369	127	133	3.6%	1.04 [0.80, 1.36]	2002	Ejlertsen B 2004	-0.2614	0.1125	193	194	4.2%	0.77 [0.62, 0.96]	2004	Heidemann E 2004	-0.2677	0.1813	89	87	2.7%	0.75 [0.53, 1.07]	2004	Icli F 2005	-0.5276	0.1359	100	101	3.6%	0.59 [0.45, 0.77]	2005	Stockler M 2006	0.157	0.1199	109	214	4.0%	1.17 [0.92, 1.48]	2006	OEICAM 2007	-0.3285	0.1195	125	126	4.0%	0.72 [0.57, 0.91]	2007	Thomas E 2008	-0.3567	0.0745	375	377	5.1%	0.70 [0.60, 0.81]	2008	Albain KS 2008	-0.3567	0.0991	266	263	4.5%	0.70 [0.58, 0.85]	2008	Sparano JA 2010	-0.2357	0.0665	609	612	5.3%	0.79 [0.69, 0.90]	2010	Nielsen DL 2011	-0.2614	0.1384	170	167	3.6%	0.77 [0.59, 1.01]	2011	Total (95% CI)			3968	4091	100.0%	0.80 [0.74, 0.86]	
Study or Subgroup	log(Hazard Ratio)	SE	Experimental Total	Control Total	Weight	Hazard Ratio IV, Random, 95% CI	Year																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																						
Ingle J 1985	0.01	0.1366	79	79	3.6%	1.01 [0.77, 1.32]	1985																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																						
Andersson M 1986	-0.5621	0.2443	44	45	1.9%	0.57 [0.35, 0.92]	1986																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																						
Vaughn CB 1988	-0.4005	0.194	56	63	2.5%	0.67 [0.46, 0.99]	1988																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																						
Ingle J 1989	-0.3857	0.1373	90	95	3.6%	0.68 [0.52, 0.89]	1989																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																						
Nielsen D 1990	-0.0834	0.1523	67	76	3.3%	0.92 [0.68, 1.24]	1990																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																						
French Eoi (B) 1991	-0.1863	0.1343	137	70	3.7%	0.83 [0.64, 1.09]	1991																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																						
French Eoi (A) 1991	-0.0305	0.1294	135	70	3.8%	0.97 [0.75, 1.25]	1991																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																						
Fraser S 1993	-0.6539	0.3437	19	21	1.1%	0.52 [0.27, 1.02]	1993																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																						
Joensuu H 1998	-0.2744	0.1349	150	153	3.6%	0.76 [0.58, 0.99]	1998																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																						
Sjostrom J 1999	-0.5447	0.1174	139	143	4.1%	0.58 [0.46, 0.73]	1999																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																						
Bishop J 1999	0.1655	0.1392	102	107	3.6%	1.18 [0.90, 1.55]	1999																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																						
Nabholtz JM 1999	-0.3857	0.1017	189	203	4.4%	0.68 [0.56, 0.83]	1999																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																						
Nielsen D 2000	-0.1625	0.2128	74	81	2.3%	0.85 [0.56, 1.29]	2000																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																						
Takayama T (B) 2000	-0.5978	0.2161	27	55	2.2%	0.55 [0.36, 0.84]	2000																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																						
Takayama T (A) 2000	-0.1744	0.2149	27	57	2.2%	0.84 [0.55, 1.28]	2000																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																						
O'Shaughnessy J 2001	0.2852	0.2183	33	62	2.2%	1.33 [0.87, 2.04]	2001																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																						
O'Shaughnessy J 2002	-0.3857	0.0893	255	256	4.8%	0.68 [0.57, 0.81]	2002																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																						
Berruti D 2002	-0.0513	0.1561	92	93	3.2%	0.95 [0.70, 1.29]	2002																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																						
Bonnerre J 2002	0.1133	0.1491	90	88	3.3%	1.12 [0.84, 1.50]	2002																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																						
Heidemann E 2002	0.0392	0.1369	127	133	3.6%	1.04 [0.80, 1.36]	2002																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																						
Ejlertsen B 2004	-0.2614	0.1125	193	194	4.2%	0.77 [0.62, 0.96]	2004																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																						
Heidemann E 2004	-0.2677	0.1813	89	87	2.7%	0.75 [0.53, 1.07]	2004																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																						
Icli F 2005	-0.5276	0.1359	100	101	3.6%	0.59 [0.45, 0.77]	2005																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																						
Stockler M 2006	0.157	0.1199	109	214	4.0%	1.17 [0.92, 1.48]	2006																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																						
OEICAM 2007	-0.3285	0.1195	125	126	4.0%	0.72 [0.57, 0.91]	2007																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																						
Thomas E 2008	-0.3567	0.0745	375	377	5.1%	0.70 [0.60, 0.81]	2008																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																						
Albain KS 2008	-0.3567	0.0991	266	263	4.5%	0.70 [0.58, 0.85]	2008																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																						
Sparano JA 2010	-0.2357	0.0665	609	612	5.3%	0.79 [0.69, 0.90]	2010																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																						
Nielsen DL 2011	-0.2614	0.1384	170	167	3.6%	0.77 [0.59, 1.01]	2011																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																						
Total (95% CI)			3968	4091	100.0%	0.80 [0.74, 0.86]																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																							
	<p>コメント: 全体としては併用療法が単剤療法に比べ病勢進行のリスクを有意に20%低下するという推定結果であった。中程度の異質性が認められ、薬剤や治療ラインによる可能性がある。</p>																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Funnel plot																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																													
	<p>コメント: 出版バイアスの評価については、明らかな非対称性は認められない。</p>																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
その他の解析	施行せず				コメント:																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																								
メタリグレーション																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																													
感度分析																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																													

【4-9 メタアナリシス】

CQ		HER2陰性転移・再発乳癌に対する化学療法は単剤か併用かどちらが推奨されるか？																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																	
P	HER2陰性転移・再発乳癌	I	併用療法（化学療法）																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																
C	単剤療法（化学療法）	O	Overall response rate																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																
研究デザイン	RCT	文献数	46																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																
コード			Cochrane 2009 (45) Albain KS 2008 Papadimitriou CA 2009 Sparano JA 2010 Nielsen DL 2011 Pallis AG 2012 Harvey VJ 2013																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																
モデル	Random Effect	方法	Mantel-Haenszel method (RevMan5.3)																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																
効果指標	リスク比	統合値	1.28 (1.15 - 1.42) P= <0.00001																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																
Forest plot	<table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Study or Subgroup</th> <th>Experimental Events</th> <th>Experimental Total</th> <th>Control Events</th> <th>Control Total</th> <th>Weight</th> <th>M-H, Random, 95% CI</th> <th>Year</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr><td>Ahmann DL (1) 1974</td><td>12</td><td>21</td><td>1</td><td>22</td><td>0.3%</td><td>12.57 [1.79, 80.40]</td><td>1974</td></tr> <tr><td>Rubens RD 1975</td><td>32</td><td>50</td><td>29</td><td>49</td><td>2.5%</td><td>1.08 [0.79, 1.48]</td><td>1975</td></tr> <tr><td>Hoogstraaten B (B) 1976</td><td>63</td><td>106</td><td>16</td><td>40</td><td>2.2%</td><td>1.49 [0.99, 2.24]</td><td>1976</td></tr> <tr><td>Eagan RT 1976</td><td>4</td><td>20</td><td>2</td><td>19</td><td>0.4%</td><td>1.90 [0.39, 9.20]</td><td>1976</td></tr> <tr><td>Hoogstraaten B (A) 1976</td><td>39</td><td>98</td><td>15</td><td>39</td><td>2.0%</td><td>1.03 [0.65, 1.65]</td><td>1976</td></tr> <tr><td>Canellis GP 1976</td><td>49</td><td>93</td><td>19</td><td>91</td><td>2.0%</td><td>2.66 [1.69, 4.20]</td><td>1976</td></tr> <tr><td>Mouridsen HT 1977</td><td>17</td><td>27</td><td>6</td><td>24</td><td>1.2%</td><td>2.52 [1.19, 5.34]</td><td>1977</td></tr> <tr><td>Carmo-Pereira 1980</td><td>47</td><td>68</td><td>12</td><td>67</td><td>1.8%</td><td>2.88 [2.26, 6.60]</td><td>1980</td></tr> <tr><td>Steiner R 1983</td><td>28</td><td>54</td><td>30</td><td>53</td><td>2.4%</td><td>0.92 [0.65, 1.30]</td><td>1983</td></tr> <tr><td>Ingle J 1985</td><td>25</td><td>77</td><td>26</td><td>74</td><td>2.0%</td><td>0.92 [0.59, 1.44]</td><td>1985</td></tr> <tr><td>Andersson M 1986</td><td>19</td><td>39</td><td>20</td><td>42</td><td>2.0%</td><td>1.02 [0.65, 1.61]</td><td>1986</td></tr> <tr><td>Oundersen S 1986</td><td>24</td><td>66</td><td>19</td><td>62</td><td>1.9%</td><td>1.19 [0.73, 1.94]</td><td>1986</td></tr> <tr><td>Vaughn CB 1988</td><td>13</td><td>56</td><td>14</td><td>59</td><td>1.4%</td><td>0.98 [0.51, 1.89]</td><td>1988</td></tr> <tr><td>Ingle J 1989</td><td>39</td><td>90</td><td>24</td><td>95</td><td>2.1%</td><td>1.72 [1.13, 2.61]</td><td>1989</td></tr> <tr><td>Nielsen D 1990</td><td>28</td><td>67</td><td>38</td><td>76</td><td>2.3%</td><td>0.84 [0.58, 1.20]</td><td>1990</td></tr> <tr><td>Falkson G 1990</td><td>19</td><td>52</td><td>17</td><td>61</td><td>1.8%</td><td>1.10 [0.66, 1.80]</td><td>1990</td></tr> <tr><td>French Epi (A) 1991</td><td>54</td><td>121</td><td>18</td><td>60</td><td>2.1%</td><td>1.49 [0.86, 2.30]</td><td>1991</td></tr> <tr><td>French Epi (B) 1991</td><td>55</td><td>123</td><td>17</td><td>61</td><td>2.0%</td><td>1.60 [1.02, 2.51]</td><td>1991</td></tr> <tr><td>Fraser S 1993</td><td>11</td><td>19</td><td>6</td><td>21</td><td>2.2%</td><td>2.03 [0.93, 4.41]</td><td>1993</td></tr> <tr><td>Tashiro H 1994</td><td>11</td><td>28</td><td>6</td><td>28</td><td>1.1%</td><td>1.93 [0.79, 4.27]</td><td>1994</td></tr> <tr><td>Erkisi M 1997</td><td>12</td><td>30</td><td>16</td><td>30</td><td>1.7%</td><td>0.75 [0.43, 1.30]</td><td>1997</td></tr> <tr><td>Joensuu H 1998</td><td>67</td><td>143</td><td>79</td><td>140</td><td>2.8%</td><td>0.82 [0.66, 1.04]</td><td>1998</td></tr> <tr><td>Brhoo J 1999</td><td>38</td><td>102</td><td>31</td><td>107</td><td>2.2%</td><td>1.22 [0.82, 1.81]</td><td>1999</td></tr> <tr><td>Sjostrom J 1999</td><td>29</td><td>139</td><td>61</td><td>143</td><td>2.3%</td><td>0.48 [0.34, 0.71]</td><td>1999</td></tr> <tr><td>Nabholz JM 1999</td><td>21</td><td>171</td><td>60</td><td>179</td><td>2.0%</td><td>0.37 [0.23, 0.57]</td><td>1999</td></tr> <tr><td>Venturino A (B) 2000</td><td>10</td><td>33</td><td>4</td><td>17</td><td>0.8%</td><td>1.29 [0.47, 3.50]</td><td>2000</td></tr> <tr><td>Venturino A (A) 2000</td><td>7</td><td>32</td><td>4</td><td>16</td><td>0.8%</td><td>0.89 [0.30, 2.50]</td><td>2000</td></tr> <tr><td>Takayama T (B) 2000</td><td>10</td><td>27</td><td>8</td><td>57</td><td>1.1%</td><td>2.64 [1.17, 5.93]</td><td>2000</td></tr> <tr><td>Takayama T (A) 2000</td><td>10</td><td>27</td><td>13</td><td>55</td><td>1.4%</td><td>1.57 [0.79, 3.10]</td><td>2000</td></tr> <tr><td>Norris B 2000</td><td>55</td><td>145</td><td>44</td><td>144</td><td>2.5%</td><td>1.24 [0.90, 1.71]</td><td>2000</td></tr> <tr><td>Nielsen D 2000</td><td>43</td><td>65</td><td>45</td><td>74</td><td>2.7%</td><td>1.09 [0.65, 1.40]</td><td>2000</td></tr> <tr><td>ANZCTG 2001</td><td>70</td><td>190</td><td>47</td><td>192</td><td>3.5%</td><td>1.51 [1.10, 2.05]</td><td>2001</td></tr> <tr><td>O'Shaughnessy J 2001</td><td>18</td><td>61</td><td>5</td><td>32</td><td>1.0%</td><td>1.89 [0.77, 4.62]</td><td>2001</td></tr> <tr><td>Bonnetbre J 2002</td><td>35</td><td>90</td><td>37</td><td>96</td><td>2.4%</td><td>0.90 [0.63, 1.29]</td><td>2002</td></tr> <tr><td>Berusi D 2002</td><td>53</td><td>62</td><td>47</td><td>63</td><td>2.7%</td><td>1.14 [0.67, 1.49]</td><td>2002</td></tr> <tr><td>O'Shaughnessy J 2002</td><td>107</td><td>255</td><td>77</td><td>256</td><td>2.8%</td><td>1.40 [1.10, 1.77]</td><td>2002</td></tr> <tr><td>Heidermann E 2002</td><td>43</td><td>119</td><td>30</td><td>119</td><td>2.2%</td><td>1.43 [0.97, 2.12]</td><td>2002</td></tr> <tr><td>Sledge G (B) 2003</td><td>54</td><td>115</td><td>78</td><td>229</td><td>2.7%</td><td>1.38 [1.06, 1.80]</td><td>2003</td></tr> <tr><td>Sledge G (A) 2003</td><td>54</td><td>115</td><td>91</td><td>224</td><td>2.7%</td><td>1.20 [1.00, 1.69]</td><td>2003</td></tr> <tr><td>Heidermann E 2004</td><td>44</td><td>97</td><td>20</td><td>86</td><td>2.1%</td><td>2.17 [1.41, 3.36]</td><td>2004</td></tr> <tr><td>Ejlertsen B 2004</td><td>96</td><td>193</td><td>81</td><td>194</td><td>2.8%</td><td>1.19 [0.86, 1.48]</td><td>2004</td></tr> <tr><td>Ici F 2005</td><td>33</td><td>91</td><td>21</td><td>84</td><td>2.0%</td><td>1.62 [1.02, 2.58]</td><td>2005</td></tr> <tr><td>Stucker M 2006</td><td>18</td><td>109</td><td>42</td><td>214</td><td>1.9%</td><td>0.84 [0.51, 1.39]</td><td>2006</td></tr> <tr><td>GEICAM 2007</td><td>45</td><td>125</td><td>33</td><td>126</td><td>2.3%</td><td>1.37 [0.94, 2.00]</td><td>2007</td></tr> <tr><td>Thomas E 2008</td><td>130</td><td>375</td><td>54</td><td>377</td><td>2.6%</td><td>2.42 [1.82, 3.21]</td><td>2008</td></tr> <tr><td>Albain KS 2008</td><td>110</td><td>266</td><td>69</td><td>263</td><td>2.7%</td><td>1.58 [1.23, 2.02]</td><td>2008</td></tr> <tr><td>Papadimitriou CA 2009</td><td>11</td><td>41</td><td>6</td><td>34</td><td>1.0%</td><td>1.52 [0.63, 3.69]</td><td>2009</td></tr> <tr><td>Sparano JA 2010</td><td>206</td><td>480</td><td>140</td><td>480</td><td>2.9%</td><td>1.47 [1.24, 1.75]</td><td>2010</td></tr> <tr><td>Nielsen DL 2011</td><td>41</td><td>114</td><td>36</td><td>106</td><td>2.3%</td><td>1.06 [0.74, 1.52]</td><td>2011</td></tr> <tr><td>Pallis AG 2012</td><td>21</td><td>74</td><td>18</td><td>74</td><td>1.8%</td><td>1.17 [0.68, 2.00]</td><td>2012</td></tr> <tr><td>Harvey VJ 2013</td><td>17</td><td>39</td><td>15</td><td>42</td><td>1.8%</td><td>1.22 [0.71, 2.10]</td><td>2013</td></tr> <tr><td>Total (95% CI)</td><td></td><td>5220</td><td></td><td>5316</td><td>100.0%</td><td>1.28 [1.15, 1.42]</td><td></td></tr> <tr><td>Total events</td><td></td><td>2095</td><td></td><td>1836</td><td></td><td></td><td></td></tr> <tr><td>Heterogeneity: Tau² = 0.09; I² = 177.28; df = 50 (P < 0.00001); P = 72%</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></tr> <tr><td>Test for overall effect: Z = 4.47 (P < 0.00001)</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></tr> </tbody> </table>			Study or Subgroup	Experimental Events	Experimental Total	Control Events	Control Total	Weight	M-H, Random, 95% CI	Year	Ahmann DL (1) 1974	12	21	1	22	0.3%	12.57 [1.79, 80.40]	1974	Rubens RD 1975	32	50	29	49	2.5%	1.08 [0.79, 1.48]	1975	Hoogstraaten B (B) 1976	63	106	16	40	2.2%	1.49 [0.99, 2.24]	1976	Eagan RT 1976	4	20	2	19	0.4%	1.90 [0.39, 9.20]	1976	Hoogstraaten B (A) 1976	39	98	15	39	2.0%	1.03 [0.65, 1.65]	1976	Canellis GP 1976	49	93	19	91	2.0%	2.66 [1.69, 4.20]	1976	Mouridsen HT 1977	17	27	6	24	1.2%	2.52 [1.19, 5.34]	1977	Carmo-Pereira 1980	47	68	12	67	1.8%	2.88 [2.26, 6.60]	1980	Steiner R 1983	28	54	30	53	2.4%	0.92 [0.65, 1.30]	1983	Ingle J 1985	25	77	26	74	2.0%	0.92 [0.59, 1.44]	1985	Andersson M 1986	19	39	20	42	2.0%	1.02 [0.65, 1.61]	1986	Oundersen S 1986	24	66	19	62	1.9%	1.19 [0.73, 1.94]	1986	Vaughn CB 1988	13	56	14	59	1.4%	0.98 [0.51, 1.89]	1988	Ingle J 1989	39	90	24	95	2.1%	1.72 [1.13, 2.61]	1989	Nielsen D 1990	28	67	38	76	2.3%	0.84 [0.58, 1.20]	1990	Falkson G 1990	19	52	17	61	1.8%	1.10 [0.66, 1.80]	1990	French Epi (A) 1991	54	121	18	60	2.1%	1.49 [0.86, 2.30]	1991	French Epi (B) 1991	55	123	17	61	2.0%	1.60 [1.02, 2.51]	1991	Fraser S 1993	11	19	6	21	2.2%	2.03 [0.93, 4.41]	1993	Tashiro H 1994	11	28	6	28	1.1%	1.93 [0.79, 4.27]	1994	Erkisi M 1997	12	30	16	30	1.7%	0.75 [0.43, 1.30]	1997	Joensuu H 1998	67	143	79	140	2.8%	0.82 [0.66, 1.04]	1998	Brhoo J 1999	38	102	31	107	2.2%	1.22 [0.82, 1.81]	1999	Sjostrom J 1999	29	139	61	143	2.3%	0.48 [0.34, 0.71]	1999	Nabholz JM 1999	21	171	60	179	2.0%	0.37 [0.23, 0.57]	1999	Venturino A (B) 2000	10	33	4	17	0.8%	1.29 [0.47, 3.50]	2000	Venturino A (A) 2000	7	32	4	16	0.8%	0.89 [0.30, 2.50]	2000	Takayama T (B) 2000	10	27	8	57	1.1%	2.64 [1.17, 5.93]	2000	Takayama T (A) 2000	10	27	13	55	1.4%	1.57 [0.79, 3.10]	2000	Norris B 2000	55	145	44	144	2.5%	1.24 [0.90, 1.71]	2000	Nielsen D 2000	43	65	45	74	2.7%	1.09 [0.65, 1.40]	2000	ANZCTG 2001	70	190	47	192	3.5%	1.51 [1.10, 2.05]	2001	O'Shaughnessy J 2001	18	61	5	32	1.0%	1.89 [0.77, 4.62]	2001	Bonnetbre J 2002	35	90	37	96	2.4%	0.90 [0.63, 1.29]	2002	Berusi D 2002	53	62	47	63	2.7%	1.14 [0.67, 1.49]	2002	O'Shaughnessy J 2002	107	255	77	256	2.8%	1.40 [1.10, 1.77]	2002	Heidermann E 2002	43	119	30	119	2.2%	1.43 [0.97, 2.12]	2002	Sledge G (B) 2003	54	115	78	229	2.7%	1.38 [1.06, 1.80]	2003	Sledge G (A) 2003	54	115	91	224	2.7%	1.20 [1.00, 1.69]	2003	Heidermann E 2004	44	97	20	86	2.1%	2.17 [1.41, 3.36]	2004	Ejlertsen B 2004	96	193	81	194	2.8%	1.19 [0.86, 1.48]	2004	Ici F 2005	33	91	21	84	2.0%	1.62 [1.02, 2.58]	2005	Stucker M 2006	18	109	42	214	1.9%	0.84 [0.51, 1.39]	2006	GEICAM 2007	45	125	33	126	2.3%	1.37 [0.94, 2.00]	2007	Thomas E 2008	130	375	54	377	2.6%	2.42 [1.82, 3.21]	2008	Albain KS 2008	110	266	69	263	2.7%	1.58 [1.23, 2.02]	2008	Papadimitriou CA 2009	11	41	6	34	1.0%	1.52 [0.63, 3.69]	2009	Sparano JA 2010	206	480	140	480	2.9%	1.47 [1.24, 1.75]	2010	Nielsen DL 2011	41	114	36	106	2.3%	1.06 [0.74, 1.52]	2011	Pallis AG 2012	21	74	18	74	1.8%	1.17 [0.68, 2.00]	2012	Harvey VJ 2013	17	39	15	42	1.8%	1.22 [0.71, 2.10]	2013	Total (95% CI)		5220		5316	100.0%	1.28 [1.15, 1.42]		Total events		2095		1836				Heterogeneity: Tau ² = 0.09; I ² = 177.28; df = 50 (P < 0.00001); P = 72%								Test for overall effect: Z = 4.47 (P < 0.00001)							
Study or Subgroup	Experimental Events	Experimental Total	Control Events	Control Total	Weight	M-H, Random, 95% CI	Year																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Ahmann DL (1) 1974	12	21	1	22	0.3%	12.57 [1.79, 80.40]	1974																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Rubens RD 1975	32	50	29	49	2.5%	1.08 [0.79, 1.48]	1975																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Hoogstraaten B (B) 1976	63	106	16	40	2.2%	1.49 [0.99, 2.24]	1976																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Eagan RT 1976	4	20	2	19	0.4%	1.90 [0.39, 9.20]	1976																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Hoogstraaten B (A) 1976	39	98	15	39	2.0%	1.03 [0.65, 1.65]	1976																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Canellis GP 1976	49	93	19	91	2.0%	2.66 [1.69, 4.20]	1976																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Mouridsen HT 1977	17	27	6	24	1.2%	2.52 [1.19, 5.34]	1977																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Carmo-Pereira 1980	47	68	12	67	1.8%	2.88 [2.26, 6.60]	1980																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Steiner R 1983	28	54	30	53	2.4%	0.92 [0.65, 1.30]	1983																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Ingle J 1985	25	77	26	74	2.0%	0.92 [0.59, 1.44]	1985																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Andersson M 1986	19	39	20	42	2.0%	1.02 [0.65, 1.61]	1986																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Oundersen S 1986	24	66	19	62	1.9%	1.19 [0.73, 1.94]	1986																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Vaughn CB 1988	13	56	14	59	1.4%	0.98 [0.51, 1.89]	1988																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Ingle J 1989	39	90	24	95	2.1%	1.72 [1.13, 2.61]	1989																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Nielsen D 1990	28	67	38	76	2.3%	0.84 [0.58, 1.20]	1990																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Falkson G 1990	19	52	17	61	1.8%	1.10 [0.66, 1.80]	1990																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
French Epi (A) 1991	54	121	18	60	2.1%	1.49 [0.86, 2.30]	1991																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
French Epi (B) 1991	55	123	17	61	2.0%	1.60 [1.02, 2.51]	1991																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Fraser S 1993	11	19	6	21	2.2%	2.03 [0.93, 4.41]	1993																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Tashiro H 1994	11	28	6	28	1.1%	1.93 [0.79, 4.27]	1994																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Erkisi M 1997	12	30	16	30	1.7%	0.75 [0.43, 1.30]	1997																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Joensuu H 1998	67	143	79	140	2.8%	0.82 [0.66, 1.04]	1998																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Brhoo J 1999	38	102	31	107	2.2%	1.22 [0.82, 1.81]	1999																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Sjostrom J 1999	29	139	61	143	2.3%	0.48 [0.34, 0.71]	1999																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Nabholz JM 1999	21	171	60	179	2.0%	0.37 [0.23, 0.57]	1999																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Venturino A (B) 2000	10	33	4	17	0.8%	1.29 [0.47, 3.50]	2000																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Venturino A (A) 2000	7	32	4	16	0.8%	0.89 [0.30, 2.50]	2000																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Takayama T (B) 2000	10	27	8	57	1.1%	2.64 [1.17, 5.93]	2000																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Takayama T (A) 2000	10	27	13	55	1.4%	1.57 [0.79, 3.10]	2000																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Norris B 2000	55	145	44	144	2.5%	1.24 [0.90, 1.71]	2000																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Nielsen D 2000	43	65	45	74	2.7%	1.09 [0.65, 1.40]	2000																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
ANZCTG 2001	70	190	47	192	3.5%	1.51 [1.10, 2.05]	2001																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
O'Shaughnessy J 2001	18	61	5	32	1.0%	1.89 [0.77, 4.62]	2001																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Bonnetbre J 2002	35	90	37	96	2.4%	0.90 [0.63, 1.29]	2002																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Berusi D 2002	53	62	47	63	2.7%	1.14 [0.67, 1.49]	2002																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
O'Shaughnessy J 2002	107	255	77	256	2.8%	1.40 [1.10, 1.77]	2002																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Heidermann E 2002	43	119	30	119	2.2%	1.43 [0.97, 2.12]	2002																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Sledge G (B) 2003	54	115	78	229	2.7%	1.38 [1.06, 1.80]	2003																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Sledge G (A) 2003	54	115	91	224	2.7%	1.20 [1.00, 1.69]	2003																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Heidermann E 2004	44	97	20	86	2.1%	2.17 [1.41, 3.36]	2004																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Ejlertsen B 2004	96	193	81	194	2.8%	1.19 [0.86, 1.48]	2004																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Ici F 2005	33	91	21	84	2.0%	1.62 [1.02, 2.58]	2005																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Stucker M 2006	18	109	42	214	1.9%	0.84 [0.51, 1.39]	2006																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
GEICAM 2007	45	125	33	126	2.3%	1.37 [0.94, 2.00]	2007																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Thomas E 2008	130	375	54	377	2.6%	2.42 [1.82, 3.21]	2008																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Albain KS 2008	110	266	69	263	2.7%	1.58 [1.23, 2.02]	2008																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Papadimitriou CA 2009	11	41	6	34	1.0%	1.52 [0.63, 3.69]	2009																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Sparano JA 2010	206	480	140	480	2.9%	1.47 [1.24, 1.75]	2010																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Nielsen DL 2011	41	114	36	106	2.3%	1.06 [0.74, 1.52]	2011																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Pallis AG 2012	21	74	18	74	1.8%	1.17 [0.68, 2.00]	2012																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Harvey VJ 2013	17	39	15	42	1.8%	1.22 [0.71, 2.10]	2013																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Total (95% CI)		5220		5316	100.0%	1.28 [1.15, 1.42]																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																													
Total events		2095		1836																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																															
Heterogeneity: Tau ² = 0.09; I ² = 177.28; df = 50 (P < 0.00001); P = 72%																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																			
Test for overall effect: Z = 4.47 (P < 0.00001)																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																			
	<p>コメント: ORRは併用群で有意に高く、リスク比1.28(95%信頼区間:1.15-1.42)、P<0.00001であった。異質性が認められるが、薬剤や治療ラインの違いによる可能性がある。</p>																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																		
Funnel plot																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																			
	<p>コメント: 出版バイアスの評価については、やや非対称性が認められる。</p>																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																		
その他の解析	施行せず		コメント:																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																
メタリグレッション																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																			
感度分析																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																			

【4-9 メタアナリシス】

CQ		HER2陰性転移・再発乳癌に対する化学療法は単剤か併用かどちらが推奨されるか？																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																								
P	HER2陰性転移・再発乳癌	I	併用療法（化学療法）																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																							
C	単剤療法（化学療法）	O	Toxicity; nausea and vomiting																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																							
研究デザイン	RCT	文献数	33	コード	Cochrane 2009 (29) Albain KS 2008 Sparano JA 2010 Nielsen DL 2011 Pallis AG 2012 Harvey VJ 2013																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																					
モデル	Random Effect	方法	Mantel-Haenszel method (RevMan5.3)																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																							
効果指標	リスク比	統合値	1.18 (0.89 - 1.56) P= 0.26																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																							
Forest plot	<table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th rowspan="2">Study of Subgroup</th> <th colspan="2">Combination</th> <th colspan="2">Single agent</th> <th rowspan="2">Weight</th> <th colspan="2">Risk Ratio</th> <th rowspan="2">Year</th> </tr> <tr> <th>Events</th> <th>Total</th> <th>Events</th> <th>Total</th> <th>M, H, Random, 95% CI</th> <th>Year</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr><td>Carmo-Pereira 1980</td><td>30</td><td>68</td><td>67</td><td>67</td><td>4.6%</td><td>0.45</td><td>[0.34, 0.58]</td><td>1980</td></tr> <tr><td>Steiner R 1993</td><td>47</td><td>54</td><td>42</td><td>53</td><td>4.7%</td><td>1.10</td><td>[0.92, 1.30]</td><td>1993</td></tr> <tr><td>Ingle J 1985</td><td>12</td><td>77</td><td>11</td><td>74</td><td>3.6%</td><td>1.05</td><td>[0.49, 2.23]</td><td>1985</td></tr> <tr><td>Gundersen S 1988</td><td>43</td><td>88</td><td>4</td><td>82</td><td>3.0%</td><td>10.10</td><td>[3.85, 26.48]</td><td>1988</td></tr> <tr><td>Andersson M 1996</td><td>20</td><td>39</td><td>9</td><td>42</td><td>3.7%</td><td>2.69</td><td>[1.34, 5.39]</td><td>1996</td></tr> <tr><td>Vaugn CB 1989</td><td>2</td><td>56</td><td>10</td><td>59</td><td>2.1%</td><td>0.21</td><td>[0.05, 0.92]</td><td>1989</td></tr> <tr><td>Ingle J 1989</td><td>31</td><td>90</td><td>30</td><td>95</td><td>4.3%</td><td>1.08</td><td>[0.72, 1.65]</td><td>1989</td></tr> <tr><td>Falkson G 1990</td><td>6</td><td>52</td><td>2</td><td>51</td><td>1.9%</td><td>2.94</td><td>[0.62, 13.90]</td><td>1990</td></tr> <tr><td>Fraser S 1993</td><td>10</td><td>19</td><td>0</td><td>21</td><td>0.8%</td><td>23.10</td><td>[1.45, 369.28]</td><td>1993</td></tr> <tr><td>Joensuu H 1998</td><td>50</td><td>149</td><td>18</td><td>151</td><td>4.2%</td><td>2.02</td><td>[1.73, 4.59]</td><td>1998</td></tr> <tr><td>Nabholz JM 1999</td><td>9</td><td>187</td><td>14</td><td>200</td><td>3.4%</td><td>0.69</td><td>[0.30, 1.55]</td><td>1999</td></tr> <tr><td>Bishop J 1999</td><td>8</td><td>102</td><td>1</td><td>107</td><td>1.3%</td><td>8.39</td><td>[1.07, 65.92]</td><td>1999</td></tr> <tr><td>Sjostrom J 1999</td><td>11</td><td>139</td><td>6</td><td>140</td><td>3.0%</td><td>1.05</td><td>[0.70, 4.85]</td><td>1999</td></tr> <tr><td>Takayama T (A) 2000</td><td>0</td><td>54</td><td>1</td><td>57</td><td>0.7%</td><td>0.35</td><td>[0.01, 8.45]</td><td>2000</td></tr> <tr><td>Norris B 2000</td><td>29</td><td>151</td><td>45</td><td>149</td><td>4.3%</td><td>0.64</td><td>[0.42, 0.96]</td><td>2000</td></tr> <tr><td>O'Shaughnessy J 2001</td><td>3</td><td>32</td><td>7</td><td>81</td><td>2.4%</td><td>0.82</td><td>[0.23, 2.95]</td><td>2001</td></tr> <tr><td>ANZROG 2001</td><td>63</td><td>190</td><td>62</td><td>192</td><td>4.5%</td><td>0.88</td><td>[0.84, 1.17]</td><td>2001</td></tr> <tr><td>O'Shaughnessy J 2002</td><td>5</td><td>255</td><td>15</td><td>251</td><td>3.0%</td><td>0.33</td><td>[0.12, 0.89]</td><td>2002</td></tr> <tr><td>Berth D 2002</td><td>24</td><td>90</td><td>17</td><td>91</td><td>4.8%</td><td>1.43</td><td>[0.82, 2.47]</td><td>2002</td></tr> <tr><td>Heidermann E 2002</td><td>37</td><td>125</td><td>9</td><td>131</td><td>3.7%</td><td>4.31</td><td>[2.17, 8.56]</td><td>2002</td></tr> <tr><td>Bonnetere J 2002</td><td>5</td><td>90</td><td>4</td><td>86</td><td>2.4%</td><td>1.19</td><td>[0.33, 4.30]</td><td>2002</td></tr> <tr><td>Sledge G (A) 2003</td><td>10</td><td>115</td><td>15</td><td>224</td><td>3.5%</td><td>1.30</td><td>[0.60, 2.80]</td><td>2003</td></tr> <tr><td>Sledge G (B) 2003</td><td>10</td><td>115</td><td>6</td><td>229</td><td>3.0%</td><td>3.32</td><td>[1.24, 8.91]</td><td>2003</td></tr> <tr><td>Heidermann E 2004</td><td>5</td><td>85</td><td>5</td><td>85</td><td>2.5%</td><td>1.00</td><td>[0.30, 3.23]</td><td>2004</td></tr> <tr><td>Ejlertsen B 2004</td><td>12</td><td>193</td><td>41</td><td>194</td><td>3.9%</td><td>0.29</td><td>[0.16, 0.54]</td><td>2004</td></tr> <tr><td>Ichi F 2005</td><td>15</td><td>96</td><td>1</td><td>97</td><td>1.4%</td><td>15.16</td><td>[2.04, 112.49]</td><td>2005</td></tr> <tr><td>Stockler M 2006</td><td>4</td><td>109</td><td>12</td><td>214</td><td>2.7%</td><td>0.65</td><td>[0.22, 1.98]</td><td>2006</td></tr> <tr><td>GEICAM 2007</td><td>4</td><td>123</td><td>3</td><td>125</td><td>2.1%</td><td>1.36</td><td>[0.31, 5.83]</td><td>2007</td></tr> <tr><td>Thomas E 2008</td><td>25</td><td>369</td><td>13</td><td>360</td><td>3.6%</td><td>1.92</td><td>[1.00, 3.69]</td><td>2008</td></tr> <tr><td>Albain KS 2008</td><td>3</td><td>261</td><td>4</td><td>260</td><td>2.0%</td><td>0.76</td><td>[0.17, 3.31]</td><td>2008</td></tr> <tr><td>Sparano JA 2010</td><td>12</td><td>595</td><td>36</td><td>603</td><td>3.6%</td><td>0.34</td><td>[0.10, 0.64]</td><td>2010</td></tr> <tr><td>Nielsen DL 2011</td><td>9</td><td>167</td><td>13</td><td>164</td><td>3.4%</td><td>0.68</td><td>[0.30, 1.55]</td><td>2011</td></tr> <tr><td>Pallis AG 2012</td><td>0</td><td>74</td><td>1</td><td>74</td><td>0.7%</td><td>0.33</td><td>[0.01, 8.05]</td><td>2012</td></tr> <tr><td>Harvey VJ 2013</td><td>2</td><td>39</td><td>2</td><td>42</td><td>1.5%</td><td>1.08</td><td>[0.16, 7.28]</td><td>2013</td></tr> <tr><td>Total (95% CI)</td><td></td><td>4426</td><td></td><td>4819</td><td>100.0%</td><td>1.18</td><td>[0.89, 1.56]</td><td></td></tr> <tr><td>Total events</td><td></td><td>546</td><td></td><td>525</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></tr> <tr><td>Heterogeneity: Tau² = 0.43, Chi² = 181.51, df = 33 (P < 0.00001), I² = 82%</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></tr> <tr><td>Test for overall effect: Z = 1.13 (P = 0.26)</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></tr> </tbody> </table>					Study of Subgroup	Combination		Single agent		Weight	Risk Ratio		Year	Events	Total	Events	Total	M, H, Random, 95% CI	Year	Carmo-Pereira 1980	30	68	67	67	4.6%	0.45	[0.34, 0.58]	1980	Steiner R 1993	47	54	42	53	4.7%	1.10	[0.92, 1.30]	1993	Ingle J 1985	12	77	11	74	3.6%	1.05	[0.49, 2.23]	1985	Gundersen S 1988	43	88	4	82	3.0%	10.10	[3.85, 26.48]	1988	Andersson M 1996	20	39	9	42	3.7%	2.69	[1.34, 5.39]	1996	Vaugn CB 1989	2	56	10	59	2.1%	0.21	[0.05, 0.92]	1989	Ingle J 1989	31	90	30	95	4.3%	1.08	[0.72, 1.65]	1989	Falkson G 1990	6	52	2	51	1.9%	2.94	[0.62, 13.90]	1990	Fraser S 1993	10	19	0	21	0.8%	23.10	[1.45, 369.28]	1993	Joensuu H 1998	50	149	18	151	4.2%	2.02	[1.73, 4.59]	1998	Nabholz JM 1999	9	187	14	200	3.4%	0.69	[0.30, 1.55]	1999	Bishop J 1999	8	102	1	107	1.3%	8.39	[1.07, 65.92]	1999	Sjostrom J 1999	11	139	6	140	3.0%	1.05	[0.70, 4.85]	1999	Takayama T (A) 2000	0	54	1	57	0.7%	0.35	[0.01, 8.45]	2000	Norris B 2000	29	151	45	149	4.3%	0.64	[0.42, 0.96]	2000	O'Shaughnessy J 2001	3	32	7	81	2.4%	0.82	[0.23, 2.95]	2001	ANZROG 2001	63	190	62	192	4.5%	0.88	[0.84, 1.17]	2001	O'Shaughnessy J 2002	5	255	15	251	3.0%	0.33	[0.12, 0.89]	2002	Berth D 2002	24	90	17	91	4.8%	1.43	[0.82, 2.47]	2002	Heidermann E 2002	37	125	9	131	3.7%	4.31	[2.17, 8.56]	2002	Bonnetere J 2002	5	90	4	86	2.4%	1.19	[0.33, 4.30]	2002	Sledge G (A) 2003	10	115	15	224	3.5%	1.30	[0.60, 2.80]	2003	Sledge G (B) 2003	10	115	6	229	3.0%	3.32	[1.24, 8.91]	2003	Heidermann E 2004	5	85	5	85	2.5%	1.00	[0.30, 3.23]	2004	Ejlertsen B 2004	12	193	41	194	3.9%	0.29	[0.16, 0.54]	2004	Ichi F 2005	15	96	1	97	1.4%	15.16	[2.04, 112.49]	2005	Stockler M 2006	4	109	12	214	2.7%	0.65	[0.22, 1.98]	2006	GEICAM 2007	4	123	3	125	2.1%	1.36	[0.31, 5.83]	2007	Thomas E 2008	25	369	13	360	3.6%	1.92	[1.00, 3.69]	2008	Albain KS 2008	3	261	4	260	2.0%	0.76	[0.17, 3.31]	2008	Sparano JA 2010	12	595	36	603	3.6%	0.34	[0.10, 0.64]	2010	Nielsen DL 2011	9	167	13	164	3.4%	0.68	[0.30, 1.55]	2011	Pallis AG 2012	0	74	1	74	0.7%	0.33	[0.01, 8.05]	2012	Harvey VJ 2013	2	39	2	42	1.5%	1.08	[0.16, 7.28]	2013	Total (95% CI)		4426		4819	100.0%	1.18	[0.89, 1.56]		Total events		546		525					Heterogeneity: Tau ² = 0.43, Chi ² = 181.51, df = 33 (P < 0.00001), I ² = 82%									Test for overall effect: Z = 1.13 (P = 0.26)								
Study of Subgroup	Combination		Single agent		Weight		Risk Ratio		Year																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																	
	Events	Total	Events	Total		M, H, Random, 95% CI	Year																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																			
Carmo-Pereira 1980	30	68	67	67	4.6%	0.45	[0.34, 0.58]	1980																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																		
Steiner R 1993	47	54	42	53	4.7%	1.10	[0.92, 1.30]	1993																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																		
Ingle J 1985	12	77	11	74	3.6%	1.05	[0.49, 2.23]	1985																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																		
Gundersen S 1988	43	88	4	82	3.0%	10.10	[3.85, 26.48]	1988																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																		
Andersson M 1996	20	39	9	42	3.7%	2.69	[1.34, 5.39]	1996																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																		
Vaugn CB 1989	2	56	10	59	2.1%	0.21	[0.05, 0.92]	1989																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																		
Ingle J 1989	31	90	30	95	4.3%	1.08	[0.72, 1.65]	1989																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																		
Falkson G 1990	6	52	2	51	1.9%	2.94	[0.62, 13.90]	1990																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																		
Fraser S 1993	10	19	0	21	0.8%	23.10	[1.45, 369.28]	1993																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																		
Joensuu H 1998	50	149	18	151	4.2%	2.02	[1.73, 4.59]	1998																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																		
Nabholz JM 1999	9	187	14	200	3.4%	0.69	[0.30, 1.55]	1999																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																		
Bishop J 1999	8	102	1	107	1.3%	8.39	[1.07, 65.92]	1999																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																		
Sjostrom J 1999	11	139	6	140	3.0%	1.05	[0.70, 4.85]	1999																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																		
Takayama T (A) 2000	0	54	1	57	0.7%	0.35	[0.01, 8.45]	2000																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																		
Norris B 2000	29	151	45	149	4.3%	0.64	[0.42, 0.96]	2000																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																		
O'Shaughnessy J 2001	3	32	7	81	2.4%	0.82	[0.23, 2.95]	2001																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																		
ANZROG 2001	63	190	62	192	4.5%	0.88	[0.84, 1.17]	2001																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																		
O'Shaughnessy J 2002	5	255	15	251	3.0%	0.33	[0.12, 0.89]	2002																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																		
Berth D 2002	24	90	17	91	4.8%	1.43	[0.82, 2.47]	2002																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																		
Heidermann E 2002	37	125	9	131	3.7%	4.31	[2.17, 8.56]	2002																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																		
Bonnetere J 2002	5	90	4	86	2.4%	1.19	[0.33, 4.30]	2002																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																		
Sledge G (A) 2003	10	115	15	224	3.5%	1.30	[0.60, 2.80]	2003																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																		
Sledge G (B) 2003	10	115	6	229	3.0%	3.32	[1.24, 8.91]	2003																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																		
Heidermann E 2004	5	85	5	85	2.5%	1.00	[0.30, 3.23]	2004																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																		
Ejlertsen B 2004	12	193	41	194	3.9%	0.29	[0.16, 0.54]	2004																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																		
Ichi F 2005	15	96	1	97	1.4%	15.16	[2.04, 112.49]	2005																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																		
Stockler M 2006	4	109	12	214	2.7%	0.65	[0.22, 1.98]	2006																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																		
GEICAM 2007	4	123	3	125	2.1%	1.36	[0.31, 5.83]	2007																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																		
Thomas E 2008	25	369	13	360	3.6%	1.92	[1.00, 3.69]	2008																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																		
Albain KS 2008	3	261	4	260	2.0%	0.76	[0.17, 3.31]	2008																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																		
Sparano JA 2010	12	595	36	603	3.6%	0.34	[0.10, 0.64]	2010																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																		
Nielsen DL 2011	9	167	13	164	3.4%	0.68	[0.30, 1.55]	2011																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																		
Pallis AG 2012	0	74	1	74	0.7%	0.33	[0.01, 8.05]	2012																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																		
Harvey VJ 2013	2	39	2	42	1.5%	1.08	[0.16, 7.28]	2013																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																		
Total (95% CI)		4426		4819	100.0%	1.18	[0.89, 1.56]																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																			
Total events		546		525																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																						
Heterogeneity: Tau ² = 0.43, Chi ² = 181.51, df = 33 (P < 0.00001), I ² = 82%																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																										
Test for overall effect: Z = 1.13 (P = 0.26)																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																										
	<p>コメント: Grade 3以上の嘔気、嘔吐出現頻度については併用療法と単剤療法で統計学的な差は認められていない。異質性が認められるが、使用薬剤の毒性プロファイルによる可能性がある。</p>																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																									
Funnel plot																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																										
	<p>コメント: 出版バイアスの評価については、明らかな非対称性は認められない。</p>																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																									
その他の解析	施行せず				コメント:																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																					
メタリグレーション																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																										
感度分析																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																										

【4-9 メタアナリシス】

CQ		HER2陰性転移・再発乳癌に対する化学療法は単剤か併用かどちらが推奨されるか？																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																										
P	HER2陰性転移・再発乳癌	I	併用療法（化学療法）																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																									
C	単剤療法（化学療法）	O	Toxicity; white cell count																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																									
研究デザイン	RCT	文献数	36	コード Cochrane 2009 (45) Albain KS 2008 Sparano JA 2010 Nielsen DL 2011 Pallis AG 2012 Harvey VJ 2013																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																								
モデル	Random Effect	方法	Mantel-Haenszel method (RevMan5.3)																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																									
効果指標	リスク比	統合値	1.69 (1.36 - 2.11) P= <0.00001																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																									
Forest plot	<table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Study or Subgroup</th> <th>Events</th> <th>Total</th> <th>Events</th> <th>Total</th> <th>Weight</th> <th>M-H, Random, 95% CI</th> <th>Year</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr><td>Canellos GP 1976</td><td>37</td><td>93</td><td>7</td><td>91</td><td>2.4%</td><td>5.17 [2.43, 11.00]</td><td>1976</td></tr> <tr><td>Eagan RT 1976</td><td>18</td><td>20</td><td>16</td><td>19</td><td>3.2%</td><td>1.07 [0.84, 1.36]</td><td>1976</td></tr> <tr><td>Hoogstraaten B (B) 1976</td><td>30</td><td>106</td><td>13</td><td>40</td><td>2.0%</td><td>0.87 [0.51, 1.49]</td><td>1976</td></tr> <tr><td>Hoogstraaten B (A) 1976</td><td>40</td><td>98</td><td>12</td><td>39</td><td>2.8%</td><td>1.33 [0.78, 2.25]</td><td>1976</td></tr> <tr><td>Mouridsen HT 1977</td><td>4</td><td>27</td><td>1</td><td>24</td><td>0.8%</td><td>3.56 [0.43, 29.66]</td><td>1977</td></tr> <tr><td>Carmo-Pereira 1980</td><td>7</td><td>68</td><td>0</td><td>67</td><td>0.5%</td><td>14.78 [0.88, 253.79]</td><td>1980</td></tr> <tr><td>Steiner R 1982</td><td>10</td><td>54</td><td>3</td><td>53</td><td>1.6%</td><td>3.27 [0.95, 11.23]</td><td>1983</td></tr> <tr><td>Ingle J 1985</td><td>53</td><td>67</td><td>62</td><td>70</td><td>3.3%</td><td>0.89 [0.77, 1.04]</td><td>1985</td></tr> <tr><td>Vaughn CB 1988</td><td>32</td><td>56</td><td>16</td><td>59</td><td>2.9%</td><td>2.11 [1.31, 3.39]</td><td>1988</td></tr> <tr><td>Ingle J 1989</td><td>75</td><td>87</td><td>61</td><td>91</td><td>3.2%</td><td>1.29 [1.09, 1.52]</td><td>1989</td></tr> <tr><td>Falkson O 1990</td><td>22</td><td>52</td><td>48</td><td>51</td><td>3.1%</td><td>0.45 [0.32, 0.62]</td><td>1990</td></tr> <tr><td>Joensuu H 1998</td><td>41</td><td>149</td><td>16</td><td>151</td><td>2.9%</td><td>2.60 [1.52, 4.42]</td><td>1998</td></tr> <tr><td>Gleib J 1999</td><td>66</td><td>102</td><td>29</td><td>107</td><td>3.1%</td><td>2.39 [1.70, 3.26]</td><td>1999</td></tr> <tr><td>Nabholz JM 1999</td><td>176</td><td>187</td><td>188</td><td>200</td><td>3.3%</td><td>1.00 [0.95, 1.05]</td><td>1999</td></tr> <tr><td>Sjostrom J 1999</td><td>22</td><td>139</td><td>108</td><td>140</td><td>3.0%</td><td>0.21 [0.14, 0.30]</td><td>1999</td></tr> <tr><td>Venturino A (B) 2000</td><td>1</td><td>32</td><td>3</td><td>17</td><td>0.0%</td><td>0.18 [0.02, 1.58]</td><td>2000</td></tr> <tr><td>Venturino A (A) 2000</td><td>1</td><td>33</td><td>3</td><td>16</td><td>0.8%</td><td>0.16 [0.02, 1.43]</td><td>2000</td></tr> <tr><td>Takayama T (A) 2000</td><td>12</td><td>27</td><td>0</td><td>57</td><td>0.5%</td><td>51.79 [2.18, 843.53]</td><td>2000</td></tr> <tr><td>Nielsen D 2000</td><td>60</td><td>65</td><td>59</td><td>74</td><td>3.2%</td><td>1.16 [1.01, 1.32]</td><td>2000</td></tr> <tr><td>Nams B 2000</td><td>132</td><td>151</td><td>129</td><td>149</td><td>3.3%</td><td>1.01 [0.85, 1.19]</td><td>2000</td></tr> <tr><td>Takayama T (B) 2000</td><td>12</td><td>27</td><td>24</td><td>55</td><td>2.8%</td><td>1.02 [0.61, 1.71]</td><td>2000</td></tr> <tr><td>ANZCOG 2001</td><td>60</td><td>190</td><td>56</td><td>192</td><td>3.1%</td><td>1.08 [0.80, 1.47]</td><td>2001</td></tr> <tr><td>O'Shaughnessy J 2001</td><td>13</td><td>22</td><td>5</td><td>61</td><td>2.1%</td><td>4.96 [1.94, 12.67]</td><td>2001</td></tr> <tr><td>O'Shaughnessy J 2002</td><td>40</td><td>251</td><td>38</td><td>255</td><td>3.0%</td><td>1.07 [0.71, 1.61]</td><td>2002</td></tr> <tr><td>Berruti D 2002</td><td>14</td><td>90</td><td>2</td><td>91</td><td>1.4%</td><td>7.08 [1.66, 30.25]</td><td>2002</td></tr> <tr><td>Bonnet-Bene J 2002</td><td>60</td><td>90</td><td>95</td><td>96</td><td>3.2%</td><td>0.89 [0.73, 1.07]</td><td>2002</td></tr> <tr><td>Sledge G (A) 2003</td><td>63</td><td>115</td><td>111</td><td>224</td><td>3.2%</td><td>1.11 [0.89, 1.37]</td><td>2003</td></tr> <tr><td>Sledge G (B) 2003</td><td>63</td><td>115</td><td>137</td><td>229</td><td>3.2%</td><td>0.82 [0.75, 1.12]</td><td>2003</td></tr> <tr><td>Ejlertsen B 2004</td><td>97</td><td>192</td><td>23</td><td>194</td><td>3.0%</td><td>4.24 [2.82, 6.38]</td><td>2004</td></tr> <tr><td>Heidemann E 2004</td><td>76</td><td>85</td><td>53</td><td>85</td><td>3.2%</td><td>1.43 [1.20, 1.72]</td><td>2004</td></tr> <tr><td>Ich F 2005</td><td>17</td><td>98</td><td>9</td><td>97</td><td>2.4%</td><td>1.91 [0.90, 4.07]</td><td>2005</td></tr> <tr><td>Stockler M 2006</td><td>24</td><td>109</td><td>3</td><td>214</td><td>1.7%</td><td>15.71 [4.84, 51.01]</td><td>2006</td></tr> <tr><td>GEICAM 2007</td><td>75</td><td>123</td><td>55</td><td>125</td><td>3.2%</td><td>1.39 [1.09, 1.77]</td><td>2007</td></tr> <tr><td>Thomas E 2008</td><td>210</td><td>369</td><td>21</td><td>368</td><td>2.9%</td><td>9.97 [6.52, 15.25]</td><td>2008</td></tr> <tr><td>Albain KS 2008</td><td>125</td><td>261</td><td>30</td><td>260</td><td>3.0%</td><td>4.15 [2.80, 6.30]</td><td>2008</td></tr> <tr><td>Papadimitriou CA 2009</td><td>7</td><td>39</td><td>3</td><td>30</td><td>1.6%</td><td>1.79 [0.51, 6.37]</td><td>2009</td></tr> <tr><td>Sparano JA 2010</td><td>372</td><td>595</td><td>43</td><td>603</td><td>3.1%</td><td>8.77 [6.53, 11.77]</td><td>2010</td></tr> <tr><td>Nielsen DL 2011</td><td>125</td><td>167</td><td>113</td><td>164</td><td>3.3%</td><td>1.09 [0.95, 1.24]</td><td>2011</td></tr> <tr><td>Pallis AG 2012</td><td>17</td><td>74</td><td>3</td><td>74</td><td>1.7%</td><td>5.87 [1.73, 19.52]</td><td>2012</td></tr> <tr><td>Harvey VJ 2013</td><td>13</td><td>39</td><td>3</td><td>42</td><td>1.7%</td><td>4.87 [1.44, 15.15]</td><td>2013</td></tr> <tr><td>Total (95% CI)</td><td></td><td>4873</td><td></td><td>4984</td><td>100.0%</td><td>1.69 [1.36, 2.11]</td><td></td></tr> <tr><td>Total events</td><td>2322</td><td></td><td>1571</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></tr> <tr><td>Heterogeneity: Tau² = 0.38, Chi² = 1149.53, df = 39 (P < 0.00001), I² = 97%</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></tr> <tr><td>Test for overall effect: Z = 4.71 (P = 0.00001)</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></tr> </tbody> </table>				Study or Subgroup	Events	Total	Events	Total	Weight	M-H, Random, 95% CI	Year	Canellos GP 1976	37	93	7	91	2.4%	5.17 [2.43, 11.00]	1976	Eagan RT 1976	18	20	16	19	3.2%	1.07 [0.84, 1.36]	1976	Hoogstraaten B (B) 1976	30	106	13	40	2.0%	0.87 [0.51, 1.49]	1976	Hoogstraaten B (A) 1976	40	98	12	39	2.8%	1.33 [0.78, 2.25]	1976	Mouridsen HT 1977	4	27	1	24	0.8%	3.56 [0.43, 29.66]	1977	Carmo-Pereira 1980	7	68	0	67	0.5%	14.78 [0.88, 253.79]	1980	Steiner R 1982	10	54	3	53	1.6%	3.27 [0.95, 11.23]	1983	Ingle J 1985	53	67	62	70	3.3%	0.89 [0.77, 1.04]	1985	Vaughn CB 1988	32	56	16	59	2.9%	2.11 [1.31, 3.39]	1988	Ingle J 1989	75	87	61	91	3.2%	1.29 [1.09, 1.52]	1989	Falkson O 1990	22	52	48	51	3.1%	0.45 [0.32, 0.62]	1990	Joensuu H 1998	41	149	16	151	2.9%	2.60 [1.52, 4.42]	1998	Gleib J 1999	66	102	29	107	3.1%	2.39 [1.70, 3.26]	1999	Nabholz JM 1999	176	187	188	200	3.3%	1.00 [0.95, 1.05]	1999	Sjostrom J 1999	22	139	108	140	3.0%	0.21 [0.14, 0.30]	1999	Venturino A (B) 2000	1	32	3	17	0.0%	0.18 [0.02, 1.58]	2000	Venturino A (A) 2000	1	33	3	16	0.8%	0.16 [0.02, 1.43]	2000	Takayama T (A) 2000	12	27	0	57	0.5%	51.79 [2.18, 843.53]	2000	Nielsen D 2000	60	65	59	74	3.2%	1.16 [1.01, 1.32]	2000	Nams B 2000	132	151	129	149	3.3%	1.01 [0.85, 1.19]	2000	Takayama T (B) 2000	12	27	24	55	2.8%	1.02 [0.61, 1.71]	2000	ANZCOG 2001	60	190	56	192	3.1%	1.08 [0.80, 1.47]	2001	O'Shaughnessy J 2001	13	22	5	61	2.1%	4.96 [1.94, 12.67]	2001	O'Shaughnessy J 2002	40	251	38	255	3.0%	1.07 [0.71, 1.61]	2002	Berruti D 2002	14	90	2	91	1.4%	7.08 [1.66, 30.25]	2002	Bonnet-Bene J 2002	60	90	95	96	3.2%	0.89 [0.73, 1.07]	2002	Sledge G (A) 2003	63	115	111	224	3.2%	1.11 [0.89, 1.37]	2003	Sledge G (B) 2003	63	115	137	229	3.2%	0.82 [0.75, 1.12]	2003	Ejlertsen B 2004	97	192	23	194	3.0%	4.24 [2.82, 6.38]	2004	Heidemann E 2004	76	85	53	85	3.2%	1.43 [1.20, 1.72]	2004	Ich F 2005	17	98	9	97	2.4%	1.91 [0.90, 4.07]	2005	Stockler M 2006	24	109	3	214	1.7%	15.71 [4.84, 51.01]	2006	GEICAM 2007	75	123	55	125	3.2%	1.39 [1.09, 1.77]	2007	Thomas E 2008	210	369	21	368	2.9%	9.97 [6.52, 15.25]	2008	Albain KS 2008	125	261	30	260	3.0%	4.15 [2.80, 6.30]	2008	Papadimitriou CA 2009	7	39	3	30	1.6%	1.79 [0.51, 6.37]	2009	Sparano JA 2010	372	595	43	603	3.1%	8.77 [6.53, 11.77]	2010	Nielsen DL 2011	125	167	113	164	3.3%	1.09 [0.95, 1.24]	2011	Pallis AG 2012	17	74	3	74	1.7%	5.87 [1.73, 19.52]	2012	Harvey VJ 2013	13	39	3	42	1.7%	4.87 [1.44, 15.15]	2013	Total (95% CI)		4873		4984	100.0%	1.69 [1.36, 2.11]		Total events	2322		1571					Heterogeneity: Tau ² = 0.38, Chi ² = 1149.53, df = 39 (P < 0.00001), I ² = 97%								Test for overall effect: Z = 4.71 (P = 0.00001)							
Study or Subgroup	Events	Total	Events	Total	Weight	M-H, Random, 95% CI	Year																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																					
Canellos GP 1976	37	93	7	91	2.4%	5.17 [2.43, 11.00]	1976																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																					
Eagan RT 1976	18	20	16	19	3.2%	1.07 [0.84, 1.36]	1976																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																					
Hoogstraaten B (B) 1976	30	106	13	40	2.0%	0.87 [0.51, 1.49]	1976																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																					
Hoogstraaten B (A) 1976	40	98	12	39	2.8%	1.33 [0.78, 2.25]	1976																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																					
Mouridsen HT 1977	4	27	1	24	0.8%	3.56 [0.43, 29.66]	1977																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																					
Carmo-Pereira 1980	7	68	0	67	0.5%	14.78 [0.88, 253.79]	1980																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																					
Steiner R 1982	10	54	3	53	1.6%	3.27 [0.95, 11.23]	1983																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																					
Ingle J 1985	53	67	62	70	3.3%	0.89 [0.77, 1.04]	1985																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																					
Vaughn CB 1988	32	56	16	59	2.9%	2.11 [1.31, 3.39]	1988																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																					
Ingle J 1989	75	87	61	91	3.2%	1.29 [1.09, 1.52]	1989																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																					
Falkson O 1990	22	52	48	51	3.1%	0.45 [0.32, 0.62]	1990																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																					
Joensuu H 1998	41	149	16	151	2.9%	2.60 [1.52, 4.42]	1998																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																					
Gleib J 1999	66	102	29	107	3.1%	2.39 [1.70, 3.26]	1999																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																					
Nabholz JM 1999	176	187	188	200	3.3%	1.00 [0.95, 1.05]	1999																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																					
Sjostrom J 1999	22	139	108	140	3.0%	0.21 [0.14, 0.30]	1999																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																					
Venturino A (B) 2000	1	32	3	17	0.0%	0.18 [0.02, 1.58]	2000																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																					
Venturino A (A) 2000	1	33	3	16	0.8%	0.16 [0.02, 1.43]	2000																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																					
Takayama T (A) 2000	12	27	0	57	0.5%	51.79 [2.18, 843.53]	2000																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																					
Nielsen D 2000	60	65	59	74	3.2%	1.16 [1.01, 1.32]	2000																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																					
Nams B 2000	132	151	129	149	3.3%	1.01 [0.85, 1.19]	2000																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																					
Takayama T (B) 2000	12	27	24	55	2.8%	1.02 [0.61, 1.71]	2000																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																					
ANZCOG 2001	60	190	56	192	3.1%	1.08 [0.80, 1.47]	2001																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																					
O'Shaughnessy J 2001	13	22	5	61	2.1%	4.96 [1.94, 12.67]	2001																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																					
O'Shaughnessy J 2002	40	251	38	255	3.0%	1.07 [0.71, 1.61]	2002																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																					
Berruti D 2002	14	90	2	91	1.4%	7.08 [1.66, 30.25]	2002																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																					
Bonnet-Bene J 2002	60	90	95	96	3.2%	0.89 [0.73, 1.07]	2002																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																					
Sledge G (A) 2003	63	115	111	224	3.2%	1.11 [0.89, 1.37]	2003																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																					
Sledge G (B) 2003	63	115	137	229	3.2%	0.82 [0.75, 1.12]	2003																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																					
Ejlertsen B 2004	97	192	23	194	3.0%	4.24 [2.82, 6.38]	2004																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																					
Heidemann E 2004	76	85	53	85	3.2%	1.43 [1.20, 1.72]	2004																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																					
Ich F 2005	17	98	9	97	2.4%	1.91 [0.90, 4.07]	2005																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																					
Stockler M 2006	24	109	3	214	1.7%	15.71 [4.84, 51.01]	2006																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																					
GEICAM 2007	75	123	55	125	3.2%	1.39 [1.09, 1.77]	2007																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																					
Thomas E 2008	210	369	21	368	2.9%	9.97 [6.52, 15.25]	2008																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																					
Albain KS 2008	125	261	30	260	3.0%	4.15 [2.80, 6.30]	2008																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																					
Papadimitriou CA 2009	7	39	3	30	1.6%	1.79 [0.51, 6.37]	2009																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																					
Sparano JA 2010	372	595	43	603	3.1%	8.77 [6.53, 11.77]	2010																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																					
Nielsen DL 2011	125	167	113	164	3.3%	1.09 [0.95, 1.24]	2011																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																					
Pallis AG 2012	17	74	3	74	1.7%	5.87 [1.73, 19.52]	2012																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																					
Harvey VJ 2013	13	39	3	42	1.7%	4.87 [1.44, 15.15]	2013																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																					
Total (95% CI)		4873		4984	100.0%	1.69 [1.36, 2.11]																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																						
Total events	2322		1571																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																									
Heterogeneity: Tau ² = 0.38, Chi ² = 1149.53, df = 39 (P < 0.00001), I ² = 97%																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Test for overall effect: Z = 4.71 (P = 0.00001)																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
	<p>コメント: Grade 3以上の白血球減少症は併用群で有意に高く、リスク比1.69(95%信頼区間: 1.36-2.11)、P<0.00001であった。異質性が認められ、使用薬剤の毒性プロファイルによる可能性がある。</p>																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																											
Funnel plot																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
	<p>コメント: 出版バイアスの評価については、明らかな非対称性は認められない。</p>																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																											
その他の解析	施行せず			コメント:																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																								
メタリグレーション																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
感度分析																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												

【4-9 メタアナリシス】

CQ		HER2陰性転移・再発乳癌に対する化学療法は単剤か併用かどちらが推奨されるか？																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																							
P	HER2陰性転移・再発乳癌	I	併用療法（化学療法）																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																						
C	単剤療法（化学療法）	O	Toxicity; alopecia																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																						
研究デザイン	RCT	文献数	24	コード	Cochrane 2009 (21) Albain KS 2008 Papadimitriou CA 2009 Sparano JA 2010 Nielsen DL 2011																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																				
モデル	Random Effect	方法	Mantel-Haenszel method (RevMan5.3)																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																						
効果指標	リスク比	統合値	1.15 (0.91 - 1.47) P= 0.25																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																						
Forest plot	<table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th rowspan="2">Study or Subgroup</th> <th colspan="2">Combination</th> <th colspan="2">Single agent</th> <th rowspan="2">Weight</th> <th colspan="2">Risk Ratio</th> <th rowspan="2">Year</th> </tr> <tr> <th>Events</th> <th>Total</th> <th>Events</th> <th>Total</th> <th>M-H, Random, 95% CI</th> <th></th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr><td>Eagan RT 1976</td><td>19</td><td>20</td><td>17</td><td>19</td><td>5.7%</td><td>1.06</td><td>[0.88, 1.28]</td><td>1976</td></tr> <tr><td>Hoogstraten B (A) 1976</td><td>5</td><td>98</td><td>23</td><td>39</td><td>3.3%</td><td>0.09</td><td>[0.04, 0.21]</td><td>1976</td></tr> <tr><td>Hoogstraten B (B) 1976</td><td>13</td><td>106</td><td>24</td><td>40</td><td>4.5%</td><td>0.20</td><td>[0.12, 0.36]</td><td>1976</td></tr> <tr><td>Mouridsen HT 1977</td><td>21</td><td>27</td><td>8</td><td>24</td><td>4.3%</td><td>2.33</td><td>[1.28, 4.25]</td><td>1977</td></tr> <tr><td>Carmo-Pereira 1980</td><td>59</td><td>68</td><td>0</td><td>67</td><td>0.7%</td><td>117.28</td><td>[7.40, 1858.88]</td><td>1980</td></tr> <tr><td>Steiner R 1983</td><td>47</td><td>54</td><td>44</td><td>53</td><td>5.8%</td><td>1.05</td><td>[0.89, 1.23]</td><td>1983</td></tr> <tr><td>Ingle J 1985</td><td>26</td><td>77</td><td>41</td><td>74</td><td>5.2%</td><td>0.61</td><td>[0.42, 0.89]</td><td>1985</td></tr> <tr><td>Gundersen S 1986</td><td>52</td><td>66</td><td>5</td><td>62</td><td>3.4%</td><td>9.77</td><td>[4.18, 22.85]</td><td>1986</td></tr> <tr><td>Vaughn CB 1988</td><td>56</td><td>56</td><td>57</td><td>59</td><td>5.9%</td><td>1.03</td><td>[0.98, 1.10]</td><td>1988</td></tr> <tr><td>Joensuu H 1998</td><td>105</td><td>149</td><td>19</td><td>151</td><td>5.0%</td><td>5.60</td><td>[3.63, 8.64]</td><td>1998</td></tr> <tr><td>Sjostrom J 1999</td><td>17</td><td>139</td><td>74</td><td>140</td><td>4.8%</td><td>0.23</td><td>[0.14, 0.37]</td><td>1999</td></tr> <tr><td>Bishop J 1999</td><td>24</td><td>102</td><td>81</td><td>107</td><td>5.2%</td><td>0.31</td><td>[0.22, 0.45]</td><td>1999</td></tr> <tr><td>Norris B 2000</td><td>33</td><td>151</td><td>36</td><td>149</td><td>5.0%</td><td>0.90</td><td>[0.60, 1.37]</td><td>2000</td></tr> <tr><td>O'Shaughnessy J 2001</td><td>1</td><td>32</td><td>0</td><td>61</td><td>0.5%</td><td>5.64</td><td>[0.24, 134.54]</td><td>2001</td></tr> <tr><td>ANZCTG 2001</td><td>131</td><td>190</td><td>83</td><td>192</td><td>5.7%</td><td>1.59</td><td>[1.32, 1.93]</td><td>2001</td></tr> <tr><td>Heidemann E 2002</td><td>77</td><td>125</td><td>6</td><td>131</td><td>3.6%</td><td>13.45</td><td>[6.08, 29.75]</td><td>2002</td></tr> <tr><td>O'Shaughnessy J 2002</td><td>18</td><td>255</td><td>15</td><td>251</td><td>4.1%</td><td>1.18</td><td>[0.61, 2.29]</td><td>2002</td></tr> <tr><td>Bonneterre J 2002</td><td>7</td><td>90</td><td>38</td><td>86</td><td>3.8%</td><td>0.18</td><td>[0.08, 0.37]</td><td>2002</td></tr> <tr><td>Stockler M 2006</td><td>2</td><td>109</td><td>1</td><td>214</td><td>0.9%</td><td>3.93</td><td>[0.36, 42.83]</td><td>2006</td></tr> <tr><td>GEICAM 2007</td><td>21</td><td>123</td><td>21</td><td>125</td><td>4.5%</td><td>1.02</td><td>[0.59, 1.76]</td><td>2007</td></tr> <tr><td>Thomas E 2008</td><td>27</td><td>369</td><td>3</td><td>368</td><td>2.4%</td><td>8.98</td><td>[2.75, 29.33]</td><td>2008</td></tr> <tr><td>Albain KS 2008</td><td>211</td><td>261</td><td>214</td><td>260</td><td>5.9%</td><td>0.98</td><td>[0.91, 1.07]</td><td>2008</td></tr> <tr><td>Papadimitriou CA 2009</td><td>9</td><td>39</td><td>4</td><td>30</td><td>2.7%</td><td>1.73</td><td>[0.59, 5.08]</td><td>2009</td></tr> <tr><td>Sparano JA 2010</td><td>174</td><td>595</td><td>1</td><td>603</td><td>1.2%</td><td>176.34</td><td>[24.78, 1254.80]</td><td>2010</td></tr> <tr><td>Nielsen DL 2011</td><td>145</td><td>167</td><td>139</td><td>164</td><td>5.9%</td><td>1.02</td><td>[0.94, 1.12]</td><td>2011</td></tr> <tr><td>Total (95% CI)</td><td></td><td>3468</td><td></td><td>3469</td><td>100.0%</td><td>1.15</td><td>[0.91, 1.47]</td><td></td></tr> <tr><td>Total events</td><td></td><td>1300</td><td></td><td>954</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></tr> <tr><td>Heterogeneity: Tau² = 0.25; Chi² = 555.05, df = 24 (P < 0.00001); I² = 96%</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></tr> <tr><td>Test for overall effect: Z = 1.15 (P = 0.25)</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></tr> </tbody> </table>					Study or Subgroup	Combination		Single agent		Weight	Risk Ratio		Year	Events	Total	Events	Total	M-H, Random, 95% CI		Eagan RT 1976	19	20	17	19	5.7%	1.06	[0.88, 1.28]	1976	Hoogstraten B (A) 1976	5	98	23	39	3.3%	0.09	[0.04, 0.21]	1976	Hoogstraten B (B) 1976	13	106	24	40	4.5%	0.20	[0.12, 0.36]	1976	Mouridsen HT 1977	21	27	8	24	4.3%	2.33	[1.28, 4.25]	1977	Carmo-Pereira 1980	59	68	0	67	0.7%	117.28	[7.40, 1858.88]	1980	Steiner R 1983	47	54	44	53	5.8%	1.05	[0.89, 1.23]	1983	Ingle J 1985	26	77	41	74	5.2%	0.61	[0.42, 0.89]	1985	Gundersen S 1986	52	66	5	62	3.4%	9.77	[4.18, 22.85]	1986	Vaughn CB 1988	56	56	57	59	5.9%	1.03	[0.98, 1.10]	1988	Joensuu H 1998	105	149	19	151	5.0%	5.60	[3.63, 8.64]	1998	Sjostrom J 1999	17	139	74	140	4.8%	0.23	[0.14, 0.37]	1999	Bishop J 1999	24	102	81	107	5.2%	0.31	[0.22, 0.45]	1999	Norris B 2000	33	151	36	149	5.0%	0.90	[0.60, 1.37]	2000	O'Shaughnessy J 2001	1	32	0	61	0.5%	5.64	[0.24, 134.54]	2001	ANZCTG 2001	131	190	83	192	5.7%	1.59	[1.32, 1.93]	2001	Heidemann E 2002	77	125	6	131	3.6%	13.45	[6.08, 29.75]	2002	O'Shaughnessy J 2002	18	255	15	251	4.1%	1.18	[0.61, 2.29]	2002	Bonneterre J 2002	7	90	38	86	3.8%	0.18	[0.08, 0.37]	2002	Stockler M 2006	2	109	1	214	0.9%	3.93	[0.36, 42.83]	2006	GEICAM 2007	21	123	21	125	4.5%	1.02	[0.59, 1.76]	2007	Thomas E 2008	27	369	3	368	2.4%	8.98	[2.75, 29.33]	2008	Albain KS 2008	211	261	214	260	5.9%	0.98	[0.91, 1.07]	2008	Papadimitriou CA 2009	9	39	4	30	2.7%	1.73	[0.59, 5.08]	2009	Sparano JA 2010	174	595	1	603	1.2%	176.34	[24.78, 1254.80]	2010	Nielsen DL 2011	145	167	139	164	5.9%	1.02	[0.94, 1.12]	2011	Total (95% CI)		3468		3469	100.0%	1.15	[0.91, 1.47]		Total events		1300		954					Heterogeneity: Tau ² = 0.25; Chi ² = 555.05, df = 24 (P < 0.00001); I ² = 96%									Test for overall effect: Z = 1.15 (P = 0.25)								
Study or Subgroup	Combination		Single agent		Weight		Risk Ratio		Year																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																
	Events	Total	Events	Total		M-H, Random, 95% CI																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																			
Eagan RT 1976	19	20	17	19	5.7%	1.06	[0.88, 1.28]	1976																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																	
Hoogstraten B (A) 1976	5	98	23	39	3.3%	0.09	[0.04, 0.21]	1976																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																	
Hoogstraten B (B) 1976	13	106	24	40	4.5%	0.20	[0.12, 0.36]	1976																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																	
Mouridsen HT 1977	21	27	8	24	4.3%	2.33	[1.28, 4.25]	1977																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																	
Carmo-Pereira 1980	59	68	0	67	0.7%	117.28	[7.40, 1858.88]	1980																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																	
Steiner R 1983	47	54	44	53	5.8%	1.05	[0.89, 1.23]	1983																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																	
Ingle J 1985	26	77	41	74	5.2%	0.61	[0.42, 0.89]	1985																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																	
Gundersen S 1986	52	66	5	62	3.4%	9.77	[4.18, 22.85]	1986																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																	
Vaughn CB 1988	56	56	57	59	5.9%	1.03	[0.98, 1.10]	1988																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																	
Joensuu H 1998	105	149	19	151	5.0%	5.60	[3.63, 8.64]	1998																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																	
Sjostrom J 1999	17	139	74	140	4.8%	0.23	[0.14, 0.37]	1999																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																	
Bishop J 1999	24	102	81	107	5.2%	0.31	[0.22, 0.45]	1999																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																	
Norris B 2000	33	151	36	149	5.0%	0.90	[0.60, 1.37]	2000																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																	
O'Shaughnessy J 2001	1	32	0	61	0.5%	5.64	[0.24, 134.54]	2001																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																	
ANZCTG 2001	131	190	83	192	5.7%	1.59	[1.32, 1.93]	2001																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																	
Heidemann E 2002	77	125	6	131	3.6%	13.45	[6.08, 29.75]	2002																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																	
O'Shaughnessy J 2002	18	255	15	251	4.1%	1.18	[0.61, 2.29]	2002																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																	
Bonneterre J 2002	7	90	38	86	3.8%	0.18	[0.08, 0.37]	2002																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																	
Stockler M 2006	2	109	1	214	0.9%	3.93	[0.36, 42.83]	2006																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																	
GEICAM 2007	21	123	21	125	4.5%	1.02	[0.59, 1.76]	2007																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																	
Thomas E 2008	27	369	3	368	2.4%	8.98	[2.75, 29.33]	2008																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																	
Albain KS 2008	211	261	214	260	5.9%	0.98	[0.91, 1.07]	2008																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																	
Papadimitriou CA 2009	9	39	4	30	2.7%	1.73	[0.59, 5.08]	2009																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																	
Sparano JA 2010	174	595	1	603	1.2%	176.34	[24.78, 1254.80]	2010																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																	
Nielsen DL 2011	145	167	139	164	5.9%	1.02	[0.94, 1.12]	2011																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																	
Total (95% CI)		3468		3469	100.0%	1.15	[0.91, 1.47]																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																		
Total events		1300		954																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																					
Heterogeneity: Tau ² = 0.25; Chi ² = 555.05, df = 24 (P < 0.00001); I ² = 96%																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																									
Test for overall effect: Z = 1.15 (P = 0.25)																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																									
	<p>コメント: Grade 2以上の脱毛の出現頻度については併用療法と単剤療法で統計学的な差は認められていない。異質性が認められるが、使用薬剤の毒性プロファイルによる可能性がある。</p>																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																								
Funnel plot																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																									
	<p>コメント: 出版バイアスの評価については、やや非対称性が認められる。</p>																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																								
その他の解析	施行せず				コメント:																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																				
メタリグレーション																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																									
感度分析																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																									

【4-9 メタアナリシス】

CQ		HER2陰性転移・再発乳癌に対する化学療法は単剤か併用かどちらが推奨されるか？																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																		
P	HER2陰性転移・再発乳癌	I	併用療法（化学療法）																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																	
C	単剤療法（化学療法）	O	Toxicity; treatment related death																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																	
研究デザイン	RCT	文献数	27	コード	Cochrane 2009 (45) Albain KS 2008 Papadimitriou CA 2009 Sparano JA 2010 Nielsen DL 2011 Pallis AG 2012																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																															
モデル	Random Effect	方法	Mantel-Haenszel method (RevMan5.3)																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																	
効果指標	リスク比	統合値	1.11 (0.74 - 1.66) P= 0.6																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																	
Forest plot	<table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th rowspan="2">Study or Subgroup</th> <th colspan="2">Combination</th> <th colspan="2">Single agent</th> <th rowspan="2">Weight</th> <th colspan="2">Risk Ratio</th> <th rowspan="2">Year</th> </tr> <tr> <th>Events</th> <th>Total</th> <th>Events</th> <th>Total</th> <th>M-H, Random, 95% CI</th> <th>M-H, Random, 95% CI</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr><td>Rubens RD 1975</td><td>0</td><td>50</td><td>1</td><td>49</td><td>1.6%</td><td>0.33</td><td>[0.01, 7.83]</td><td>1975</td></tr> <tr><td>Eagan RT 1976</td><td>1</td><td>20</td><td>0</td><td>19</td><td>1.6%</td><td>2.86</td><td>[0.12, 66.11]</td><td>1976</td></tr> <tr><td>Steiner R 1983</td><td>1</td><td>54</td><td>1</td><td>53</td><td>2.1%</td><td>0.98</td><td>[0.06, 15.29]</td><td>1983</td></tr> <tr><td>Ingle J 1985</td><td>0</td><td>77</td><td>3</td><td>74</td><td>1.8%</td><td>0.14</td><td>[0.01, 2.61]</td><td>1985</td></tr> <tr><td>Andersson M 1986</td><td>0</td><td>45</td><td>4</td><td>44</td><td>1.9%</td><td>0.11</td><td>[0.01, 1.96]</td><td>1986</td></tr> <tr><td>Vaughn CB 1988</td><td>0</td><td>56</td><td>1</td><td>59</td><td>1.6%</td><td>0.35</td><td>[0.01, 8.44]</td><td>1988</td></tr> <tr><td>Ingle J 1989</td><td>1</td><td>90</td><td>2</td><td>95</td><td>2.8%</td><td>0.53</td><td>[0.05, 5.72]</td><td>1989</td></tr> <tr><td>Nielsen D 1990</td><td>0</td><td>67</td><td>4</td><td>76</td><td>1.9%</td><td>0.13</td><td>[0.01, 2.29]</td><td>1990</td></tr> <tr><td>Erkisi M 1997</td><td>1</td><td>30</td><td>0</td><td>30</td><td>1.6%</td><td>3.00</td><td>[0.13, 70.83]</td><td>1997</td></tr> <tr><td>Nabholz JM 1999</td><td>3</td><td>189</td><td>4</td><td>203</td><td>7.3%</td><td>0.81</td><td>[0.18, 3.55]</td><td>1999</td></tr> <tr><td>Sjostrom J 1999</td><td>1</td><td>139</td><td>3</td><td>143</td><td>3.2%</td><td>0.34</td><td>[0.04, 3.26]</td><td>1999</td></tr> <tr><td>Norris B 2000</td><td>1</td><td>151</td><td>2</td><td>149</td><td>2.8%</td><td>0.49</td><td>[0.05, 5.38]</td><td>2000</td></tr> <tr><td>Nielsen D 2000</td><td>4</td><td>74</td><td>2</td><td>81</td><td>5.8%</td><td>2.19</td><td>[0.41, 11.60]</td><td>2000</td></tr> <tr><td>O'Shaughnessy J 2001</td><td>0</td><td>32</td><td>3</td><td>61</td><td>1.9%</td><td>0.27</td><td>[0.01, 5.04]</td><td>2001</td></tr> <tr><td>O'Shaughnessy J 2002</td><td>4</td><td>251</td><td>1</td><td>255</td><td>3.4%</td><td>4.06</td><td>[0.46, 36.11]</td><td>2002</td></tr> <tr><td>Bonneterre J 2002</td><td>5</td><td>90</td><td>1</td><td>88</td><td>3.5%</td><td>4.89</td><td>[0.58, 41.01]</td><td>2002</td></tr> <tr><td>Berruti D 2002</td><td>3</td><td>92</td><td>3</td><td>93</td><td>6.5%</td><td>1.01</td><td>[0.21, 4.88]</td><td>2002</td></tr> <tr><td>Sledge G (A) 2003</td><td>2</td><td>115</td><td>6</td><td>224</td><td>6.4%</td><td>0.65</td><td>[0.13, 3.17]</td><td>2003</td></tr> <tr><td>Sledge G (B) 2003</td><td>2</td><td>115</td><td>4</td><td>229</td><td>5.7%</td><td>1.00</td><td>[0.19, 5.36]</td><td>2003</td></tr> <tr><td>Ejlertsen B 2004</td><td>8</td><td>193</td><td>3</td><td>194</td><td>9.3%</td><td>2.68</td><td>[0.72, 9.95]</td><td>2004</td></tr> <tr><td>Iclic F 2005</td><td>2</td><td>100</td><td>4</td><td>101</td><td>5.7%</td><td>0.51</td><td>[0.09, 2.70]</td><td>2005</td></tr> <tr><td>GEICAM 2007</td><td>1</td><td>123</td><td>1</td><td>125</td><td>2.1%</td><td>1.02</td><td>[0.06, 16.07]</td><td>2007</td></tr> <tr><td>Thomas E 2008</td><td>12</td><td>369</td><td>3</td><td>368</td><td>10.2%</td><td>3.99</td><td>[1.14, 14.02]</td><td>2008</td></tr> <tr><td>Albain KS 2008</td><td>1</td><td>261</td><td>1</td><td>260</td><td>2.1%</td><td>1.00</td><td>[0.06, 15.84]</td><td>2008</td></tr> <tr><td>Papadimitriou CA 2009</td><td>0</td><td>39</td><td>0</td><td>30</td><td></td><td>Not estimable</td><td></td><td>2009</td></tr> <tr><td>Sparano JA 2010</td><td>4</td><td>595</td><td>2</td><td>603</td><td>5.6%</td><td>2.03</td><td>[0.37, 11.02]</td><td>2010</td></tr> <tr><td>Nielsen DL 2011</td><td>0</td><td>170</td><td>1</td><td>167</td><td>1.6%</td><td>0.33</td><td>[0.01, 7.98]</td><td>2011</td></tr> <tr><td>Pallis AG 2012</td><td>0</td><td>74</td><td>0</td><td>74</td><td></td><td>Not estimable</td><td></td><td>2012</td></tr> <tr><td>Total (95% CI)</td><td></td><td>3661</td><td></td><td>3947</td><td>100.0%</td><td>1.11</td><td>[0.74, 1.66]</td><td></td></tr> <tr><td>Total events</td><td></td><td>57</td><td></td><td>60</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></tr> <tr><td>Heterogeneity: Tau² = 0.00; Chi² = 23.32, df = 25 (P = 0.56); I² = 0%</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></tr> <tr><td>Test for overall effect: Z = 0.52 (P = 0.60)</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></tr> </tbody> </table> <p>コメント： 治療関連死の発現頻度については、異質性は低いが併用療法と単剤療法で統計学的な差は認められていない。</p>					Study or Subgroup	Combination		Single agent		Weight	Risk Ratio		Year	Events	Total	Events	Total	M-H, Random, 95% CI	M-H, Random, 95% CI	Rubens RD 1975	0	50	1	49	1.6%	0.33	[0.01, 7.83]	1975	Eagan RT 1976	1	20	0	19	1.6%	2.86	[0.12, 66.11]	1976	Steiner R 1983	1	54	1	53	2.1%	0.98	[0.06, 15.29]	1983	Ingle J 1985	0	77	3	74	1.8%	0.14	[0.01, 2.61]	1985	Andersson M 1986	0	45	4	44	1.9%	0.11	[0.01, 1.96]	1986	Vaughn CB 1988	0	56	1	59	1.6%	0.35	[0.01, 8.44]	1988	Ingle J 1989	1	90	2	95	2.8%	0.53	[0.05, 5.72]	1989	Nielsen D 1990	0	67	4	76	1.9%	0.13	[0.01, 2.29]	1990	Erkisi M 1997	1	30	0	30	1.6%	3.00	[0.13, 70.83]	1997	Nabholz JM 1999	3	189	4	203	7.3%	0.81	[0.18, 3.55]	1999	Sjostrom J 1999	1	139	3	143	3.2%	0.34	[0.04, 3.26]	1999	Norris B 2000	1	151	2	149	2.8%	0.49	[0.05, 5.38]	2000	Nielsen D 2000	4	74	2	81	5.8%	2.19	[0.41, 11.60]	2000	O'Shaughnessy J 2001	0	32	3	61	1.9%	0.27	[0.01, 5.04]	2001	O'Shaughnessy J 2002	4	251	1	255	3.4%	4.06	[0.46, 36.11]	2002	Bonneterre J 2002	5	90	1	88	3.5%	4.89	[0.58, 41.01]	2002	Berruti D 2002	3	92	3	93	6.5%	1.01	[0.21, 4.88]	2002	Sledge G (A) 2003	2	115	6	224	6.4%	0.65	[0.13, 3.17]	2003	Sledge G (B) 2003	2	115	4	229	5.7%	1.00	[0.19, 5.36]	2003	Ejlertsen B 2004	8	193	3	194	9.3%	2.68	[0.72, 9.95]	2004	Iclic F 2005	2	100	4	101	5.7%	0.51	[0.09, 2.70]	2005	GEICAM 2007	1	123	1	125	2.1%	1.02	[0.06, 16.07]	2007	Thomas E 2008	12	369	3	368	10.2%	3.99	[1.14, 14.02]	2008	Albain KS 2008	1	261	1	260	2.1%	1.00	[0.06, 15.84]	2008	Papadimitriou CA 2009	0	39	0	30		Not estimable		2009	Sparano JA 2010	4	595	2	603	5.6%	2.03	[0.37, 11.02]	2010	Nielsen DL 2011	0	170	1	167	1.6%	0.33	[0.01, 7.98]	2011	Pallis AG 2012	0	74	0	74		Not estimable		2012	Total (95% CI)		3661		3947	100.0%	1.11	[0.74, 1.66]		Total events		57		60					Heterogeneity: Tau ² = 0.00; Chi ² = 23.32, df = 25 (P = 0.56); I ² = 0%									Test for overall effect: Z = 0.52 (P = 0.60)								
Study or Subgroup	Combination		Single agent		Weight		Risk Ratio		Year																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																											
	Events	Total	Events	Total		M-H, Random, 95% CI	M-H, Random, 95% CI																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																													
Rubens RD 1975	0	50	1	49	1.6%	0.33	[0.01, 7.83]	1975																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Eagan RT 1976	1	20	0	19	1.6%	2.86	[0.12, 66.11]	1976																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Steiner R 1983	1	54	1	53	2.1%	0.98	[0.06, 15.29]	1983																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Ingle J 1985	0	77	3	74	1.8%	0.14	[0.01, 2.61]	1985																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Andersson M 1986	0	45	4	44	1.9%	0.11	[0.01, 1.96]	1986																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Vaughn CB 1988	0	56	1	59	1.6%	0.35	[0.01, 8.44]	1988																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Ingle J 1989	1	90	2	95	2.8%	0.53	[0.05, 5.72]	1989																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Nielsen D 1990	0	67	4	76	1.9%	0.13	[0.01, 2.29]	1990																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Erkisi M 1997	1	30	0	30	1.6%	3.00	[0.13, 70.83]	1997																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Nabholz JM 1999	3	189	4	203	7.3%	0.81	[0.18, 3.55]	1999																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Sjostrom J 1999	1	139	3	143	3.2%	0.34	[0.04, 3.26]	1999																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Norris B 2000	1	151	2	149	2.8%	0.49	[0.05, 5.38]	2000																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Nielsen D 2000	4	74	2	81	5.8%	2.19	[0.41, 11.60]	2000																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
O'Shaughnessy J 2001	0	32	3	61	1.9%	0.27	[0.01, 5.04]	2001																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
O'Shaughnessy J 2002	4	251	1	255	3.4%	4.06	[0.46, 36.11]	2002																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Bonneterre J 2002	5	90	1	88	3.5%	4.89	[0.58, 41.01]	2002																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Berruti D 2002	3	92	3	93	6.5%	1.01	[0.21, 4.88]	2002																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Sledge G (A) 2003	2	115	6	224	6.4%	0.65	[0.13, 3.17]	2003																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Sledge G (B) 2003	2	115	4	229	5.7%	1.00	[0.19, 5.36]	2003																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Ejlertsen B 2004	8	193	3	194	9.3%	2.68	[0.72, 9.95]	2004																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Iclic F 2005	2	100	4	101	5.7%	0.51	[0.09, 2.70]	2005																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
GEICAM 2007	1	123	1	125	2.1%	1.02	[0.06, 16.07]	2007																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Thomas E 2008	12	369	3	368	10.2%	3.99	[1.14, 14.02]	2008																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Albain KS 2008	1	261	1	260	2.1%	1.00	[0.06, 15.84]	2008																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Papadimitriou CA 2009	0	39	0	30		Not estimable		2009																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Sparano JA 2010	4	595	2	603	5.6%	2.03	[0.37, 11.02]	2010																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Nielsen DL 2011	0	170	1	167	1.6%	0.33	[0.01, 7.98]	2011																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Pallis AG 2012	0	74	0	74		Not estimable		2012																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																												
Total (95% CI)		3661		3947	100.0%	1.11	[0.74, 1.66]																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																													
Total events		57		60																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																
Heterogeneity: Tau ² = 0.00; Chi ² = 23.32, df = 25 (P = 0.56); I ² = 0%																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																				
Test for overall effect: Z = 0.52 (P = 0.60)																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																				
Funnel plot	<p>コメント： 出版バイアスの評価については、明らかな非対称性は認められない。</p>																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																			
その他の解析	施行せず			コメント：																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																
メタリグレーション																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																				
感度分析																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																				