

【4-9 メタアナリシス】

| <b>CQ</b>   |   | 有痛性乳癌骨転移に対して8 Gy/1回照射を行うことは勧められるか |                             |             |               |                                   |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |     |     |     |     |       |                   |           |     |     |    |     |       |                   |               |     |     |     |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |      |                   |            |    |     |    |     |      |                   |           |    |     |    |     |      |                   |                     |     |     |     |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |              |      |  |      |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|---|---|-----------------------------------|-----------------------------|-------------|---------------|-----------------------------------|------------------|-------|------------------|-------|--------|-----------------------------------|------------|-----|-----|-----|-----|-------|-------------------|-----------|-----|-----|----|-----|-------|-------------------|---------------|-----|-----|-----|-----|-------|-------------------|--------------|----|-----|----|-----|------|-------------------|------------|----|-----|----|-----|------|-------------------|-----------|----|-----|----|-----|------|-------------------|---------------------|-----|-----|-----|-----|-------|-------------------|-----------------------|--|-------------|--|-------------|---------------|--------------------------|--------------|------|--|------|--|--|--|---|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|
| <b>P</b>  | 有痛性骨転移  | <b>I</b>                          | 8 Gy/1回照射                   |             |               |                                   |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |     |     |     |     |       |                   |           |     |     |    |     |       |                   |               |     |     |     |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |      |                   |            |    |     |    |     |      |                   |           |    |     |    |     |      |                   |                     |     |     |     |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |              |      |  |      |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| <b>C</b>  | 20-30 Gyの分割照射   | <b>O</b>                          | 疼痛緩和率                       |             |               |                                   |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |     |     |     |     |       |                   |           |     |     |    |     |       |                   |               |     |     |     |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |      |                   |            |    |     |    |     |      |                   |           |    |     |    |     |      |                   |                     |     |     |     |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |              |      |  |      |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| <b>研究デザイン</b>   | RCT   | <b>文献数</b>                        | 7                           |             |               |                                   |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |     |     |     |     |       |                   |           |     |     |    |     |       |                   |               |     |     |     |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |      |                   |            |    |     |    |     |      |                   |           |    |     |    |     |      |                   |                     |     |     |     |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |              |      |  |      |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| <b>モデル</b>  | ランダム効果  | <b>方法</b>                         | Mantel-Haenszel             |             |               |                                   |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |     |     |     |     |       |                   |           |     |     |    |     |       |                   |               |     |     |     |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |      |                   |            |    |     |    |     |      |                   |           |    |     |    |     |      |                   |                     |     |     |     |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |              |      |  |      |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| <b>効果指標</b>   | リスク比  | <b>統合値</b>                        | 1.00 (0.95 - 1.05 ) P= 0.97 |             |               |                                   |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |     |     |     |     |       |                   |           |     |     |    |     |       |                   |               |     |     |     |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |      |                   |            |    |     |    |     |      |                   |           |    |     |    |     |      |                   |                     |     |     |     |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |              |      |  |      |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| <b>Forest plot</b>  | <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Study or Subgroup</th> <th>[単回照射]<br/>Events</th> <th>Total</th> <th>[分割照射]<br/>Events</th> <th>Total</th> <th>Weight</th> <th>Risk Ratio<br/>M-H, Random, 95% CI</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>BPTWP 1999</td> <td>274</td> <td>383</td> <td>257</td> <td>378</td> <td>28.1%</td> <td>1.05 [0.96, 1.16]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Gaze 1997</td> <td>108</td> <td>151</td> <td>99</td> <td>144</td> <td>11.1%</td> <td>1.04 [0.90, 1.21]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Hartsell 2004</td> <td>187</td> <td>455</td> <td>188</td> <td>443</td> <td>10.3%</td> <td>0.97 [0.83, 1.13]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Nielsen 1998</td> <td>52</td> <td>122</td> <td>56</td> <td>119</td> <td>3.1%</td> <td>0.91 [0.68, 1.20]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Price 1986</td> <td>29</td> <td>140</td> <td>34</td> <td>148</td> <td>1.3%</td> <td>0.90 [0.59, 1.40]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Roos 2005</td> <td>73</td> <td>137</td> <td>83</td> <td>135</td> <td>5.8%</td> <td>0.87 [0.71, 1.06]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>van der Linden 2004</td> <td>395</td> <td>579</td> <td>396</td> <td>578</td> <td>40.2%</td> <td>1.00 [0.92, 1.08]</td> </tr> <tr> <td><b>Total (95% CI)</b></td> <td></td> <td><b>1967</b></td> <td></td> <td><b>1945</b></td> <td><b>100.0%</b></td> <td><b>1.00 [0.95, 1.05]</b></td> </tr> <tr> <td>Total events</td> <td>1118</td> <td></td> <td>1113</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="7">Heterogeneity: Tau<sup>2</sup> = 0.00; Chi<sup>2</sup> = 4.27, df = 6 (P = 0.64); I<sup>2</sup> = 0%</td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="7">Test for overall effect: Z = 0.04 (P = 0.97)</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>コメント: 有意差なし</p> |                                   |                             |             |               | Study or Subgroup                 | [単回照射]<br>Events | Total | [分割照射]<br>Events | Total | Weight | Risk Ratio<br>M-H, Random, 95% CI | BPTWP 1999 | 274 | 383 | 257 | 378 | 28.1% | 1.05 [0.96, 1.16] | Gaze 1997 | 108 | 151 | 99 | 144 | 11.1% | 1.04 [0.90, 1.21] | Hartsell 2004 | 187 | 455 | 188 | 443 | 10.3% | 0.97 [0.83, 1.13] | Nielsen 1998 | 52 | 122 | 56 | 119 | 3.1% | 0.91 [0.68, 1.20] | Price 1986 | 29 | 140 | 34 | 148 | 1.3% | 0.90 [0.59, 1.40] | Roos 2005 | 73 | 137 | 83 | 135 | 5.8% | 0.87 [0.71, 1.06] | van der Linden 2004 | 395 | 579 | 396 | 578 | 40.2% | 1.00 [0.92, 1.08] | <b>Total (95% CI)</b> |  | <b>1967</b> |  | <b>1945</b> | <b>100.0%</b> | <b>1.00 [0.95, 1.05]</b> | Total events | 1118 |  | 1113 |  |  |  | Heterogeneity: Tau <sup>2</sup> = 0.00; Chi <sup>2</sup> = 4.27, df = 6 (P = 0.64); I <sup>2</sup> = 0% |  |  |  |  |  |  | Test for overall effect: Z = 0.04 (P = 0.97) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Study or Subgroup   | [単回照射]<br>Events  | Total                             | [分割照射]<br>Events            | Total       | Weight        | Risk Ratio<br>M-H, Random, 95% CI |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |     |     |     |     |       |                   |           |     |     |    |     |       |                   |               |     |     |     |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |      |                   |            |    |     |    |     |      |                   |           |    |     |    |     |      |                   |                     |     |     |     |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |              |      |  |      |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| BPTWP 1999  | 274   | 383                               | 257                         | 378         | 28.1%         | 1.05 [0.96, 1.16]                 |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |     |     |     |     |       |                   |           |     |     |    |     |       |                   |               |     |     |     |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |      |                   |            |    |     |    |     |      |                   |           |    |     |    |     |      |                   |                     |     |     |     |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |              |      |  |      |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Gaze 1997   | 108   | 151                               | 99                          | 144         | 11.1%         | 1.04 [0.90, 1.21]                 |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |     |     |     |     |       |                   |           |     |     |    |     |       |                   |               |     |     |     |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |      |                   |            |    |     |    |     |      |                   |           |    |     |    |     |      |                   |                     |     |     |     |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |              |      |  |      |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Hartsell 2004   | 187   | 455                               | 188                         | 443         | 10.3%         | 0.97 [0.83, 1.13]                 |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |     |     |     |     |       |                   |           |     |     |    |     |       |                   |               |     |     |     |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |      |                   |            |    |     |    |     |      |                   |           |    |     |    |     |      |                   |                     |     |     |     |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |              |      |  |      |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Nielsen 1998  | 52  | 122                               | 56                          | 119         | 3.1%          | 0.91 [0.68, 1.20]                 |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |     |     |     |     |       |                   |           |     |     |    |     |       |                   |               |     |     |     |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |      |                   |            |    |     |    |     |      |                   |           |    |     |    |     |      |                   |                     |     |     |     |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |              |      |  |      |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Price 1986  | 29  | 140                               | 34                          | 148         | 1.3%          | 0.90 [0.59, 1.40]                 |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |     |     |     |     |       |                   |           |     |     |    |     |       |                   |               |     |     |     |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |      |                   |            |    |     |    |     |      |                   |           |    |     |    |     |      |                   |                     |     |     |     |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |              |      |  |      |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Roos 2005   | 73  | 137                               | 83                          | 135         | 5.8%          | 0.87 [0.71, 1.06]                 |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |     |     |     |     |       |                   |           |     |     |    |     |       |                   |               |     |     |     |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |      |                   |            |    |     |    |     |      |                   |           |    |     |    |     |      |                   |                     |     |     |     |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |              |      |  |      |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| van der Linden 2004   | 395   | 579                               | 396                         | 578         | 40.2%         | 1.00 [0.92, 1.08]                 |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |     |     |     |     |       |                   |           |     |     |    |     |       |                   |               |     |     |     |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |      |                   |            |    |     |    |     |      |                   |           |    |     |    |     |      |                   |                     |     |     |     |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |              |      |  |      |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| <b>Total (95% CI)</b>   |   | <b>1967</b>                       |                             | <b>1945</b> | <b>100.0%</b> | <b>1.00 [0.95, 1.05]</b>          |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |     |     |     |     |       |                   |           |     |     |    |     |       |                   |               |     |     |     |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |      |                   |            |    |     |    |     |      |                   |           |    |     |    |     |      |                   |                     |     |     |     |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |              |      |  |      |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Total events  | 1118  |                                   | 1113                        |             |               |                                   |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |     |     |     |     |       |                   |           |     |     |    |     |       |                   |               |     |     |     |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |      |                   |            |    |     |    |     |      |                   |           |    |     |    |     |      |                   |                     |     |     |     |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |              |      |  |      |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Heterogeneity: Tau <sup>2</sup> = 0.00; Chi <sup>2</sup> = 4.27, df = 6 (P = 0.64); I <sup>2</sup> = 0% |   |                                   |                             |             |               |                                   |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |     |     |     |     |       |                   |           |     |     |    |     |       |                   |               |     |     |     |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |      |                   |            |    |     |    |     |      |                   |           |    |     |    |     |      |                   |                     |     |     |     |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |              |      |  |      |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Test for overall effect: Z = 0.04 (P = 0.97)  |   |                                   |                             |             |               |                                   |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |     |     |     |     |       |                   |           |     |     |    |     |       |                   |               |     |     |     |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |      |                   |            |    |     |    |     |      |                   |           |    |     |    |     |      |                   |                     |     |     |     |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |              |      |  |      |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| <b>Funnel plot</b>  | <p>コメント: 問題となるようなPublication Biasは指摘できない。</p>   |                                   |                             |             |               |                                   |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |     |     |     |     |       |                   |           |     |     |    |     |       |                   |               |     |     |     |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |      |                   |            |    |     |    |     |      |                   |           |    |     |    |     |      |                   |                     |     |     |     |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |              |      |  |      |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| <b>その他の解析</b>   | 施行せず。   |                                   |                             | コメント:       |               |                                   |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |     |     |     |     |       |                   |           |     |     |    |     |       |                   |               |     |     |     |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |      |                   |            |    |     |    |     |      |                   |           |    |     |    |     |      |                   |                     |     |     |     |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |              |      |  |      |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| メタリグレッション   |   |                                   |                             |             |               |                                   |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |     |     |     |     |       |                   |           |     |     |    |     |       |                   |               |     |     |     |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |      |                   |            |    |     |    |     |      |                   |           |    |     |    |     |      |                   |                     |     |     |     |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |              |      |  |      |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 感度分析  |   |                                   |                             |             |               |                                   |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |     |     |     |     |       |                   |           |     |     |    |     |       |                   |               |     |     |     |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |      |                   |            |    |     |    |     |      |                   |           |    |     |    |     |      |                   |                     |     |     |     |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |              |      |  |      |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |

【4-9 メタアナリシス】

| <b>CQ</b>   |   | 有痛性乳癌骨転移に対して8 Gy/1回照射を行うことは勧められるか |                            |             |               |                                   |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |   |     |   |     |       |                   |                         |    |     |   |     |       |                   |            |   |     |   |     |      |                    |           |   |     |   |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|---|---|-----------------------------------|----------------------------|-------------|---------------|-----------------------------------|------------------|-------|------------------|-------|--------|-----------------------------------|------------|---|-----|---|-----|-------|-------------------|-------------------------|----|-----|---|-----|-------|-------------------|------------|---|-----|---|-----|------|--------------------|-----------|---|-----|---|-----|-------|-------------------|--------------|----|-----|----|-----|-------|-------------------|-----------------------|--|-------------|--|-------------|---------------|--------------------------|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|---|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|
| <b>P</b>  | 有痛性骨転移  | <b>I</b>                          | 8 Gy/1回照射                  |             |               |                                   |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |   |     |   |     |       |                   |                         |    |     |   |     |       |                   |            |   |     |   |     |      |                    |           |   |     |   |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| <b>C</b>  | 20-30 Gyの分割照射   | <b>O</b>                          | 運動機能維持率                    |             |               |                                   |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |   |     |   |     |       |                   |                         |    |     |   |     |       |                   |            |   |     |   |     |      |                    |           |   |     |   |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| <b>研究デザイン</b>   | RCT   | <b>文献数</b>                        | 7                          | <b>コード</b>  |               |                                   |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |   |     |   |     |       |                   |                         |    |     |   |     |       |                   |            |   |     |   |     |      |                    |           |   |     |   |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| <b>モデル</b>  | ランダム効果  | <b>方法</b>                         | Mantel-Haenszel            |             |               |                                   |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |   |     |   |     |       |                   |                         |    |     |   |     |       |                   |            |   |     |   |     |      |                    |           |   |     |   |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| <b>効果指標</b>   | リスク比  | <b>統合値</b>                        | 1.42 (0.88 - 2.29) P= 0.15 |             |               |                                   |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |   |     |   |     |       |                   |                         |    |     |   |     |       |                   |            |   |     |   |     |      |                    |           |   |     |   |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| <b>Forest plot</b>  | <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Study or Subgroup</th> <th>[単回照射]<br/>Events</th> <th>Total</th> <th>[分割照射]<br/>Events</th> <th>Total</th> <th>Weight</th> <th>Risk Ratio<br/>M-H, Random, 95% CI</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>BPTWP 1999</td> <td>6</td> <td>383</td> <td>4</td> <td>378</td> <td>14.4%</td> <td>1.48 [0.42, 5.20]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Kassa 2006 / Sande 2009</td> <td>10</td> <td>186</td> <td>5</td> <td>190</td> <td>20.5%</td> <td>2.04 [0.71, 5.86]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Price 1986</td> <td>2</td> <td>140</td> <td>1</td> <td>148</td> <td>4.0%</td> <td>2.11 [0.19, 23.06]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Roos 2005</td> <td>9</td> <td>137</td> <td>8</td> <td>135</td> <td>26.8%</td> <td>1.11 [0.44, 2.79]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Steelnd 1999</td> <td>13</td> <td>579</td> <td>10</td> <td>578</td> <td>34.2%</td> <td>1.30 [0.57, 2.94]</td> </tr> <tr> <td><b>Total (95% CI)</b></td> <td></td> <td><b>1425</b></td> <td></td> <td><b>1429</b></td> <td><b>100.0%</b></td> <td><b>1.42 [0.88, 2.29]</b></td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="7">Total events: 40 (single), 28 (fractional)</td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="7">Heterogeneity: Tau<sup>2</sup> = 0.00; Chi<sup>2</sup> = 0.89, df = 4 (P = 0.93); I<sup>2</sup> = 0%</td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="7">Test for overall effect: Z = 1.44 (P = 0.15)</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>コメント: リスク比1.42だが, 有意差なし.</p> |                                   |                            |             |               | Study or Subgroup                 | [単回照射]<br>Events | Total | [分割照射]<br>Events | Total | Weight | Risk Ratio<br>M-H, Random, 95% CI | BPTWP 1999 | 6 | 383 | 4 | 378 | 14.4% | 1.48 [0.42, 5.20] | Kassa 2006 / Sande 2009 | 10 | 186 | 5 | 190 | 20.5% | 2.04 [0.71, 5.86] | Price 1986 | 2 | 140 | 1 | 148 | 4.0% | 2.11 [0.19, 23.06] | Roos 2005 | 9 | 137 | 8 | 135 | 26.8% | 1.11 [0.44, 2.79] | Steelnd 1999 | 13 | 579 | 10 | 578 | 34.2% | 1.30 [0.57, 2.94] | <b>Total (95% CI)</b> |  | <b>1425</b> |  | <b>1429</b> | <b>100.0%</b> | <b>1.42 [0.88, 2.29]</b> | Total events: 40 (single), 28 (fractional) |  |  |  |  |  |  | Heterogeneity: Tau <sup>2</sup> = 0.00; Chi <sup>2</sup> = 0.89, df = 4 (P = 0.93); I <sup>2</sup> = 0% |  |  |  |  |  |  | Test for overall effect: Z = 1.44 (P = 0.15) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Study or Subgroup   | [単回照射]<br>Events  | Total                             | [分割照射]<br>Events           | Total       | Weight        | Risk Ratio<br>M-H, Random, 95% CI |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |   |     |   |     |       |                   |                         |    |     |   |     |       |                   |            |   |     |   |     |      |                    |           |   |     |   |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| BPTWP 1999  | 6   | 383                               | 4                          | 378         | 14.4%         | 1.48 [0.42, 5.20]                 |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |   |     |   |     |       |                   |                         |    |     |   |     |       |                   |            |   |     |   |     |      |                    |           |   |     |   |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Kassa 2006 / Sande 2009   | 10  | 186                               | 5                          | 190         | 20.5%         | 2.04 [0.71, 5.86]                 |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |   |     |   |     |       |                   |                         |    |     |   |     |       |                   |            |   |     |   |     |      |                    |           |   |     |   |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Price 1986  | 2   | 140                               | 1                          | 148         | 4.0%          | 2.11 [0.19, 23.06]                |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |   |     |   |     |       |                   |                         |    |     |   |     |       |                   |            |   |     |   |     |      |                    |           |   |     |   |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Roos 2005   | 9   | 137                               | 8                          | 135         | 26.8%         | 1.11 [0.44, 2.79]                 |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |   |     |   |     |       |                   |                         |    |     |   |     |       |                   |            |   |     |   |     |      |                    |           |   |     |   |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Steelnd 1999  | 13  | 579                               | 10                         | 578         | 34.2%         | 1.30 [0.57, 2.94]                 |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |   |     |   |     |       |                   |                         |    |     |   |     |       |                   |            |   |     |   |     |      |                    |           |   |     |   |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| <b>Total (95% CI)</b>   |   | <b>1425</b>                       |                            | <b>1429</b> | <b>100.0%</b> | <b>1.42 [0.88, 2.29]</b>          |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |   |     |   |     |       |                   |                         |    |     |   |     |       |                   |            |   |     |   |     |      |                    |           |   |     |   |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Total events: 40 (single), 28 (fractional)  |   |                                   |                            |             |               |                                   |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |   |     |   |     |       |                   |                         |    |     |   |     |       |                   |            |   |     |   |     |      |                    |           |   |     |   |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Heterogeneity: Tau <sup>2</sup> = 0.00; Chi <sup>2</sup> = 0.89, df = 4 (P = 0.93); I <sup>2</sup> = 0% |   |                                   |                            |             |               |                                   |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |   |     |   |     |       |                   |                         |    |     |   |     |       |                   |            |   |     |   |     |      |                    |           |   |     |   |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Test for overall effect: Z = 1.44 (P = 0.15)  |   |                                   |                            |             |               |                                   |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |   |     |   |     |       |                   |                         |    |     |   |     |       |                   |            |   |     |   |     |      |                    |           |   |     |   |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| <b>Funnel plot</b>  | <p>コメント: 問題となるようなPublication Biasは指摘できない.</p>   |                                   |                            |             |               |                                   |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |   |     |   |     |       |                   |                         |    |     |   |     |       |                   |            |   |     |   |     |      |                    |           |   |     |   |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| <b>その他の解析</b>   | 施行せず.   |                                   |                            |             | コメント:         |                                   |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |   |     |   |     |       |                   |                         |    |     |   |     |       |                   |            |   |     |   |     |      |                    |           |   |     |   |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| メタリグレッション   |   |                                   |                            |             |               |                                   |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |   |     |   |     |       |                   |                         |    |     |   |     |       |                   |            |   |     |   |     |      |                    |           |   |     |   |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 感度分析  |   |                                   |                            |             |               |                                   |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |   |     |   |     |       |                   |                         |    |     |   |     |       |                   |            |   |     |   |     |      |                    |           |   |     |   |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |

【4-9 メタアナリシス】

| <b>CQ</b>   |   | 有痛性乳癌骨転移に対して8 Gy/1回照射を行うことは勧められるか |                            |             |               |                          |                                    |  |        |  |        |                                    |        |       |        |       |            |   |     |   |     |      |                    |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                         |   |     |    |     |       |                   |              |   |     |   |     |       |                   |            |   |     |   |     |      |                   |           |   |     |   |     |       |                   |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |              |    |  |    |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|---|---|-----------------------------------|----------------------------|-------------|---------------|--------------------------|------------------------------------|--|--------|--|--------|------------------------------------|--------|-------|--------|-------|------------|---|-----|---|-----|------|--------------------|---------------|----|-----|----|-----|-------|-------------------|-------------------------|---|-----|----|-----|-------|-------------------|--------------|---|-----|---|-----|-------|-------------------|------------|---|-----|---|-----|------|-------------------|-----------|---|-----|---|-----|-------|-------------------|---------------|----|-----|----|-----|-------|-------------------|-----------------------|--|-------------|--|-------------|---------------|--------------------------|--------------|----|--|----|--|--|--|---|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|
| <b>P</b>  | 有痛性骨転移  | <b>I</b>                          | 8 Gy/1回照射                  |             |               |                          |                                    |  |        |  |        |                                    |        |       |        |       |            |   |     |   |     |      |                    |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                         |   |     |    |     |       |                   |              |   |     |   |     |       |                   |            |   |     |   |     |      |                   |           |   |     |   |     |       |                   |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |              |    |  |    |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| <b>C</b>  | 20-30 Gyの分割照射   | <b>O</b>                          | 骨折発生率                      |             |               |                          |                                    |  |        |  |        |                                    |        |       |        |       |            |   |     |   |     |      |                    |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                         |   |     |    |     |       |                   |              |   |     |   |     |       |                   |            |   |     |   |     |      |                   |           |   |     |   |     |       |                   |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |              |    |  |    |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| <b>研究デザイン</b>   | RCT   | <b>文献数</b>                        | 7                          |             |               |                          |                                    |  |        |  |        |                                    |        |       |        |       |            |   |     |   |     |      |                    |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                         |   |     |    |     |       |                   |              |   |     |   |     |       |                   |            |   |     |   |     |      |                   |           |   |     |   |     |       |                   |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |              |    |  |    |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| <b>モデル</b>  | ランダム効果  | <b>方法</b>                         | Mantel-Haenszel            |             |               |                          |                                    |  |        |  |        |                                    |        |       |        |       |            |   |     |   |     |      |                    |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                         |   |     |    |     |       |                   |              |   |     |   |     |       |                   |            |   |     |   |     |      |                   |           |   |     |   |     |       |                   |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |              |    |  |    |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| <b>効果指標</b>   | リスク比  | <b>統合値</b>                        | 1.16 (0.63 - 2.13) P= 0.64 |             |               |                          |                                    |  |        |  |        |                                    |        |       |        |       |            |   |     |   |     |      |                    |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                         |   |     |    |     |       |                   |              |   |     |   |     |       |                   |            |   |     |   |     |      |                   |           |   |     |   |     |       |                   |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |              |    |  |    |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| <b>Forest plot</b>  | <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th rowspan="2">Study or Subgroup</th> <th colspan="2">[単回照射]</th> <th colspan="2">[分割照射]</th> <th rowspan="2">Weight</th> <th rowspan="2">Risk Ratio<br/>M.H., Random, 95% CI</th> </tr> <tr> <th>Events</th> <th>Total</th> <th>Events</th> <th>Total</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>BPTWP 1999</td> <td>7</td> <td>393</td> <td>2</td> <td>378</td> <td>9.9%</td> <td>3.45 [0.72, 16.52]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Hartsell 2004</td> <td>14</td> <td>455</td> <td>11</td> <td>443</td> <td>19.2%</td> <td>1.24 [0.57, 2.70]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Kassa 2006 / Sande 2009</td> <td>8</td> <td>186</td> <td>21</td> <td>190</td> <td>19.1%</td> <td>0.39 [0.18, 0.86]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Nielsen 1998</td> <td>6</td> <td>122</td> <td>6</td> <td>119</td> <td>14.6%</td> <td>0.98 [0.32, 2.94]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Price 1986</td> <td>0</td> <td>140</td> <td>1</td> <td>148</td> <td>3.2%</td> <td>0.35 [0.01, 8.58]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Roos 2005</td> <td>6</td> <td>137</td> <td>5</td> <td>135</td> <td>13.9%</td> <td>1.18 [0.37, 3.78]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Steeland 1999</td> <td>24</td> <td>579</td> <td>10</td> <td>578</td> <td>20.0%</td> <td>2.40 [1.16, 4.96]</td> </tr> <tr> <td><b>Total (95% CI)</b></td> <td></td> <td><b>2002</b></td> <td></td> <td><b>1991</b></td> <td><b>100.0%</b></td> <td><b>1.16 [0.63, 2.13]</b></td> </tr> <tr> <td>Total events</td> <td colspan="2">65</td> <td colspan="2">56</td> <td></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="7">Heterogeneity: Tau<sup>2</sup> = 0.35; Chi<sup>2</sup> = 13.70, df = 6 (P = 0.03); I<sup>2</sup> = 56%</td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="7">Test for overall effect: Z = 0.46 (P = 0.64)</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>コメント: リスク比1.16だが, 有意差なし. 結果に非一貫性あり.</p> |                                   |                            |             |               | Study or Subgroup        | [単回照射]                             |  | [分割照射] |  | Weight | Risk Ratio<br>M.H., Random, 95% CI | Events | Total | Events | Total | BPTWP 1999 | 7 | 393 | 2 | 378 | 9.9% | 3.45 [0.72, 16.52] | Hartsell 2004 | 14 | 455 | 11 | 443 | 19.2% | 1.24 [0.57, 2.70] | Kassa 2006 / Sande 2009 | 8 | 186 | 21 | 190 | 19.1% | 0.39 [0.18, 0.86] | Nielsen 1998 | 6 | 122 | 6 | 119 | 14.6% | 0.98 [0.32, 2.94] | Price 1986 | 0 | 140 | 1 | 148 | 3.2% | 0.35 [0.01, 8.58] | Roos 2005 | 6 | 137 | 5 | 135 | 13.9% | 1.18 [0.37, 3.78] | Steeland 1999 | 24 | 579 | 10 | 578 | 20.0% | 2.40 [1.16, 4.96] | <b>Total (95% CI)</b> |  | <b>2002</b> |  | <b>1991</b> | <b>100.0%</b> | <b>1.16 [0.63, 2.13]</b> | Total events | 65 |  | 56 |  |  |  | Heterogeneity: Tau <sup>2</sup> = 0.35; Chi <sup>2</sup> = 13.70, df = 6 (P = 0.03); I <sup>2</sup> = 56% |  |  |  |  |  |  | Test for overall effect: Z = 0.46 (P = 0.64) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Study or Subgroup   | [単回照射]  |                                   | [分割照射]                     |             | Weight        |                          | Risk Ratio<br>M.H., Random, 95% CI |  |        |  |        |                                    |        |       |        |       |            |   |     |   |     |      |                    |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                         |   |     |    |     |       |                   |              |   |     |   |     |       |                   |            |   |     |   |     |      |                   |           |   |     |   |     |       |                   |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |              |    |  |    |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|   | Events  | Total                             | Events                     | Total       |               |                          |                                    |  |        |  |        |                                    |        |       |        |       |            |   |     |   |     |      |                    |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                         |   |     |    |     |       |                   |              |   |     |   |     |       |                   |            |   |     |   |     |      |                   |           |   |     |   |     |       |                   |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |              |    |  |    |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| BPTWP 1999  | 7   | 393                               | 2                          | 378         | 9.9%          | 3.45 [0.72, 16.52]       |                                    |  |        |  |        |                                    |        |       |        |       |            |   |     |   |     |      |                    |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                         |   |     |    |     |       |                   |              |   |     |   |     |       |                   |            |   |     |   |     |      |                   |           |   |     |   |     |       |                   |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |              |    |  |    |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Hartsell 2004   | 14  | 455                               | 11                         | 443         | 19.2%         | 1.24 [0.57, 2.70]        |                                    |  |        |  |        |                                    |        |       |        |       |            |   |     |   |     |      |                    |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                         |   |     |    |     |       |                   |              |   |     |   |     |       |                   |            |   |     |   |     |      |                   |           |   |     |   |     |       |                   |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |              |    |  |    |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Kassa 2006 / Sande 2009   | 8   | 186                               | 21                         | 190         | 19.1%         | 0.39 [0.18, 0.86]        |                                    |  |        |  |        |                                    |        |       |        |       |            |   |     |   |     |      |                    |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                         |   |     |    |     |       |                   |              |   |     |   |     |       |                   |            |   |     |   |     |      |                   |           |   |     |   |     |       |                   |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |              |    |  |    |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Nielsen 1998  | 6   | 122                               | 6                          | 119         | 14.6%         | 0.98 [0.32, 2.94]        |                                    |  |        |  |        |                                    |        |       |        |       |            |   |     |   |     |      |                    |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                         |   |     |    |     |       |                   |              |   |     |   |     |       |                   |            |   |     |   |     |      |                   |           |   |     |   |     |       |                   |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |              |    |  |    |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Price 1986  | 0   | 140                               | 1                          | 148         | 3.2%          | 0.35 [0.01, 8.58]        |                                    |  |        |  |        |                                    |        |       |        |       |            |   |     |   |     |      |                    |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                         |   |     |    |     |       |                   |              |   |     |   |     |       |                   |            |   |     |   |     |      |                   |           |   |     |   |     |       |                   |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |              |    |  |    |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Roos 2005   | 6   | 137                               | 5                          | 135         | 13.9%         | 1.18 [0.37, 3.78]        |                                    |  |        |  |        |                                    |        |       |        |       |            |   |     |   |     |      |                    |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                         |   |     |    |     |       |                   |              |   |     |   |     |       |                   |            |   |     |   |     |      |                   |           |   |     |   |     |       |                   |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |              |    |  |    |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Steeland 1999   | 24  | 579                               | 10                         | 578         | 20.0%         | 2.40 [1.16, 4.96]        |                                    |  |        |  |        |                                    |        |       |        |       |            |   |     |   |     |      |                    |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                         |   |     |    |     |       |                   |              |   |     |   |     |       |                   |            |   |     |   |     |      |                   |           |   |     |   |     |       |                   |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |              |    |  |    |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| <b>Total (95% CI)</b>   |   | <b>2002</b>                       |                            | <b>1991</b> | <b>100.0%</b> | <b>1.16 [0.63, 2.13]</b> |                                    |  |        |  |        |                                    |        |       |        |       |            |   |     |   |     |      |                    |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                         |   |     |    |     |       |                   |              |   |     |   |     |       |                   |            |   |     |   |     |      |                   |           |   |     |   |     |       |                   |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |              |    |  |    |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Total events  | 65  |                                   | 56                         |             |               |                          |                                    |  |        |  |        |                                    |        |       |        |       |            |   |     |   |     |      |                    |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                         |   |     |    |     |       |                   |              |   |     |   |     |       |                   |            |   |     |   |     |      |                   |           |   |     |   |     |       |                   |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |              |    |  |    |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Heterogeneity: Tau <sup>2</sup> = 0.35; Chi <sup>2</sup> = 13.70, df = 6 (P = 0.03); I <sup>2</sup> = 56% |   |                                   |                            |             |               |                          |                                    |  |        |  |        |                                    |        |       |        |       |            |   |     |   |     |      |                    |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                         |   |     |    |     |       |                   |              |   |     |   |     |       |                   |            |   |     |   |     |      |                   |           |   |     |   |     |       |                   |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |              |    |  |    |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Test for overall effect: Z = 0.46 (P = 0.64)  |   |                                   |                            |             |               |                          |                                    |  |        |  |        |                                    |        |       |        |       |            |   |     |   |     |      |                    |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                         |   |     |    |     |       |                   |              |   |     |   |     |       |                   |            |   |     |   |     |      |                   |           |   |     |   |     |       |                   |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |              |    |  |    |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| <b>Funnel plot</b>  | <p>コメント: 問題となるようなPublication Biasは指摘できない.</p>   |                                   |                            |             |               |                          |                                    |  |        |  |        |                                    |        |       |        |       |            |   |     |   |     |      |                    |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                         |   |     |    |     |       |                   |              |   |     |   |     |       |                   |            |   |     |   |     |      |                   |           |   |     |   |     |       |                   |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |              |    |  |    |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| <b>その他の解析</b>   | 施行せず.   |                                   |                            | コメント:       |               |                          |                                    |  |        |  |        |                                    |        |       |        |       |            |   |     |   |     |      |                    |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                         |   |     |    |     |       |                   |              |   |     |   |     |       |                   |            |   |     |   |     |      |                   |           |   |     |   |     |       |                   |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |              |    |  |    |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| メタリグレーション   |   |                                   |                            |             |               |                          |                                    |  |        |  |        |                                    |        |       |        |       |            |   |     |   |     |      |                    |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                         |   |     |    |     |       |                   |              |   |     |   |     |       |                   |            |   |     |   |     |      |                   |           |   |     |   |     |       |                   |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |              |    |  |    |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 感度分析  |   |                                   |                            |             |               |                          |                                    |  |        |  |        |                                    |        |       |        |       |            |   |     |   |     |      |                    |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                         |   |     |    |     |       |                   |              |   |     |   |     |       |                   |            |   |     |   |     |      |                   |           |   |     |   |     |       |                   |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |              |    |  |    |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |

【4-9 メタアナリシス】

| CQ  |  | 有痛性乳癌骨転移に対して8 Gy/1回照射を行うことは勧められるか |                               |             |               |                                   |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |    |     |    |     |       |                   |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                         |    |     |   |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |       |                   |            |    |     |   |     |      |                    |           |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                     |     |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |                                      |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|---|--|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------|-------------|---------------|-----------------------------------|------------------|-------|------------------|-------|--------|-----------------------------------|------------|----|-----|----|-----|-------|-------------------|---------------|----|-----|----|-----|-------|-------------------|-------------------------|----|-----|---|-----|-------|-------------------|--------------|----|-----|----|-----|-------|-------------------|------------|----|-----|---|-----|------|--------------------|-----------|----|-----|----|-----|-------|-------------------|---------------------|-----|-----|----|-----|-------|-------------------|-----------------------|--|-------------|--|-------------|---------------|--------------------------|--------------------------------------|--|--|--|--|--|--|---|--|--|--|--|--|--|---|--|--|--|--|--|--|
| P   | 有痛性骨転移   | I                                 | 8 Gy/1回照射                     |             |               |                                   |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |    |     |    |     |       |                   |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                         |    |     |   |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |       |                   |            |    |     |   |     |      |                    |           |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                     |     |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |                                      |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| C   | 20-30 Gyの分割照射  | O                                 | 再照射率                          |             |               |                                   |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |    |     |    |     |       |                   |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                         |    |     |   |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |       |                   |            |    |     |   |     |      |                    |           |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                     |     |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |                                      |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 研究デザイン  | RCT  | 文献数                               | 7                             | コード         |               |                                   |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |    |     |    |     |       |                   |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                         |    |     |   |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |       |                   |            |    |     |   |     |      |                    |           |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                     |     |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |                                      |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| モデル   | ランダム効果   | 方法                                | Mantel-Haenszel               |             |               |                                   |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |    |     |    |     |       |                   |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                         |    |     |   |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |       |                   |            |    |     |   |     |      |                    |           |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                     |     |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |                                      |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 効果指標  | リスク比   | 統合値                               | 2.37 (1.65 - 3.40) P< 0.00001 |             |               |                                   |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |    |     |    |     |       |                   |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                         |    |     |   |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |       |                   |            |    |     |   |     |      |                    |           |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                     |     |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |                                      |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Forest plot   | <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Study or Subgroup</th> <th>[単回照射]<br/>Events</th> <th>Total</th> <th>[分割照射]<br/>Events</th> <th>Total</th> <th>Weight</th> <th>Risk Ratio<br/>M-H, Random, 95% CI</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>BPTVP 1999</td> <td>76</td> <td>383</td> <td>32</td> <td>378</td> <td>16.9%</td> <td>2.34 [1.59, 3.45]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Hartseil 2004</td> <td>76</td> <td>455</td> <td>33</td> <td>443</td> <td>16.9%</td> <td>2.24 [1.52, 3.30]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Kassa 2006 / Sande 2009</td> <td>29</td> <td>186</td> <td>9</td> <td>190</td> <td>11.4%</td> <td>3.29 [1.60, 6.76]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Nielsen 1998</td> <td>25</td> <td>122</td> <td>14</td> <td>119</td> <td>13.2%</td> <td>1.74 [0.95, 3.19]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Price 1986</td> <td>15</td> <td>140</td> <td>4</td> <td>148</td> <td>7.3%</td> <td>3.96 [1.35, 11.66]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Roos 2005</td> <td>40</td> <td>137</td> <td>33</td> <td>135</td> <td>16.8%</td> <td>1.19 [0.80, 1.77]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>van der Linden 2004</td> <td>139</td> <td>579</td> <td>35</td> <td>578</td> <td>17.5%</td> <td>3.96 [2.79, 5.64]</td> </tr> <tr> <td><b>Total (95% CI)</b></td> <td></td> <td><b>2002</b></td> <td></td> <td><b>1991</b></td> <td><b>100.0%</b></td> <td><b>2.37 [1.65, 3.40]</b></td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="7">Total events: 400 (単回照射), 160 (分割照射)</td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="7">Heterogeneity: Tau<sup>2</sup> = 0.16; Chi<sup>2</sup> = 22.92, df = 6 (P = 0.0008); I<sup>2</sup> = 74%</td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="7">Test for overall effect: Z = 4.67 (P &lt; 0.00001)</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>コメント: 8Gy/1回照射の方が不良. リスク比 2.37.</p> |                                   |                               |             |               | Study or Subgroup                 | [単回照射]<br>Events | Total | [分割照射]<br>Events | Total | Weight | Risk Ratio<br>M-H, Random, 95% CI | BPTVP 1999 | 76 | 383 | 32 | 378 | 16.9% | 2.34 [1.59, 3.45] | Hartseil 2004 | 76 | 455 | 33 | 443 | 16.9% | 2.24 [1.52, 3.30] | Kassa 2006 / Sande 2009 | 29 | 186 | 9 | 190 | 11.4% | 3.29 [1.60, 6.76] | Nielsen 1998 | 25 | 122 | 14 | 119 | 13.2% | 1.74 [0.95, 3.19] | Price 1986 | 15 | 140 | 4 | 148 | 7.3% | 3.96 [1.35, 11.66] | Roos 2005 | 40 | 137 | 33 | 135 | 16.8% | 1.19 [0.80, 1.77] | van der Linden 2004 | 139 | 579 | 35 | 578 | 17.5% | 3.96 [2.79, 5.64] | <b>Total (95% CI)</b> |  | <b>2002</b> |  | <b>1991</b> | <b>100.0%</b> | <b>2.37 [1.65, 3.40]</b> | Total events: 400 (単回照射), 160 (分割照射) |  |  |  |  |  |  | Heterogeneity: Tau <sup>2</sup> = 0.16; Chi <sup>2</sup> = 22.92, df = 6 (P = 0.0008); I <sup>2</sup> = 74% |  |  |  |  |  |  | Test for overall effect: Z = 4.67 (P < 0.00001) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Study or Subgroup   | [単回照射]<br>Events   | Total                             | [分割照射]<br>Events              | Total       | Weight        | Risk Ratio<br>M-H, Random, 95% CI |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |    |     |    |     |       |                   |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                         |    |     |   |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |       |                   |            |    |     |   |     |      |                    |           |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                     |     |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |                                      |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| BPTVP 1999  | 76   | 383                               | 32                            | 378         | 16.9%         | 2.34 [1.59, 3.45]                 |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |    |     |    |     |       |                   |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                         |    |     |   |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |       |                   |            |    |     |   |     |      |                    |           |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                     |     |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |                                      |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Hartseil 2004   | 76   | 455                               | 33                            | 443         | 16.9%         | 2.24 [1.52, 3.30]                 |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |    |     |    |     |       |                   |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                         |    |     |   |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |       |                   |            |    |     |   |     |      |                    |           |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                     |     |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |                                      |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Kassa 2006 / Sande 2009   | 29   | 186                               | 9                             | 190         | 11.4%         | 3.29 [1.60, 6.76]                 |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |    |     |    |     |       |                   |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                         |    |     |   |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |       |                   |            |    |     |   |     |      |                    |           |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                     |     |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |                                      |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Nielsen 1998  | 25   | 122                               | 14                            | 119         | 13.2%         | 1.74 [0.95, 3.19]                 |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |    |     |    |     |       |                   |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                         |    |     |   |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |       |                   |            |    |     |   |     |      |                    |           |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                     |     |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |                                      |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Price 1986  | 15   | 140                               | 4                             | 148         | 7.3%          | 3.96 [1.35, 11.66]                |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |    |     |    |     |       |                   |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                         |    |     |   |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |       |                   |            |    |     |   |     |      |                    |           |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                     |     |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |                                      |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Roos 2005   | 40   | 137                               | 33                            | 135         | 16.8%         | 1.19 [0.80, 1.77]                 |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |    |     |    |     |       |                   |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                         |    |     |   |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |       |                   |            |    |     |   |     |      |                    |           |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                     |     |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |                                      |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| van der Linden 2004   | 139  | 579                               | 35                            | 578         | 17.5%         | 3.96 [2.79, 5.64]                 |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |    |     |    |     |       |                   |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                         |    |     |   |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |       |                   |            |    |     |   |     |      |                    |           |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                     |     |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |                                      |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| <b>Total (95% CI)</b>   |  | <b>2002</b>                       |                               | <b>1991</b> | <b>100.0%</b> | <b>2.37 [1.65, 3.40]</b>          |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |    |     |    |     |       |                   |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                         |    |     |   |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |       |                   |            |    |     |   |     |      |                    |           |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                     |     |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |                                      |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Total events: 400 (単回照射), 160 (分割照射)  |  |                                   |                               |             |               |                                   |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |    |     |    |     |       |                   |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                         |    |     |   |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |       |                   |            |    |     |   |     |      |                    |           |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                     |     |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |                                      |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Heterogeneity: Tau <sup>2</sup> = 0.16; Chi <sup>2</sup> = 22.92, df = 6 (P = 0.0008); I <sup>2</sup> = 74% |  |                                   |                               |             |               |                                   |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |    |     |    |     |       |                   |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                         |    |     |   |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |       |                   |            |    |     |   |     |      |                    |           |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                     |     |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |                                      |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Test for overall effect: Z = 4.67 (P < 0.00001)   |  |                                   |                               |             |               |                                   |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |    |     |    |     |       |                   |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                         |    |     |   |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |       |                   |            |    |     |   |     |      |                    |           |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                     |     |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |                                      |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Funnel plot   | <p>コメント: 問題となるようなPublication Biasは指摘できない.</p>  |                                   |                               |             |               |                                   |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |    |     |    |     |       |                   |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                         |    |     |   |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |       |                   |            |    |     |   |     |      |                    |           |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                     |     |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |                                      |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| その他の解析  | 施行せず.  |                                   |                               | コメント:       |               |                                   |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |    |     |    |     |       |                   |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                         |    |     |   |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |       |                   |            |    |     |   |     |      |                    |           |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                     |     |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |                                      |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| メタリグレッション   |  |                                   |                               |             |               |                                   |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |    |     |    |     |       |                   |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                         |    |     |   |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |       |                   |            |    |     |   |     |      |                    |           |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                     |     |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |                                      |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 感度分析  |  |                                   |                               |             |               |                                   |                  |       |                  |       |        |                                   |            |    |     |    |     |       |                   |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                         |    |     |   |     |       |                   |              |    |     |    |     |       |                   |            |    |     |   |     |      |                    |           |    |     |    |     |       |                   |                     |     |     |    |     |       |                   |                       |  |             |  |             |               |                          |                                      |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |

【4-9 メタアナリシス】

| <b>CQ</b>  |  | 有痛性乳癌骨転移に対して8 Gy/1回照射を行うことは勧められるか |                              |            |               |                          |                                   |                                   |        |  |        |                                   |                                   |        |       |        |       |            |    |    |    |    |       |                   |  |           |    |     |    |    |       |                   |  |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |  |                       |  |            |  |            |               |                          |  |              |    |  |     |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|--|--|-----------------------------------|------------------------------|------------|---------------|--------------------------|-----------------------------------|-----------------------------------|--------|--|--------|-----------------------------------|-----------------------------------|--------|-------|--------|-------|------------|----|----|----|----|-------|-------------------|--|-----------|----|-----|----|----|-------|-------------------|--|---------------|----|-----|----|-----|-------|-------------------|--|-----------------------|--|------------|--|------------|---------------|--------------------------|--|--------------|----|--|-----|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|
| <b>P</b>   | 有痛性骨転移   | <b>I</b>                          | 8 Gy/1回照射                    |            |               |                          |                                   |                                   |        |  |        |                                   |                                   |        |       |        |       |            |    |    |    |    |       |                   |  |           |    |     |    |    |       |                   |  |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |  |                       |  |            |  |            |               |                          |  |              |    |  |     |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| <b>C</b>   | 20-30 Gyの分割照射  | <b>O</b>                          | 有害事象発生率                      |            |               |                          |                                   |                                   |        |  |        |                                   |                                   |        |       |        |       |            |    |    |    |    |       |                   |  |           |    |     |    |    |       |                   |  |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |  |                       |  |            |  |            |               |                          |  |              |    |  |     |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| <b>研究デザイン</b>  | RCT  | <b>文献数</b>                        | 3                            | <b>コード</b> |               |                          |                                   |                                   |        |  |        |                                   |                                   |        |       |        |       |            |    |    |    |    |       |                   |  |           |    |     |    |    |       |                   |  |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |  |                       |  |            |  |            |               |                          |  |              |    |  |     |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| <b>モデル</b>   | ランダム効果   | <b>方法</b>                         | Mantel-Haenszel              |            |               |                          |                                   |                                   |        |  |        |                                   |                                   |        |       |        |       |            |    |    |    |    |       |                   |  |           |    |     |    |    |       |                   |  |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |  |                       |  |            |  |            |               |                          |  |              |    |  |     |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| <b>効果指標</b>  | リスク比   | <b>統合値</b>                        | 0.73 ( 0.53 - 1.00 ) P= 0.05 |            |               |                          |                                   |                                   |        |  |        |                                   |                                   |        |       |        |       |            |    |    |    |    |       |                   |  |           |    |     |    |    |       |                   |  |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |  |                       |  |            |  |            |               |                          |  |              |    |  |     |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| <b>Forest plot</b>   | <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th rowspan="2">Study or Subgroup</th> <th colspan="2">[単回照射]</th> <th colspan="2">[分割照射]</th> <th rowspan="2">Weight</th> <th rowspan="2">Risk Ratio<br/>M-H, Random, 95% CI</th> <th rowspan="2">Risk Ratio<br/>M-H, Random, 95% CI</th> </tr> <tr> <th>Events</th> <th>Total</th> <th>Events</th> <th>Total</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>BPTWP 1999</td> <td>18</td> <td>61</td> <td>20</td> <td>63</td> <td>26.3%</td> <td>0.93 [0.55, 1.58]</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>Gaze 1997</td> <td>24</td> <td>110</td> <td>25</td> <td>98</td> <td>29.6%</td> <td>0.86 [0.52, 1.40]</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>Hartsell 2004</td> <td>42</td> <td>433</td> <td>70</td> <td>414</td> <td>44.2%</td> <td>0.57 [0.40, 0.82]</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td><b>Total (95% CI)</b></td> <td></td> <td><b>604</b></td> <td></td> <td><b>575</b></td> <td><b>100.0%</b></td> <td><b>0.73 [0.53, 1.00]</b></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>Total events</td> <td>84</td> <td></td> <td>115</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="8">Heterogeneity: Tau<sup>2</sup> = 0.03; Chi<sup>2</sup> = 2.94, df = 2 (P = 0.23); I<sup>2</sup> = 32%</td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="8">Test for overall effect: Z = 1.93 (P = 0.05)</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>コメント: 8 Gy/1回照射の方が有害事象が少なかったが, 有意差を認めたのは, 3 RCT中1 RCTのみ.</p> |                                   |                              |            |               | Study or Subgroup        | [単回照射]                            |                                   | [分割照射] |  | Weight | Risk Ratio<br>M-H, Random, 95% CI | Risk Ratio<br>M-H, Random, 95% CI | Events | Total | Events | Total | BPTWP 1999 | 18 | 61 | 20 | 63 | 26.3% | 0.93 [0.55, 1.58] |  | Gaze 1997 | 24 | 110 | 25 | 98 | 29.6% | 0.86 [0.52, 1.40] |  | Hartsell 2004 | 42 | 433 | 70 | 414 | 44.2% | 0.57 [0.40, 0.82] |  | <b>Total (95% CI)</b> |  | <b>604</b> |  | <b>575</b> | <b>100.0%</b> | <b>0.73 [0.53, 1.00]</b> |  | Total events | 84 |  | 115 |  |  |  |  | Heterogeneity: Tau <sup>2</sup> = 0.03; Chi <sup>2</sup> = 2.94, df = 2 (P = 0.23); I <sup>2</sup> = 32% |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | Test for overall effect: Z = 1.93 (P = 0.05) |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Study or Subgroup  | [単回照射]   |                                   | [分割照射]                       |            | Weight        |                          | Risk Ratio<br>M-H, Random, 95% CI | Risk Ratio<br>M-H, Random, 95% CI |        |  |        |                                   |                                   |        |       |        |       |            |    |    |    |    |       |                   |  |           |    |     |    |    |       |                   |  |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |  |                       |  |            |  |            |               |                          |  |              |    |  |     |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | Events   | Total                             | Events                       | Total      |               |                          |                                   |                                   |        |  |        |                                   |                                   |        |       |        |       |            |    |    |    |    |       |                   |  |           |    |     |    |    |       |                   |  |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |  |                       |  |            |  |            |               |                          |  |              |    |  |     |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| BPTWP 1999   | 18   | 61                                | 20                           | 63         | 26.3%         | 0.93 [0.55, 1.58]        |                                   |                                   |        |  |        |                                   |                                   |        |       |        |       |            |    |    |    |    |       |                   |  |           |    |     |    |    |       |                   |  |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |  |                       |  |            |  |            |               |                          |  |              |    |  |     |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Gaze 1997  | 24   | 110                               | 25                           | 98         | 29.6%         | 0.86 [0.52, 1.40]        |                                   |                                   |        |  |        |                                   |                                   |        |       |        |       |            |    |    |    |    |       |                   |  |           |    |     |    |    |       |                   |  |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |  |                       |  |            |  |            |               |                          |  |              |    |  |     |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Hartsell 2004  | 42   | 433                               | 70                           | 414        | 44.2%         | 0.57 [0.40, 0.82]        |                                   |                                   |        |  |        |                                   |                                   |        |       |        |       |            |    |    |    |    |       |                   |  |           |    |     |    |    |       |                   |  |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |  |                       |  |            |  |            |               |                          |  |              |    |  |     |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| <b>Total (95% CI)</b>  |  | <b>604</b>                        |                              | <b>575</b> | <b>100.0%</b> | <b>0.73 [0.53, 1.00]</b> |                                   |                                   |        |  |        |                                   |                                   |        |       |        |       |            |    |    |    |    |       |                   |  |           |    |     |    |    |       |                   |  |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |  |                       |  |            |  |            |               |                          |  |              |    |  |     |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Total events   | 84   |                                   | 115                          |            |               |                          |                                   |                                   |        |  |        |                                   |                                   |        |       |        |       |            |    |    |    |    |       |                   |  |           |    |     |    |    |       |                   |  |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |  |                       |  |            |  |            |               |                          |  |              |    |  |     |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Heterogeneity: Tau <sup>2</sup> = 0.03; Chi <sup>2</sup> = 2.94, df = 2 (P = 0.23); I <sup>2</sup> = 32% |  |                                   |                              |            |               |                          |                                   |                                   |        |  |        |                                   |                                   |        |       |        |       |            |    |    |    |    |       |                   |  |           |    |     |    |    |       |                   |  |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |  |                       |  |            |  |            |               |                          |  |              |    |  |     |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Test for overall effect: Z = 1.93 (P = 0.05)   |  |                                   |                              |            |               |                          |                                   |                                   |        |  |        |                                   |                                   |        |       |        |       |            |    |    |    |    |       |                   |  |           |    |     |    |    |       |                   |  |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |  |                       |  |            |  |            |               |                          |  |              |    |  |     |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| <b>Funnel plot</b>   | <p>コメント: 問題となるようなPublication Biasは指摘できない.</p>  |                                   |                              |            |               |                          |                                   |                                   |        |  |        |                                   |                                   |        |       |        |       |            |    |    |    |    |       |                   |  |           |    |     |    |    |       |                   |  |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |  |                       |  |            |  |            |               |                          |  |              |    |  |     |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| <b>その他の解析</b>  | 施行せず.  |                                   |                              | コメント:      |               |                          |                                   |                                   |        |  |        |                                   |                                   |        |       |        |       |            |    |    |    |    |       |                   |  |           |    |     |    |    |       |                   |  |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |  |                       |  |            |  |            |               |                          |  |              |    |  |     |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| メタリグレッション  |  |                                   |                              |            |               |                          |                                   |                                   |        |  |        |                                   |                                   |        |       |        |       |            |    |    |    |    |       |                   |  |           |    |     |    |    |       |                   |  |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |  |                       |  |            |  |            |               |                          |  |              |    |  |     |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 感度分析   |  |                                   |                              |            |               |                          |                                   |                                   |        |  |        |                                   |                                   |        |       |        |       |            |    |    |    |    |       |                   |  |           |    |     |    |    |       |                   |  |               |    |     |    |     |       |                   |  |                       |  |            |  |            |               |                          |  |              |    |  |     |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |