

【SR-10 メタアナリシス】

<p>研究デザイン</p> <p>コード</p> <p>モデル</p> <p>効果指標</p>	<p>乳がんに対する乳房部分切除術後の照射法として加速乳房部分照射 (APBI) は勧められるか？</p> <p>乳がんに対する乳房部分切除術後</p> <p>全乳房照射</p> <p>RCT</p> <p>Franceschini 2020(HYPAB)、Meattini 2020(Livi)、Orrechia 2021(ELIOT)、Strnad 2016(GEC-ESTRO)、Vaidya 2014(TARGIT-A)、Vaidya 2020(Delayed TARGIT)、Vicini 2019(NROG)、Whelan 2019(RAPID)、Rodriguez 2013</p> <p>ランダム効果モデル</p> <p>リスク比</p>	<p>I</p> <p>APBI</p> <p>O</p> <p>局所再発率の低下</p> <p>文献数</p> <p>方法</p> <p>Inverse-Variance法</p> <p>統合値</p> <p>1.81 (1.16 - 2.84) P= 0.009</p>																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																								
<p>フォレスト プロット</p>	<p>● サブ解析</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Study or Subgroup</th> <th>Events</th> <th>Total</th> <th>Events</th> <th>Total</th> <th>Weight</th> <th>Risk Ratio</th> <th>IV, Random, 95% CI</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Franceschini 2020(HYPAB)</td> <td>3</td> <td>82</td> <td>2</td> <td>90</td> <td>4.9%</td> <td>1.65</td> <td>[0.28, 9.61]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Meattini 2020(Livi)</td> <td>6</td> <td>260</td> <td>9</td> <td>260</td> <td>9.9%</td> <td>0.67</td> <td>[0.24, 1.95]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Orrechia 2021(ELIOT)</td> <td>70</td> <td>651</td> <td>16</td> <td>654</td> <td>15.9%</td> <td>4.40</td> <td>[2.50, 7.40]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Rodriguez 2013</td> <td>0</td> <td>51</td> <td>0</td> <td>51</td> <td></td> <td>Not estimable</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>Strnad 2016(GEC-ESTRO)</td> <td>9</td> <td>633</td> <td>5</td> <td>551</td> <td>9.3%</td> <td>1.57</td> <td>[0.53, 4.65]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Vaidya 2014(TARGIT-A)</td> <td>23</td> <td>1721</td> <td>11</td> <td>1730</td> <td>13.4%</td> <td>2.10</td> <td>[1.03, 4.30]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Vaidya 2020(Delayed TARGIT)</td> <td>23</td> <td>581</td> <td>6</td> <td>572</td> <td>11.3%</td> <td>3.77</td> <td>[1.55, 9.20]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Vicini 2019(NROG)</td> <td>90</td> <td>2099</td> <td>71</td> <td>2036</td> <td>18.7%</td> <td>1.24</td> <td>[0.91, 1.68]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Whelan 2019(RAPID)</td> <td>37</td> <td>1070</td> <td>28</td> <td>1065</td> <td>16.5%</td> <td>1.32</td> <td>[0.81, 2.13]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Total (95% CI)</td> <td></td> <td>7138</td> <td></td> <td>7009</td> <td>100.0%</td> <td>1.81</td> <td>[1.16, 2.84]</td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="2">Total events</td> <td>261</td> <td>148</td> <td colspan="4"></td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="2">Heterogeneity: Tau² = 0.25, Chi² = 24.12, df = 7 (P = 0.001), I² = 71%</td> <td colspan="6"></td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="2">Test for overall effect: Z = 2.61 (P = 0.009)</td> <td colspan="6"></td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>4.1.1 術中照射以外</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Study or Subgroup</th> <th>Events</th> <th>Total</th> <th>Events</th> <th>Total</th> <th>Weight</th> <th>Risk Ratio</th> <th>IV, Random, 95% CI</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Franceschini 2020(HYPAB)</td> <td>3</td> <td>82</td> <td>2</td> <td>90</td> <td>4.9%</td> <td>1.65</td> <td>[0.28, 9.61]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Meattini 2020(Livi)</td> <td>6</td> <td>260</td> <td>9</td> <td>260</td> <td>9.9%</td> <td>0.67</td> <td>[0.24, 1.95]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Rodriguez 2013</td> <td>0</td> <td>51</td> <td>0</td> <td>51</td> <td></td> <td>Not estimable</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>Strnad 2016(GEC-ESTRO)</td> <td>9</td> <td>633</td> <td>5</td> <td>551</td> <td>9.3%</td> <td>1.57</td> <td>[0.53, 4.65]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Vicini 2019(NROG)</td> <td>90</td> <td>2099</td> <td>71</td> <td>2036</td> <td>18.7%</td> <td>1.24</td> <td>[0.91, 1.68]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Whelan 2019(RAPID)</td> <td>37</td> <td>1070</td> <td>28</td> <td>1065</td> <td>16.5%</td> <td>1.32</td> <td>[0.81, 2.13]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Subtotal (95% CI)</td> <td></td> <td>4965</td> <td></td> <td>4053</td> <td>59.4%</td> <td>1.23</td> <td>[0.97, 1.57]</td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="2">Total events</td> <td>145</td> <td>115</td> <td colspan="4"></td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="2">Heterogeneity: Tau² = 0.00, Chi² = 1.76, df = 4 (P = 0.78), I² = 0%</td> <td colspan="6"></td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="2">Test for overall effect: Z = 1.70 (P = 0.09)</td> <td colspan="6"></td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>4.1.2 術中照射</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Study or Subgroup</th> <th>Events</th> <th>Total</th> <th>Events</th> <th>Total</th> <th>Weight</th> <th>Risk Ratio</th> <th>IV, Random, 95% CI</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Orrechia 2021(ELIOT)</td> <td>70</td> <td>651</td> <td>16</td> <td>654</td> <td>15.9%</td> <td>4.40</td> <td>[2.50, 7.40]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Vaidya 2014(TARGIT-A)</td> <td>23</td> <td>1721</td> <td>11</td> <td>1730</td> <td>13.4%</td> <td>2.10</td> <td>[1.03, 4.30]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Vaidya 2020(Delayed TARGIT)</td> <td>23</td> <td>581</td> <td>6</td> <td>572</td> <td>11.3%</td> <td>3.77</td> <td>[1.55, 9.20]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Subtotal (95% CI)</td> <td></td> <td>2953</td> <td></td> <td>2956</td> <td>40.6%</td> <td>3.38</td> <td>[2.14, 5.35]</td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="2">Total events</td> <td>116</td> <td>33</td> <td colspan="4"></td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="2">Heterogeneity: Tau² = 0.04, Chi² = 2.83, df = 2 (P = 0.28), I² = 25%</td> <td colspan="6"></td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="2">Test for overall effect: Z = 5.20 (P = 0.0001)</td> <td colspan="6"></td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="2">Test for subgroup differences: Chi² = 14.52, df = 1 (P = 0.0001), I² = 93.1%</td> <td colspan="6"></td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>● サブ解析</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Study or Subgroup</th> <th>Events</th> <th>Total</th> <th>Events</th> <th>Total</th> <th>Weight</th> <th>Risk Ratio</th> <th>IV, Random, 95% CI</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Franceschini 2020(HYPAB)</td> <td>3</td> <td>82</td> <td>2</td> <td>90</td> <td>4.9%</td> <td>1.65</td> <td>[0.28, 9.61]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Meattini 2020(Livi)</td> <td>6</td> <td>260</td> <td>9</td> <td>260</td> <td>9.9%</td> <td>0.67</td> <td>[0.24, 1.95]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Rodriguez 2013</td> <td>0</td> <td>51</td> <td>0</td> <td>51</td> <td></td> <td>Not estimable</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>Strnad 2016(GEC-ESTRO)</td> <td>9</td> <td>633</td> <td>5</td> <td>551</td> <td>9.3%</td> <td>1.57</td> <td>[0.53, 4.65]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Vicini 2019(NROG)</td> <td>90</td> <td>2099</td> <td>71</td> <td>2036</td> <td>18.7%</td> <td>1.24</td> <td>[0.91, 1.68]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Whelan 2019(RAPID)</td> <td>37</td> <td>1070</td> <td>28</td> <td>1065</td> <td>16.5%</td> <td>1.32</td> <td>[0.81, 2.13]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Subtotal (95% CI)</td> <td></td> <td>4965</td> <td></td> <td>4053</td> <td>59.4%</td> <td>1.23</td> <td>[0.97, 1.57]</td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="2">Total events</td> <td>145</td> <td>115</td> <td colspan="4"></td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="2">Heterogeneity: Tau² = 0.00, Chi² = 1.76, df = 4 (P = 0.78), I² = 0%</td> <td colspan="6"></td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="2">Test for overall effect: Z = 1.70 (P = 0.09)</td> <td colspan="6"></td> </tr> </tbody> </table>		Study or Subgroup	Events	Total	Events	Total	Weight	Risk Ratio	IV, Random, 95% CI	Franceschini 2020(HYPAB)	3	82	2	90	4.9%	1.65	[0.28, 9.61]	Meattini 2020(Livi)	6	260	9	260	9.9%	0.67	[0.24, 1.95]	Orrechia 2021(ELIOT)	70	651	16	654	15.9%	4.40	[2.50, 7.40]	Rodriguez 2013	0	51	0	51		Not estimable		Strnad 2016(GEC-ESTRO)	9	633	5	551	9.3%	1.57	[0.53, 4.65]	Vaidya 2014(TARGIT-A)	23	1721	11	1730	13.4%	2.10	[1.03, 4.30]	Vaidya 2020(Delayed TARGIT)	23	581	6	572	11.3%	3.77	[1.55, 9.20]	Vicini 2019(NROG)	90	2099	71	2036	18.7%	1.24	[0.91, 1.68]	Whelan 2019(RAPID)	37	1070	28	1065	16.5%	1.32	[0.81, 2.13]	Total (95% CI)		7138		7009	100.0%	1.81	[1.16, 2.84]	Total events		261	148					Heterogeneity: Tau ² = 0.25, Chi ² = 24.12, df = 7 (P = 0.001), I ² = 71%								Test for overall effect: Z = 2.61 (P = 0.009)								Study or Subgroup	Events	Total	Events	Total	Weight	Risk Ratio	IV, Random, 95% CI	Franceschini 2020(HYPAB)	3	82	2	90	4.9%	1.65	[0.28, 9.61]	Meattini 2020(Livi)	6	260	9	260	9.9%	0.67	[0.24, 1.95]	Rodriguez 2013	0	51	0	51		Not estimable		Strnad 2016(GEC-ESTRO)	9	633	5	551	9.3%	1.57	[0.53, 4.65]	Vicini 2019(NROG)	90	2099	71	2036	18.7%	1.24	[0.91, 1.68]	Whelan 2019(RAPID)	37	1070	28	1065	16.5%	1.32	[0.81, 2.13]	Subtotal (95% CI)		4965		4053	59.4%	1.23	[0.97, 1.57]	Total events		145	115					Heterogeneity: Tau ² = 0.00, Chi ² = 1.76, df = 4 (P = 0.78), I ² = 0%								Test for overall effect: Z = 1.70 (P = 0.09)								Study or Subgroup	Events	Total	Events	Total	Weight	Risk Ratio	IV, Random, 95% CI	Orrechia 2021(ELIOT)	70	651	16	654	15.9%	4.40	[2.50, 7.40]	Vaidya 2014(TARGIT-A)	23	1721	11	1730	13.4%	2.10	[1.03, 4.30]	Vaidya 2020(Delayed TARGIT)	23	581	6	572	11.3%	3.77	[1.55, 9.20]	Subtotal (95% CI)		2953		2956	40.6%	3.38	[2.14, 5.35]	Total events		116	33					Heterogeneity: Tau ² = 0.04, Chi ² = 2.83, df = 2 (P = 0.28), I ² = 25%								Test for overall effect: Z = 5.20 (P = 0.0001)								Test for subgroup differences: Chi ² = 14.52, df = 1 (P = 0.0001), I ² = 93.1%								Study or Subgroup	Events	Total	Events	Total	Weight	Risk Ratio	IV, Random, 95% CI	Franceschini 2020(HYPAB)	3	82	2	90	4.9%	1.65	[0.28, 9.61]	Meattini 2020(Livi)	6	260	9	260	9.9%	0.67	[0.24, 1.95]	Rodriguez 2013	0	51	0	51		Not estimable		Strnad 2016(GEC-ESTRO)	9	633	5	551	9.3%	1.57	[0.53, 4.65]	Vicini 2019(NROG)	90	2099	71	2036	18.7%	1.24	[0.91, 1.68]	Whelan 2019(RAPID)	37	1070	28	1065	16.5%	1.32	[0.81, 2.13]	Subtotal (95% CI)		4965		4053	59.4%	1.23	[0.97, 1.57]	Total events		145	115					Heterogeneity: Tau ² = 0.00, Chi ² = 1.76, df = 4 (P = 0.78), I ² = 0%								Test for overall effect: Z = 1.70 (P = 0.09)							
Study or Subgroup	Events	Total	Events	Total	Weight	Risk Ratio	IV, Random, 95% CI																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																			
Franceschini 2020(HYPAB)	3	82	2	90	4.9%	1.65	[0.28, 9.61]																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																			
Meattini 2020(Livi)	6	260	9	260	9.9%	0.67	[0.24, 1.95]																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																			
Orrechia 2021(ELIOT)	70	651	16	654	15.9%	4.40	[2.50, 7.40]																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																			
Rodriguez 2013	0	51	0	51		Not estimable																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																				
Strnad 2016(GEC-ESTRO)	9	633	5	551	9.3%	1.57	[0.53, 4.65]																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																			
Vaidya 2014(TARGIT-A)	23	1721	11	1730	13.4%	2.10	[1.03, 4.30]																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																			
Vaidya 2020(Delayed TARGIT)	23	581	6	572	11.3%	3.77	[1.55, 9.20]																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																			
Vicini 2019(NROG)	90	2099	71	2036	18.7%	1.24	[0.91, 1.68]																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																			
Whelan 2019(RAPID)	37	1070	28	1065	16.5%	1.32	[0.81, 2.13]																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																			
Total (95% CI)		7138		7009	100.0%	1.81	[1.16, 2.84]																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																			
Total events		261	148																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																							
Heterogeneity: Tau ² = 0.25, Chi ² = 24.12, df = 7 (P = 0.001), I ² = 71%																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																										
Test for overall effect: Z = 2.61 (P = 0.009)																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																										
Study or Subgroup	Events	Total	Events	Total	Weight	Risk Ratio	IV, Random, 95% CI																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																			
Franceschini 2020(HYPAB)	3	82	2	90	4.9%	1.65	[0.28, 9.61]																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																			
Meattini 2020(Livi)	6	260	9	260	9.9%	0.67	[0.24, 1.95]																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																			
Rodriguez 2013	0	51	0	51		Not estimable																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																				
Strnad 2016(GEC-ESTRO)	9	633	5	551	9.3%	1.57	[0.53, 4.65]																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																			
Vicini 2019(NROG)	90	2099	71	2036	18.7%	1.24	[0.91, 1.68]																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																			
Whelan 2019(RAPID)	37	1070	28	1065	16.5%	1.32	[0.81, 2.13]																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																			
Subtotal (95% CI)		4965		4053	59.4%	1.23	[0.97, 1.57]																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																			
Total events		145	115																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																							
Heterogeneity: Tau ² = 0.00, Chi ² = 1.76, df = 4 (P = 0.78), I ² = 0%																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																										
Test for overall effect: Z = 1.70 (P = 0.09)																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																										
Study or Subgroup	Events	Total	Events	Total	Weight	Risk Ratio	IV, Random, 95% CI																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																			
Orrechia 2021(ELIOT)	70	651	16	654	15.9%	4.40	[2.50, 7.40]																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																			
Vaidya 2014(TARGIT-A)	23	1721	11	1730	13.4%	2.10	[1.03, 4.30]																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																			
Vaidya 2020(Delayed TARGIT)	23	581	6	572	11.3%	3.77	[1.55, 9.20]																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																			
Subtotal (95% CI)		2953		2956	40.6%	3.38	[2.14, 5.35]																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																			
Total events		116	33																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																							
Heterogeneity: Tau ² = 0.04, Chi ² = 2.83, df = 2 (P = 0.28), I ² = 25%																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																										
Test for overall effect: Z = 5.20 (P = 0.0001)																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																										
Test for subgroup differences: Chi ² = 14.52, df = 1 (P = 0.0001), I ² = 93.1%																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																										
Study or Subgroup	Events	Total	Events	Total	Weight	Risk Ratio	IV, Random, 95% CI																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																			
Franceschini 2020(HYPAB)	3	82	2	90	4.9%	1.65	[0.28, 9.61]																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																			
Meattini 2020(Livi)	6	260	9	260	9.9%	0.67	[0.24, 1.95]																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																			
Rodriguez 2013	0	51	0	51		Not estimable																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																				
Strnad 2016(GEC-ESTRO)	9	633	5	551	9.3%	1.57	[0.53, 4.65]																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																			
Vicini 2019(NROG)	90	2099	71	2036	18.7%	1.24	[0.91, 1.68]																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																			
Whelan 2019(RAPID)	37	1070	28	1065	16.5%	1.32	[0.81, 2.13]																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																			
Subtotal (95% CI)		4965		4053	59.4%	1.23	[0.97, 1.57]																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																			
Total events		145	115																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																							
Heterogeneity: Tau ² = 0.00, Chi ² = 1.76, df = 4 (P = 0.78), I ² = 0%																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																										
Test for overall effect: Z = 1.70 (P = 0.09)																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																										
<p>ファンネル プロット</p>	<p>○ 術中照射以外 ◆ 術中照射</p>																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																									
<p>その他の解析</p> <p>メタリグ レッション</p> <p>感度分析</p>	<p>コメント： 術中照射、小線源治療、外照射すべてを合わせると有意に全乳房照射のほうがよいという結果であった。しかし、術中照射を除いたサブ解析では、有意差は認めなかった。</p> <p>コメント： 出版バイアスはややあり (-1) とした。</p> <p>コメント：</p>																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																																									

【SR-10 メタアナリシス】

CQ		乳房部分切除術後の照射法として加速乳房部分照射（APBI）は勧められるか？																																																																																																	
P	乳がんに対する乳房部分切除術後	I	APBI																																																																																																
C	全乳房照射	O	整容性の低下																																																																																																
研究デザイン	RCT	文献数	6																																																																																																
コード	Franceschini 2020(HYPAB)、Meattini 2020(Livi)、Whelan 2019(RAPID)、Polgar 2017(GEC-ESTRO)、Vaidya 2014(TARGIT-A)、Rodriguez 2013																																																																																																		
モデル	ランダム効果モデル	方法	Inverse-Variance法																																																																																																
効果指標	リスク比	統合値	1.21 (0.73 - 1.99) P= 0.46																																																																																																
フォレスト プロット	<table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th rowspan="2">Study or Subgroup</th> <th colspan="2">APBI</th> <th colspan="2">WBRT</th> <th rowspan="2">Weight</th> <th colspan="2">Risk Ratio</th> </tr> <tr> <th>Events</th> <th>Total</th> <th>Events</th> <th>Total</th> <th>IV, Random, 95% CI</th> <th>IV, Random, 95% CI</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Franceschini 2020(HYPAB)</td> <td>11</td> <td>82</td> <td>8</td> <td>90</td> <td>14.9%</td> <td>1.51 [0.64, 3.57]</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>Meattini 2020(Livi)</td> <td>0</td> <td>246</td> <td>5</td> <td>260</td> <td>2.7%</td> <td>0.10 [0.01, 1.73]</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>Polgar 2017(GEC-ESTRO)</td> <td>50</td> <td>633</td> <td>49</td> <td>551</td> <td>23.2%</td> <td>0.89 [0.61, 1.30]</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>Rodriguez 2013</td> <td>12</td> <td>51</td> <td>8</td> <td>51</td> <td>15.7%</td> <td>1.50 [0.67, 3.36]</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>Vaidya 2014(TARGIT-A)</td> <td>12</td> <td>55</td> <td>13</td> <td>50</td> <td>17.8%</td> <td>0.84 [0.42, 1.66]</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>Whelan 2019(RAPID)</td> <td>282</td> <td>873</td> <td>131</td> <td>829</td> <td>25.8%</td> <td>2.04 [1.70, 2.46]</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>Total (95% CI)</td> <td></td> <td>1940</td> <td></td> <td>1831</td> <td>100.0%</td> <td>1.21 [0.73, 1.99]</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>Total events</td> <td colspan="2">367</td> <td colspan="2">214</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="8">Heterogeneity: Tau² = 0.24; Chi² = 23.12, df = 5 (P = 0.0003); I² = 78%</td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="8">Test for overall effect: Z = 0.74 (P = 0.46)</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>コメント：Modalityによって、また同じ外照射であっても分割回数、照射方法によって結果は異なる。MeattiniらによるIMRTを用いた試験ではAPBIが良好である。整容性に関する有意差なしという結果だが、一貫性に乏しい。</p>					Study or Subgroup	APBI		WBRT		Weight	Risk Ratio		Events	Total	Events	Total	IV, Random, 95% CI	IV, Random, 95% CI	Franceschini 2020(HYPAB)	11	82	8	90	14.9%	1.51 [0.64, 3.57]		Meattini 2020(Livi)	0	246	5	260	2.7%	0.10 [0.01, 1.73]		Polgar 2017(GEC-ESTRO)	50	633	49	551	23.2%	0.89 [0.61, 1.30]		Rodriguez 2013	12	51	8	51	15.7%	1.50 [0.67, 3.36]		Vaidya 2014(TARGIT-A)	12	55	13	50	17.8%	0.84 [0.42, 1.66]		Whelan 2019(RAPID)	282	873	131	829	25.8%	2.04 [1.70, 2.46]		Total (95% CI)		1940		1831	100.0%	1.21 [0.73, 1.99]		Total events	367		214					Heterogeneity: Tau ² = 0.24; Chi ² = 23.12, df = 5 (P = 0.0003); I ² = 78%								Test for overall effect: Z = 0.74 (P = 0.46)							
Study or Subgroup	APBI		WBRT		Weight		Risk Ratio																																																																																												
	Events	Total	Events	Total		IV, Random, 95% CI	IV, Random, 95% CI																																																																																												
Franceschini 2020(HYPAB)	11	82	8	90	14.9%	1.51 [0.64, 3.57]																																																																																													
Meattini 2020(Livi)	0	246	5	260	2.7%	0.10 [0.01, 1.73]																																																																																													
Polgar 2017(GEC-ESTRO)	50	633	49	551	23.2%	0.89 [0.61, 1.30]																																																																																													
Rodriguez 2013	12	51	8	51	15.7%	1.50 [0.67, 3.36]																																																																																													
Vaidya 2014(TARGIT-A)	12	55	13	50	17.8%	0.84 [0.42, 1.66]																																																																																													
Whelan 2019(RAPID)	282	873	131	829	25.8%	2.04 [1.70, 2.46]																																																																																													
Total (95% CI)		1940		1831	100.0%	1.21 [0.73, 1.99]																																																																																													
Total events	367		214																																																																																																
Heterogeneity: Tau ² = 0.24; Chi ² = 23.12, df = 5 (P = 0.0003); I ² = 78%																																																																																																			
Test for overall effect: Z = 0.74 (P = 0.46)																																																																																																			
ファンネル プロット	<p>コメント：出版バイアスはややあり (-1) とした。</p>																																																																																																		
その他の解析					コメント：																																																																																														
メタリグ レッション																																																																																																			
感度分析																																																																																																			

【SR-10 メタアナリシス】

CQ		乳房部分切除術後の照射法として加速乳房部分照射（APBI）は勧められるか？																																																																																									
P	乳がんに対する乳房部分切除術後	I	APBI																																																																																								
C	全乳房照射	O	晩期障害（皮膚障害）																																																																																								
研究デザイン	RCT	文献数	4																																																																																								
コード	Franceschini 2020(HYPAB)、Meattini 2020(Livi)、Strnad 2016(GEC-ESTRO)、Whelan 2019(RAPID)、Rodriguez 2013																																																																																										
モデル	ランダム効果モデル	方法	Inverse-Variance法																																																																																								
効果指標	リスク比	統合値	1.58 (0.33-7.52) P=0.56																																																																																								
フォレスト プロット	<table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th rowspan="2">Study or Subgroup</th> <th colspan="2">APBI</th> <th colspan="2">WBRT</th> <th rowspan="2">Weight</th> <th colspan="2">Risk Ratio</th> </tr> <tr> <th>Events</th> <th>Total</th> <th>Events</th> <th>Total</th> <th>IV, Random, 95% CI</th> <th>Risk Ratio</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Franceschini 2020(HYPAB)</td> <td>4</td> <td>82</td> <td>1</td> <td>90</td> <td>20.3%</td> <td>4.39</td> <td>[0.50, 38.48]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Meattini 2020(Livi)</td> <td>0</td> <td>246</td> <td>2</td> <td>260</td> <td>14.8%</td> <td>0.21</td> <td>[0.01, 4.38]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Rodriguez 2013</td> <td>0</td> <td>51</td> <td>0</td> <td>51</td> <td></td> <td>Not estimable</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>Strnad 2016(GEC-ESTRO)</td> <td>19</td> <td>484</td> <td>24</td> <td>393</td> <td>31.9%</td> <td>0.64</td> <td>[0.36, 1.16]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Whelan 2019(RAPID)</td> <td>245</td> <td>1070</td> <td>49</td> <td>1065</td> <td>33.0%</td> <td>4.98</td> <td>[3.71, 6.68]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Total (95% CI)</td> <td></td> <td>1933</td> <td></td> <td>1859</td> <td>100.0%</td> <td>1.58</td> <td>[0.33, 7.52]</td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="2">Total events</td> <td>268</td> <td colspan="2"></td> <td>76</td> <td colspan="2"></td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="8">Heterogeneity: Tau² = 1.89; Chi² = 40.50, df = 3 (P < 0.00001); I² = 93%</td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="8">Test for overall effect: Z = 0.58 (P = 0.56)</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>					Study or Subgroup	APBI		WBRT		Weight	Risk Ratio		Events	Total	Events	Total	IV, Random, 95% CI	Risk Ratio	Franceschini 2020(HYPAB)	4	82	1	90	20.3%	4.39	[0.50, 38.48]	Meattini 2020(Livi)	0	246	2	260	14.8%	0.21	[0.01, 4.38]	Rodriguez 2013	0	51	0	51		Not estimable		Strnad 2016(GEC-ESTRO)	19	484	24	393	31.9%	0.64	[0.36, 1.16]	Whelan 2019(RAPID)	245	1070	49	1065	33.0%	4.98	[3.71, 6.68]	Total (95% CI)		1933		1859	100.0%	1.58	[0.33, 7.52]	Total events		268			76			Heterogeneity: Tau ² = 1.89; Chi ² = 40.50, df = 3 (P < 0.00001); I ² = 93%								Test for overall effect: Z = 0.58 (P = 0.56)							
	Study or Subgroup	APBI		WBRT			Weight	Risk Ratio																																																																																			
Events		Total	Events	Total	IV, Random, 95% CI	Risk Ratio																																																																																					
Franceschini 2020(HYPAB)	4	82	1	90	20.3%	4.39	[0.50, 38.48]																																																																																				
Meattini 2020(Livi)	0	246	2	260	14.8%	0.21	[0.01, 4.38]																																																																																				
Rodriguez 2013	0	51	0	51		Not estimable																																																																																					
Strnad 2016(GEC-ESTRO)	19	484	24	393	31.9%	0.64	[0.36, 1.16]																																																																																				
Whelan 2019(RAPID)	245	1070	49	1065	33.0%	4.98	[3.71, 6.68]																																																																																				
Total (95% CI)		1933		1859	100.0%	1.58	[0.33, 7.52]																																																																																				
Total events		268			76																																																																																						
Heterogeneity: Tau ² = 1.89; Chi ² = 40.50, df = 3 (P < 0.00001); I ² = 93%																																																																																											
Test for overall effect: Z = 0.58 (P = 0.56)																																																																																											
コメント：晩期皮膚障害については有意差はなかった。																																																																																											
ファンネル プロット																																																																																											
	コメント：出版バイアスはややあり (-1) とした。																																																																																										
その他の解析					コメント：																																																																																						
メタリグ レッション																																																																																											
感度分析																																																																																											

【SR-10 メタアナリシス】

CQ		乳房部分切除術後の照射法として加速乳房部分照射（APBI）は勧められるか？																																																									
P	乳がんに対する乳房部分切除術後	I	APBI																																																								
C	全乳房照射	O	晩期障害（脂肪壊死）																																																								
研究デザイン	RCT	文献数	3																																																								
コード	Polgar 2017(GEC-ESTRO)、Veronesi 2013(ELIOT)、Whelan 2019(RAPID)																																																										
モデル	ランダム効果モデル	方法	Inverse-Variance法																																																								
効果指標	リスク比	統合値	2.80 (1.16- 6.78) P= 0.02																																																								
フォレスト プロット	<table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Study or Subgroup</th> <th>APBI Events</th> <th>APBI Total</th> <th>WBRT Events</th> <th>WBRT Total</th> <th>Weight</th> <th>Risk Ratio IV, Random, 95% CI</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Polgar 2017(GEC-ESTRO)</td> <td>7</td> <td>484</td> <td>4</td> <td>393</td> <td>27.1%</td> <td>1.42 [0.42, 4.82]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Veronesi 2013(ELIOT)</td> <td>22</td> <td>151</td> <td>10</td> <td>146</td> <td>41.3%</td> <td>2.13 [1.04, 4.34]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Whelan 2019(RAPID)</td> <td>29</td> <td>1070</td> <td>4</td> <td>1065</td> <td>31.6%</td> <td>7.22 [2.55, 20.46]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Total (95% CI)</td> <td></td> <td>1705</td> <td></td> <td>1604</td> <td>100.0%</td> <td>2.80 [1.16, 6.78]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Total events</td> <td>58</td> <td></td> <td>18</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="7">Heterogeneity: Tau² = 0.36; Chi² = 4.91, df = 2 (P = 0.09); I² = 59%</td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="7">Test for overall effect: Z = 2.29 (P = 0.02)</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>コメント：全乳房照射のほうがわずかに良好であった。</p>			Study or Subgroup	APBI Events	APBI Total	WBRT Events	WBRT Total	Weight	Risk Ratio IV, Random, 95% CI	Polgar 2017(GEC-ESTRO)	7	484	4	393	27.1%	1.42 [0.42, 4.82]	Veronesi 2013(ELIOT)	22	151	10	146	41.3%	2.13 [1.04, 4.34]	Whelan 2019(RAPID)	29	1070	4	1065	31.6%	7.22 [2.55, 20.46]	Total (95% CI)		1705		1604	100.0%	2.80 [1.16, 6.78]	Total events	58		18				Heterogeneity: Tau ² = 0.36; Chi ² = 4.91, df = 2 (P = 0.09); I ² = 59%							Test for overall effect: Z = 2.29 (P = 0.02)						
Study or Subgroup	APBI Events	APBI Total	WBRT Events	WBRT Total	Weight	Risk Ratio IV, Random, 95% CI																																																					
Polgar 2017(GEC-ESTRO)	7	484	4	393	27.1%	1.42 [0.42, 4.82]																																																					
Veronesi 2013(ELIOT)	22	151	10	146	41.3%	2.13 [1.04, 4.34]																																																					
Whelan 2019(RAPID)	29	1070	4	1065	31.6%	7.22 [2.55, 20.46]																																																					
Total (95% CI)		1705		1604	100.0%	2.80 [1.16, 6.78]																																																					
Total events	58		18																																																								
Heterogeneity: Tau ² = 0.36; Chi ² = 4.91, df = 2 (P = 0.09); I ² = 59%																																																											
Test for overall effect: Z = 2.29 (P = 0.02)																																																											
ファンネル プロット	<p>コメント：出版バイアスはややあり (-1) とした</p>																																																										
その他の解析			コメント：																																																								
メタリグ レッション																																																											
感度分析																																																											

【SR-10 メタアナリシス】

CQ		乳房部分切除術後の照射法として加速乳房部分照射（APBI）は勧められるか？																															
P	乳がんに対する乳房部分切除術後	I	APBI																														
C	全乳房照射	O	遠隔再発率の低下																														
研究デザイン	RCT	文献数	4																														
コード	Meattini 2020(Livi)、Orrechia 2021(ELIOT)、Strnad 2016(GEC-ESTRO)、Vaidya 2020(Delayed TARGIT)																																
モデル	ランダム効果モデル	方法	Inverse-Variance法																														
効果指標	ハザード比	統合値	0.94 (0.74- 1.20) P= 0.63																														
フォレスト プロット	<table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Study or Subgroup</th> <th>log[Hazard Ratio]</th> <th>SE</th> <th>Weight</th> <th>Hazard Ratio IV, Random, 95% CI</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Meattini 2020(Livi)</td> <td>-0.1165</td> <td>0.5219</td> <td>5.6%</td> <td>0.89 [0.32, 2.48]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Orrechia 2021(ELIOT)</td> <td>-0.1278</td> <td>0.204</td> <td>36.5%</td> <td>0.88 [0.59, 1.31]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Strnad 2016(GEC-ESTRO)</td> <td>-0.1508</td> <td>0.6304</td> <td>3.8%</td> <td>0.86 [0.25, 2.96]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Vaidya 2020(Delayed TARGIT)</td> <td>0</td> <td>0.1676</td> <td>54.1%</td> <td>1.00 [0.72, 1.39]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Total (95% CI)</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>100.0%</td> <td>0.94 [0.74, 1.20]</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>Heterogeneity: Tau² = 0.00; Chi² = 0.27, df = 3 (P = 0.97); I² = 0% Test for overall effect: Z = 0.48 (P = 0.63)</p>			Study or Subgroup	log[Hazard Ratio]	SE	Weight	Hazard Ratio IV, Random, 95% CI	Meattini 2020(Livi)	-0.1165	0.5219	5.6%	0.89 [0.32, 2.48]	Orrechia 2021(ELIOT)	-0.1278	0.204	36.5%	0.88 [0.59, 1.31]	Strnad 2016(GEC-ESTRO)	-0.1508	0.6304	3.8%	0.86 [0.25, 2.96]	Vaidya 2020(Delayed TARGIT)	0	0.1676	54.1%	1.00 [0.72, 1.39]	Total (95% CI)			100.0%	0.94 [0.74, 1.20]
	Study or Subgroup	log[Hazard Ratio]	SE	Weight	Hazard Ratio IV, Random, 95% CI																												
Meattini 2020(Livi)	-0.1165	0.5219	5.6%	0.89 [0.32, 2.48]																													
Orrechia 2021(ELIOT)	-0.1278	0.204	36.5%	0.88 [0.59, 1.31]																													
Strnad 2016(GEC-ESTRO)	-0.1508	0.6304	3.8%	0.86 [0.25, 2.96]																													
Vaidya 2020(Delayed TARGIT)	0	0.1676	54.1%	1.00 [0.72, 1.39]																													
Total (95% CI)			100.0%	0.94 [0.74, 1.20]																													
コメント：遠隔再発率については有意差はなかった。																																	
ファンネル プロット																																	
	コメント：出版バイアスはなしとした。																																
その他の解析		コメント：																															
メタリグ レッション																																	
感度分析																																	

【SR-10 メタアナリシス】

CQ		乳房部分切除術後の照射法として加速乳房部分照射（APBI）は勧められるか？																																																		
P	乳がんに対する乳房部分切除術後	I	APBI																																																	
C	全乳房照射	O	全生存率の改善																																																	
研究デザイン	RCT	文献数	7																																																	
コード	Meattini 2020(Livi)、Orrechia 2021(ELIOT)、Strnad 2016(GEC-ESTRO)、Vaidya 2014(TARGIT-A)、Vaidya 2020(Delayed TARGIT)、Vicini 2019(NROG)、Whelan 2019(RAPID)																																																			
モデル	ランダム効果モデル	方法	Inverse-Variance法																																																	
効果指標	ハザード比	統合値	1.00 (0.87- 1.14) P= 0.98																																																	
フォレスト プロット	<table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Study or Subgroup</th> <th>log[Hazard Ratio]</th> <th>SE</th> <th>Weight</th> <th>Hazard Ratio IV, Random, 95% CI</th> <th>Hazard Ratio IV, Random, 95% CI</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Meattini 2020(Livi)</td> <td>-0.0513</td> <td>0.3275</td> <td>4.2%</td> <td>0.95 [0.50, 1.81]</td> <td rowspan="7"> </td> </tr> <tr> <td>Orrechia 2021(ELIOT)</td> <td>0.0296</td> <td>0.1484</td> <td>18.5%</td> <td>1.03 [0.77, 1.38]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Strnad 2016(GEC-ESTRO)</td> <td>-0.4155</td> <td>0.2684</td> <td>6.1%</td> <td>0.66 [0.39, 1.12]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Vaidya 2014(TARGIT-A)</td> <td>-0.3285</td> <td>0.2176</td> <td>9.2%</td> <td>0.72 [0.47, 1.10]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Vaidya 2020(Delayed TARGIT)</td> <td>-0.0408</td> <td>0.1759</td> <td>13.6%</td> <td>0.96 [0.68, 1.36]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Vicini 2019(NROG)</td> <td>0.0953</td> <td>0.1024</td> <td>34.4%</td> <td>1.10 [0.90, 1.34]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Whelan 2019(RAPID)</td> <td>0.1655</td> <td>0.1734</td> <td>14.0%</td> <td>1.18 [0.84, 1.66]</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Total (95% CI)</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>100.0%</td> <td>1.00 [0.87, 1.14]</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>Heterogeneity: Tau² = 0.00; Chi² = 6.56, df = 6 (P = 0.36); I² = 9% Test for overall effect: Z = 0.03 (P = 0.98)</p>					Study or Subgroup	log[Hazard Ratio]	SE	Weight	Hazard Ratio IV, Random, 95% CI	Hazard Ratio IV, Random, 95% CI	Meattini 2020(Livi)	-0.0513	0.3275	4.2%	0.95 [0.50, 1.81]		Orrechia 2021(ELIOT)	0.0296	0.1484	18.5%	1.03 [0.77, 1.38]	Strnad 2016(GEC-ESTRO)	-0.4155	0.2684	6.1%	0.66 [0.39, 1.12]	Vaidya 2014(TARGIT-A)	-0.3285	0.2176	9.2%	0.72 [0.47, 1.10]	Vaidya 2020(Delayed TARGIT)	-0.0408	0.1759	13.6%	0.96 [0.68, 1.36]	Vicini 2019(NROG)	0.0953	0.1024	34.4%	1.10 [0.90, 1.34]	Whelan 2019(RAPID)	0.1655	0.1734	14.0%	1.18 [0.84, 1.66]	Total (95% CI)			100.0%	1.00 [0.87, 1.14]
Study or Subgroup	log[Hazard Ratio]	SE	Weight	Hazard Ratio IV, Random, 95% CI	Hazard Ratio IV, Random, 95% CI																																															
Meattini 2020(Livi)	-0.0513	0.3275	4.2%	0.95 [0.50, 1.81]																																																
Orrechia 2021(ELIOT)	0.0296	0.1484	18.5%	1.03 [0.77, 1.38]																																																
Strnad 2016(GEC-ESTRO)	-0.4155	0.2684	6.1%	0.66 [0.39, 1.12]																																																
Vaidya 2014(TARGIT-A)	-0.3285	0.2176	9.2%	0.72 [0.47, 1.10]																																																
Vaidya 2020(Delayed TARGIT)	-0.0408	0.1759	13.6%	0.96 [0.68, 1.36]																																																
Vicini 2019(NROG)	0.0953	0.1024	34.4%	1.10 [0.90, 1.34]																																																
Whelan 2019(RAPID)	0.1655	0.1734	14.0%	1.18 [0.84, 1.66]																																																
Total (95% CI)			100.0%	1.00 [0.87, 1.14]																																																
コメント：全生存率は有意差は認めなかった。																																																				
ファンネル プロット																																																				
コメント：出版バイアスはなしとした。																																																				
その他の解析					コメント：																																															
メタリグ レクション																																																				
感度分析																																																				